

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF FLORIDA, ORLANDO DIVISION**

IN RE: AUTO BODY SHOP  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

MDL Case No: 6:14-md-2557-Orl-31TBS

---

**DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' "EMERGENCY MOTION"  
FOR ISSUANCE OF SUBPOENA *DUCES TECUM* TO NONPARTIES**

Plaintiffs filed this same motion, unsuccessfully seeking this same nonparty document production, a year ago. (*See* Plaintiffs' prior motion, Doc. 160.) Defendants opposed that original motion, arguing among other things that discovery had been stayed and that Plaintiffs' basis for the motion was without factual support. (*See* Defendants' response to Plaintiffs' prior motion, Doc. 169.) This Court denied Plaintiffs' motion on April 2, 2015, finding that discovery was stayed and that Plaintiffs "failed to show good cause for lifting the stay and permitting them to engage in the requested discovery." (4/2/15 Order at 3, Doc. 174.) Discovery remains stayed in this litigation and, since the Court's April 2, 2015 Order, various of Plaintiffs' complaints have been dismissed many more times – some with prejudice. As a year ago, no complaint has yet survived a motion dismiss.

This Court should deny the current "emergency motion." To begin with, there is no emergency. The premise of Plaintiffs' instant motion could have been raised long before now. And the bases for denial of Plaintiffs' current "emergency motion" are the same as those expressed by Defendants a year ago, and by the Court in its 4/2/15 Order. Indeed, the bases for denial are even stronger, because Plaintiffs have continued to fail to proffer a

complaint that can survive a motion to dismiss. And the subpoenas themselves were premised on conclusory, unsubstantiated allegations about possible violations of the Telephone Consumer Protection Act of 1991, 47 U.S.C. § 227, that this Court found to be “speculation” and without “evidence that Defendants were behind the telephone calls.” (4/2/15 Order at 3.) Thus, Plaintiffs’ current “emergency motion” should be denied for the same reasons.

Plaintiffs unsuccessfully attempt to fashion an entirely new basis for issuing these subpoenas by alleging “on information and belief” that GoDaddy.com and Google are about to destroy documents subject to the requested subpoenas, and are not “under any legal compulsion to comply with a document retention request.” Plfs. Mot. at 2-3. Plaintiffs further allege that neither GoDaddy.com nor Google “can or will undertake to confirm they will comply” with such a document retention request. *Id.* at 3. These allegations are offered without either factual or legal support. Plaintiffs offer no showing that documents are about to be destroyed, that GoDaddy.com or Google have document retention policies that could result in the destruction of documents by February 20, 2016, that GoDaddy.com or Google has been contacted about the documents, or that either has refused to retain the documents. To the extent Plaintiffs actually had a substantiated concern about preservation, however, the opening of discovery to allow production under their purported subpoenas *duces tecum* is not an appropriate remedy – and Plaintiffs surely have offered no rationale to conclude otherwise. That is particularly true where the documents sought by these subpoenas are, at best, entirely collateral to the rejected price-fixing allegations in this litigation and do not satisfy Rule

26(b)'s standard that production be "relevant to" Plaintiffs' claims "and proportional to the needs of the case ...." FED. R. CIV. P. 26(b).

For all of the foregoing reasons, Defendants respectfully request that Plaintiffs' restyled "emergency motion" for leave to issue subpoenas to Google and GoDaddy.com be denied.

Dated: February 3, 2016

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Johanna W. Clark

Johanna W. Clark  
CARLTON FIELDS JORDEN BURT, P.A.  
450 S. Orange Ave., Suite 500  
Orlando, Florida 32801  
Telephone: (407) 849-0300  
Facsimile: (407) 648-9099  
Email: jclark@cfjblaw.com

Michael L. McCluggage  
EIMER STAHL LLP  
224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100  
Chicago, Illinois 60604  
Telephone: (312) 660-7600  
Facsimile: (312) 692-1718  
Email: mmcluggage@eimerstahl.com

Michael P. Kenny  
Elizabeth Helmer  
ALSTON & BIRD LLP  
1201 West Peachtree Street  
Atlanta, Georgia 30309  
Telephone: 404-881-7000  
Facsimile: 404-881-7777  
Email: mike.kenny@alston.com  
Email: elizabeth.helmer@alston.com

*Counsel for Defendants State Farm Mutual  
Automobile Insurance Company, State Farm  
Fire and Casualty Company, State Farm  
General Insurance Company, State Farm*

*Guaranty Insurance Company, and State Farm  
Indemnity Company*

/s/ Michael R. Pennington

Michael R. Pennington, Trial Counsel  
(Alabama Bar No. ASB-0178-T63M)  
BRADLEY ARANT BOULT CUMMINGS  
LLP  
One Federal Place  
1819 Fifth Avenue North  
Birmingham, AL 35203-2104  
Telephone: (205) 521-8000  
Facsimile: (205) 521-8800  
mpennington@babco.com

*Counsel for Defendants First Acceptance  
Insurance Company, Inc., First Acceptance  
Insurance Company of Tennessee, Inc.,  
Infinity Insurance Company, and  
Infinity Auto Insurance Company*

/s/ R. Bradley Best

R. Bradley Best (MS Bar# 10059)  
HOLCOMB DUNBAR WATTS BEST  
MASTERS & GOLMON, PA  
P.O. Drawer 707  
400 South Lamar, Suite A  
Oxford, MS 38655  
Telephone: (662) 234-8775  
Facsimile: (662) 238-7552  
Email: bradb主@holcombdunbar.com

*Counsel for Defendants Shelter General  
Insurance Company and Shelter Mutual  
Insurance Company, and ACCC Insurance  
Company*

/s/ Brian S. Jones

BRIAN S. JONES  
CURTIS T. JONES  
JOEL T. NAGLE  
BOSE MCKINNEY & EVANS LLP  
111 Monument Circle, Suite 2700  
Indianapolis, IN 46204

Telephone: (317) 684-5000  
Facsimile: (317) 684-5173 fax  
Email: b.jones@boselaw.com  
Email: cjones@boselaw.com  
Email: jnagle@boselaw.com

*Counsel for Indiana Farmers Mutual  
Insurance Company*

/s/ Timothy J. Rooney

Timothy J. Rooney (admitted pro hac vice)  
Norman K. Beck (admitted pro hac vice)  
WINSTON & STRAWN LLP  
35 West Wacker Drive  
Chicago, Illinois 60601  
Telephone: (312) 558-5600  
Facsimile: (312) 558-5700  
[trooney@winston.com](mailto:trooney@winston.com)  
[nbeck@winston.com](mailto:nbeck@winston.com)

Laura Besvinick  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
600 Brickell Avenue, Suite 2700  
Miami, FL 33131  
Telephone: (305) 459-6500  
Facsimile: (305) 459-6550  
Fla. Bar No. 391158  
[laura.besvinick@hoganlovells.com](mailto:laura.besvinick@hoganlovells.com)

*Counsel for The Travelers Home and Marine  
Insurance Company, The Travelers Indemnity  
Company of America, The Travelers Indemnity  
Company of Connecticut, The Travelers  
Indemnity Company, Travco Insurance  
Company, Travelers Casualty and Surety  
Company, Travelers Casualty and Surety  
Company of America, Travelers Casualty  
Company of Connecticut, Travelers Casualty  
Insurance Company of America, Travelers  
Commercial Insurance Company, Travelers  
Personal Insurance Company, Travelers  
Personal Security Insurance Company,  
Travelers Property Casualty Company,  
Travelers Property Casualty Company of*

*America, and Travelers Property Casualty  
Insurance Company*

/s/ Joseph T. Kissane  
Joseph T. Kissane, Esquire  
Florida Bar No. 512966  
Cole, Scott & Kissane, P.A.  
4686 Sunbeam Road  
Jacksonville, Florida 32257  
Phone: (904) 672-4031  
Facsimile: (904) 672-4050  
Joseph. Kissane@csklaw.com

/s/ Jeffrey S. Cashdan  
Jeffrey S. Cashdan, admitted pro hac vice  
Christine A. Hopkinson, admitted pro hac vice  
KING & SPALDING LLP  
1180 Peachtree Street, NE  
Atlanta, Georgia 30309  
Phone: (404) 572-4600  
Facsimile: (404) 472-5139  
jcashdan@kslaw.com  
chopkinson@kslaw.com

/s/ Michael R. Nelson  
Michael R. Nelson, admitted pro hac vice  
Kymberly Kochis, admitted pro hac vice  
Francis X. Nolan, admitted pro hac vice  
NELSON BROWN & CO.  
17 State Street, 29th Floor  
New York, New York 10004  
Telephone: (212) 233-0130  
Facsimile: (212) 233-0172  
mnelson@nelsonbrownco.com  
kkochis@nelsonbrownco.com  
fnolan@nelsonbrownco.com

*Counsel for Defendants  
Artisan & Truckers Casualty Company,  
Progressive Advanced Insurance Company,  
Progressive American Insurance Company,  
Progressive Casualty Insurance Company,  
Progressive Choice Insurance Company,  
Progressive Classic Insurance Company,*

*Progressive County Mutual Insurance Company, Progressive Direct Insurance Company, Progressive Freedom Insurance Company, Progressive Garden State Insurance, Progressive Gulf Insurance Company, Progressive Hawaii Insurance Company, Progressive Marathon Insurance Company, Progressive Max Insurance Company, Progressive Michigan Insurance Company, Progressive Mountain Insurance Company, Progressive Northern Insurance Company, Progressive Northwestern Insurance, Progressive Paloverde Insurance Company, Progressive Preferred Insurance Company, Progressive Security Insurance Company, Progressive Select Insurance Company, Progressive Southeastern Insurance Company, Progressive Specialty Insurance Company, Progressive Universal Insurance Company, Progressive West Insurance Company, The Progressive Corporation, and United Financial Casualty Company*

*/s/ Michael E. Mumford*

Michael S. Vitale  
Florida Bar No. 17136  
mvitale@bakerlaw.com  
Salomon Laguerre  
Florida Bar No. 92470  
slaguerre@bakerlaw.com  
BakerHostetler LLP  
200 South Orange Avenue, Suite 2300  
Orlando, Florida 32802-0112  
Telephone (407) 649-4000  
Facsimile (407) 841-0168

Ernest E. Vargo, *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*  
evargo@bakerlaw.com  
Michael E. Mumford, *Admitted Pro Hac Vice*  
mmumford@bakerlaw.com  
BakerHostetler LLP  
PNC Center, Suite 3200  
1900 East 9th Street  
Cleveland, OH 44114-3482

Telephone (216) 621-0200

Facsimile (216) 696-0740

*Counsel for Defendants Liberty Mutual Insurance Company, Liberty Mutual Fire Insurance Company, Safeco Insurance Company of America, Safeco Insurance Company of Indiana, Safeco Insurance Company of Illinois, American States Insurance Company, Indiana Insurance Company, State Auto Property and Casualty Insurance Company, State Automobile Mutual Insurance Company, General Insurance Company of America, Liberty Mutual Mid-Atlantic Insurance Company, America First Insurance Company, First National Insurance Company of America, Liberty Insurance Company, LM Insurance Company, LM General Insurance Corp., The First Liberty Insurance Corporation, and First Liberty Mutual Fire Insurance Company*

/s/ John J. Haggerty (w/permission)

John J. Haggerty (Admitted Pro Hac Vice)

FOX ROTHSCHILD LLP

2700 Kelly Road, Suite 300

Warrington, PA 18976-3624

Telephone: (215) 345-7500

Facsimile: (215) 345-7507

[jhaggerty@foxrothschild.com](mailto:jhaggerty@foxrothschild.com)

*Counsel for Westfield Insurance Company*

/s/ Dan W. Goldfine

Dan W. Goldfine (ASB #018788)

Email: [dgoldfine@lrrc.com](mailto:dgoldfine@lrrc.com)

Lewis Roca Rothgerber Christie LLP

201 E. Washington Street, Suite 1200 Phoenix,

AZ 85004

Telephone: (602) 262-5311

Facsimile: (602) 262-5747

*Counsel for Defendants GEICO Casualty Company, GEICO Choice Insurance*



*Company, GEICO Secure Insurance Company, Government Employees Insurance Company, GEICO General Insurance Company, GEICO Advantage Insurance Company, and GEICO Indemnity Insurance Company*

/s/ Julius F. Parker III

Kathy J. Maus, Esq.  
Florida Bar No.: 0896330  
kmaus@butlerpappas.com  
Julius F. Parker, III, Esq.  
Florida Bar No.: 0160857  
jparker@butlerpappas.com  
Secondary: eservice@butlerpappas.com  
3600 Maclay Boulevard, Suite 101  
Tallahassee, FL 32312  
Telephone: (850) 894-4111  
Facsimile: (850) 894-4999

*Counsel for Defendant  
Mercury Insurance Company of Florida,  
Mercury Insurance Company of Illinois,  
Mercury Insurance Company, and California  
Automobile Insurance Company*

/s/ E.K. Cottrell

E.K. Cottrell (Fl. Bar No. 0013579)  
Email: ecottrell@sgrlaw.com  
Smith, Gambrell & Russell, LLP  
50 N. Laura Street, Suite 2600  
Jacksonville, FL 32202  
Telephone: (904) 598-6100  
Facsimile: (904) 598-6300

*Counsel for Defendants  
Sentry Insurance A Mutual Company and  
Sentry Select Insurance Company, and  
Dairyland Insurance Company*

/s/ Richard L. Fenton

Richard L. Fenton (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Mark L. Hanover (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Dentons US LLP

233 S. Wacker Dr., Suite 7800  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (312) 876-8000  
Facsimile: (312) 876-793  
Email: richard.fenton@dentons.com  
Email: mark.hanover@dentons.com

Lori J. Caldwell (Florida Bar No. 026874)  
Rumberger, Kirk & Caldwell, PA  
300 S. Orange Ave., Suite 1400  
P.O. Box 1873  
Orlando, FL 32802-1873  
Telephone: (407) 839-4511  
Facsimile: (407) 835-2011  
Email: lcaldwell@rumberger.com

*Counsel for Defendants*

*Allstate Insurance Company, Allstate Indemnity Company, Allstate Property and Casualty Insurance Company, Allstate Vehicle and Property Insurance Company, Allstate Fire and Casualty Insurance Company, Encompass Indemnity Company, Encompass Insurance Company of America, Encompass Property and Casualty Company, Esurance Insurance Company, Esurance Property & Casualty Insurance Company, Allstate New Jersey Insurance Company, Allstate New Jersey Property and Casualty Insurance Company, Encompass Home & Auto Insurance Company, and Allstate Northbrook Indemnity Company*

/s/ Hal K. Litchford

Hal K. Litchford (272485)  
Baker, Donelson, Bearman, Caldwell &  
Berkowitz, PC  
Sun Trust Center  
200 South Orange Avenue  
Post Office Box 1549  
Orlando, Florida 32802  
Telephone: (407) 422-6600  
Facsimile: (407) 841-0325  
Email: hlitchford@bakerdonelson.com

-and-

Amelia W. Koch (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
Steven F. Griffith, Jr. (Admitted *Pro Hac Vice*)  
Baker, Donelson, Bearman Cladwell &  
Berkowitz, PC  
201 St. Charles Avenue, Suite 3600  
New Orleans, Louisiana 70170  
Telephone: (504) 566-5200  
Facsimile: (504) 636-4000  
Email: akoch@bakerdonelson.com  
Email: sgriffith@bakerdonelson.com

*Counsel for Defendants*  
*USAA Casualty Insurance Company, USAA*  
*General Insurance Company, United Services*  
*Automobile Association and Garrison*  
*Property and Casualty Insurance Company*

*s/ Matthew C. Blickensderfer*

Matthew C. Blickensderfer  
FROST BROWN TODD LLC  
3300 Great American Tower  
301 East Fourth Street  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
(513) 651-6162 (phone)  
(513) 651-6981 (fax)  
[mblickensderfer@fbtlaw.com](mailto:mblickensderfer@fbtlaw.com)

*Counsel for Defendant The Cincinnati*  
*Insurance Company*

*/s/ Kathy L. Osborn*

Kathy L. Osborn, Indiana Atty. No. 21927-53  
Ryan M. Hurley, Indiana Atty. No. 24956-49  
Sarah C. Jenkins, Indiana Atty. No. 26421-53  
FAEGRE BAKER DANIELS LLP  
300 North Meridian Street, Suite 2700  
Indianapolis, IN 46204  
[Kathy.osborn@faegrebd.com](mailto:Kathy.osborn@faegrebd.com)  
[Ryan.hurley@faegrebd.com](mailto:Ryan.hurley@faegrebd.com)  
[Sarah.jenkins@faegrebd.com](mailto:Sarah.jenkins@faegrebd.com)  
Tel. (317) 237-0300

Fax (317) 237-1000

Michael S. McCarthy, Colorado Atty. No.  
6688

Heather Carson Perkins, Colorado Atty. No.  
30168

3200 Wells Fargo Center

1700 Lincoln Street

Denver, CO 80203-4532

Tel. (303) 607-3703

Fax (303) 607-3600

[Michael.mccarthy@faegrebd.com](mailto:Michael.mccarthy@faegrebd.com)

[Heather.perkins@faegrebd.com](mailto:Heather.perkins@faegrebd.com)

*Counsel for Defendants  
American Family Mutual Insurance Co.  
and American Standard Insurance Co.  
of Wisconsin*

/s/ Thomas G. Rohback

Thomas G. Rohback (*pro hac vice*)

Axinn, Veltrop & Harkrider LLP

90 State House Square

Hartford, CT 06103

Telephone: (860) 275-8100

Facsimile: (860) 275-8101

troback@axinn.com

J. Suzanne M. Lehner

Florida Bar No.: 002368

Quintairos, Prieto, Wood & Boyer, P.A.

4905 West Laurel Street

Tampa, Florida 33607

Telephone: (813) 286-8818

Facsimile: (813) 286-9998

suzanne.lehner@qpwbllaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Hartford Accident and  
Indemnity Company, Hartford Underwriters  
Insurance Company, Hartford Fire Insurance  
Company, Hartford Casualty Insurance  
Company, Property and Casualty Insurance  
Company of Hartford, Hartford Insurance  
Company of the Midwest, Hartford Insurance*

*Company of the Southeast, Hartford Insurance  
Company of Illinois, Sentinel Insurance  
Company LTD, and Twin City Fire Insurance  
Company*

/s/ Robert L. Steinmetz

Robert L. Steinmetz (Kentucky Bar No.  
67488)

GWIN, STEINMETZ, & BAIRD, PLLC

One Riverfront Plaza

401 W. Main Street, Suite 1000

Louisville, KY 40202

Telephone: (502) 618-5700

Facsimile: (502) 618-5701

rsteinmetz@gsblegal.com

*Counsel for Defendant*

*Safe Auto Insurance Company*

/s/ Rowe W. Snider

Rowe W. Snider – Trial Counsel

Matthew T. Furton

Julia C. Webb

LOCKE LORD LLP

111 S. Wacker Drive

Chicago, IL 60606

312.443.0700

rsnider@lockelord.com

mfurton@lockelord.com

jwebb@lockelord.com

*Counsel for Defendant Amica Mutual  
Insurance Company*

/s/ Joseph E. Ezzie

Joseph E. Ezzie

Email: jezzie@bakerlaw.com

BAKERHOSTETLER

Capitol Square, Suite 2100

65 East State Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4260

Telephone: 614.228.1541

Facsimile: 614.462.2616

*Counsel for Grange Indemnity Ins. Co.,  
Grange Insurance Co. of Michigan,  
Grange Mutual Casualty Co., and Grange  
Property & Casualty Ins. Co.*

/s/ Christopher R. Pennison

Christopher R. Pennison (LA No. 22584)  
LARZELERE PICOU WELLS SIMPSON  
LONERO, LLC  
Suite 1100 - Two Lakeway Center  
3850 N. Causeway Boulevard  
Metairie, LA 70002  
Tel: (504) 834-6500  
Fax: (504) 834-6565  
cpennison@lpwsl.com

*Counsel for Defendant American National  
Property and Casualty Company and  
American National General Insurance  
Company*

/s/ R. Wardell Loveland

R. Wardell Loveland (SBN 127736)  
555 Twin Dolphin Drive, Suite 300  
Redwood Shores  
Redwood City, CA 94065  
Telephone: (650) 592-5400  
Facsimile: (650) 592-5027  
rloveland@chdlawyers.com

*Counsel for CSAA Insurance Exchange, CSAA  
Fire & Casualty Insurance Company, AAA  
Mid Atlantic Insurance Company, and Western  
United Insurance Company*

/s/ Jeffrey R. Seewald

JEFFREY R. SEEWALD  
Texas State Bar No. 17986640  
McGlinchey Stafford, PLLC  
1001 McKinney Street, Suite 1500  
Houston, Texas 77002  
Phone: 713-520-1900  
Fax: 713-520-1025

Email: jseewald@mcglinchey.com

ANTHONY J. ROLLO  
Louisiana State Bar No. 01133  
McGlinchey Stafford, PLLC  
301 Main Street, 14th Floor  
Baton Rouge LA 70801  
Phone: 225-383-9000  
Fax: 225-343-3076  
Email: arollo@mcglinchey.com

RANDY R. DOW  
Florida Bar No. 121118  
McGlinchey Stafford PLLC  
One East Broward Blvd., Suite 1400  
Fort Lauderdale FL 33301  
Phone: 954-356-2501  
Fax: 954-333-3847  
Email: rdow@mcglinchey.com

*Counsel for Defendant Affirmative Insurance  
Company and U.S. Agencies Casualty  
Insurance Company*

*s/ Lori McAllister*  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Lori McAllister (P39501)  
DYKEMA GOSSETT PLLC  
*Attorneys for Auto-Owners Insurance  
Company*  
201 Townsend, Suite 900  
Lansing, MI 48933  
(517) 374-9150  
lmcallister@dykema.com

*Counsel for Auto-Owners Insurance Company,  
The Hanover American Insurance Company,  
The Hanover Insurance Company, Citizens  
Insurance Company of America, Michigan  
Millers Mutual Insurance Company, and  
Allmerica Financial Alliance Insurance  
Company*

*s/ Michael H. Carpenter*  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Michael H. Carpenter

Michael N. Beekhuizen  
Peter T. Snow  
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP  
280 Plaza, Suite 1300  
280 North High Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
(614) 365-4100 telephone  
(614) 365-9145 facsimile  
carpenter@carpenterlipps.com  
beekhuizen@carpenterlipps.com  
snow@carpenterlipps.com

Mark J. Botti  
Squire Patton Boggs (US) LLP  
1200 19th Street, N.W., Suite 300  
Washington, District of Columbia 20036  
(202) 626-6600 telephone  
(202) 626-6780 facsimile  
mark.botti@squirepb.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Nationwide Mutual Insurance Company, Nationwide Affinity Insurance Company of America, Nationwide Agribusiness Insurance Company, Nationwide Assurance Company, Nationwide General Insurance Company, Nationwide Insurance Company of America, Nationwide Insurance Company of America, Nationwide Insurance Company of Florida, Nationwide Mutual Fire Insurance Company, Nationwide Property and Casualty Insurance Company, Allied Property and Casualty Insurance Company, AMCO Insurance Company, Colonial County Mutual Insurance Company, Depositors Insurance Company, Harleysville Lake States Insurance Company, and Harleysville Preferred Insurance Company*

/s/ P. Bruce Converse  
P. Bruce Converse (Az Bar No. 005868)  
Floyd P. Bienstock (Az Bar No. 006299)  
STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP  
201 E. Washington St., Suite 1600  
Phoenix, AZ 85004



Telephone: (602) 257-5274  
Telephone: (602) 257-5210  
Fax: (602) 257-5299  
Email: [bconverse@steptoe.com](mailto:bconverse@steptoe.com)  
Email: [fbienstock@steptoe.com](mailto:fbienstock@steptoe.com)

*Counsel for Defendants Metropolitan Property  
and Casualty Insurance Company,  
Metropolitan Direct Property and Casualty  
Insurance Company,  
Metropolitan Group Property and Casualty  
Insurance Company,  
Metropolitan Casualty Insurance Company,  
and  
Metropolitan General Insurance Company*

/s/ Lara J. Edelstein

Lara J. Edelstein  
Florida Bar No. 78591  
E-mail: [ledelstein@uaig.net](mailto:ledelstein@uaig.net)  
Paul E. Susz  
Florida Bar No. 836095  
Email: [psusz@uaig.net](mailto:psusz@uaig.net)  
Office of the General Counsel/Trial Division  
United Automobile Insurance Company  
1313 N.W. 167 Street  
Miami Gardens, FL 33169  
Telephone: (305) 774-6160

/s/ Christopher C. Skambis

CHRISTOPHER C. SKAMBIS  
Florida Bar No. 0262358  
THE SKAMBIS LAW FIRM  
720 Rugby Street, Suite 120  
Orlando, Florida 32804  
Telephone: (407) 649-0090  
Facsimile: (407) 649-0191  
Email: [cskambis@skambislaw.com](mailto:cskambis@skambislaw.com)

*Counsel for Defendants Safeway Insurance  
Company, Safeway Insurance Company of  
Louisiana, Safeway Insurance Company of  
Alabama*

/s/ Maria Elena Abate

---

Maria Elena Abate  
Fla. Bar No. 770418  
COLODNY FASS, P.A.  
One Financial Plaza, 23rd Floor  
100 Southeast 3rd Avenue  
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33394  
Telephone: (954) 492-4010  
Facsimile: (954) 492-1144  
[mabate@colodnyfass.com](mailto:mabate@colodnyfass.com)

*Counsel for Florida Farm Bureau Casualty  
Insurance Company and Florida Farm Bureau  
General Insurance Company*

/s/ Michael B. de Leeuw

---

Michael B. de Leeuw  
John J. Sullivan  
Jason Bonk  
COZEN O'CONNOR  
45 Broadway, Suite 1600  
New York, NY 10006  
P: (212) 509-9400  
F: (212) 509-9492  
[MdeLeeuw@cozen.com](mailto:MdeLeeuw@cozen.com)  
[JSullivan@cozen.com](mailto:JSullivan@cozen.com)  
[JBonk@cozen.com](mailto:JBonk@cozen.com)

*Counsel for Defendant  
AIG Property Casualty Company*

/s/ David L. Yohai (w/permission)

David L. Yohai (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
John P. Mastando III (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Eric Hochstadt (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
WEIL GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP  
767 Fifth Avenue  
New York, New York 10153  
Telephone: 212-310-8000  
Facsimile: 212-310-8007  
Email: [david.yohai@weil.com](mailto:david.yohai@weil.com)  
Email: [john.mastando@weil.com](mailto:john.mastando@weil.com)  
Email: [eric.hochstadt@weil.com](mailto:eric.hochstadt@weil.com)

*Counsel for 21st Century Assurance Company, 21st Century Centennial Insurance Company, 21st Century Indemnity Insurance Company, 21st Century Insurance Company, 21st Century North America Insurance Company, 21st Century Pinnacle Insurance Company, Bristol West Insurance Company, Coast National Insurance Company, Farmers Insurance Company of Arizona, Farmers Insurance Company of Washington, Farmers Insurance Company, Inc., Farmers Insurance Exchange, Farmers Insurance Group, Inc., Farmers New Century Insurance Company, Foremost Insurance Company Grand Rapids, Michigan, Foremost Property & Casualty Insurance Company, Illinois Farmers Insurance Company, Mid-Century Insurance Company, and Security National Insurance Company*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 19<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2016, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system which will send a Notice of Electronic Filing to all counsel of record that are registered with the Court's CM/ECF system.

/s/ Johanna W. Clark  
Johanna W. Clark