NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 1

1	SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
2	COUNTY OF NASSAU: TRIAL TERM PART 25
3	X
4	STATE FARM MUTUAL AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE
5	COMPANY, Index No.
6	606797/2017 Plaintiff,
7	-against-
8	M.V.B. COLLISION INC., d/b/a MID ISLAND COLLISION,
9	Defendant. X
10	Nassau Supreme Court Mineola, New York 11501 December 12, 2018
11	B E F O R E: HONORABLE JACK L. LIBERT
12	Justice of the Supreme Court
13	APPEARANCES:
14	RUBIN, FIORELLA & FRIEDMAN, LLP Attorneys for Plaintiff
15	630 Third Avenue New York, New York 10017
16	BY: MICHAEL E. TOMSKY, ESQ. KYEKO M. STEWART, ESQ.
17	KIEKO M. SIEWAKI, ESQ.
18	BARKET EPSTEIN KEARON ALDEA & LOTURCO LLP Attorneys for Defendant
19	666 Old Country Road, Suite 700 Garden City, New York 11530
20	BY: ALEXANDER KLEIN, ESQ. KEVIN KEARON, ESQ.
21	REVIN REARON, ESQ.
22	
23	PATRICIA HOLSGROVE, RPR
24	OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER
25	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 COURT CLERK: All rise. Judge Libert 2 presiding. Be seated and come to order. 3 (Whereupon, Court Exhibits I and II were marked in evidence.) 4 5 THE COURT: I guess we're taking a witness out 6 of order now. 7 MR. TOMSKY: Right now we're still doing the 8 cross. THE COURT: You haven't finished the cross? 9 10 MR. TOMSKY: And then we're going to take an 11 expert witness in order and then in the afternoon 12 probably do a couple of my witnesses technically out of 13 order. 14 COURT OFFICER: And you're reminded you're 15 still under oath. 16 THE WITNESS: Good morning. 17 THE COURT: Okay, you may proceed. 18 MR. TOMSKY: Thank you, your Honor. 19 CROSS EXAMINATION 20 BY MR. TOMSKY: 21 Welcome back, sir. How are you doing today? 0. 22 Very good. Thank you. Α. 23 So I'm showing you what has been pre-marked as I Ο. 24 guess Plaintiff's Exhibit-11. Do you recognize this 25 document?

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 Α. Yes. I want to talk about this for a second. 2 Ο. Am I 3 correct in saying that this is a letter signed by Courtney 4 Pope with Mid Island Collision concerning possible remedies 5 if an agreement was not authorized between State Farm and Mid 6 Island? 7 Just so I have it clear, can you repeat that? Α. 8 Q. Sure. 9 MR. TOMSKY: Could you read it back? 10 (The requested portion was read.) 11 Yes. Α. I'm sorry, just off for a minute. 12 THE COURT: 13 (A discussion was held off the record.) 14 So in the second paragraph of this exhibit starting Q. 15 with "it is possible," I just want to direct your attention 16 to that section, second paragraph. The first part of the 17 second paragraph is "if you have authorized." 18 Α. Okay. 19 But I'm going to the next sentence, so it's -- in Q. 20 this letter, it says, "it is possible that the insurance 21 company estimate might differ from your estimate," correct? 22 Α. Yes. And that there are several steps that you will take 23 0. 24 on behalf of Ms. Pope if she signs this document, correct? 25 MR. KLEIN: Objection as to the description of

ph

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 4

1	what's on this document.
2	MR. TOMSKY: It literally says "there are
3	several steps we will take on your behalf."
4	MR. KLEIN: Not if she signs this document.
5	THE COURT: I'm sorry? I lost the last part.
6	MR. KLEIN: So the question was that there
7	would be several steps that Mid Island would take if
8	Ms. Pope signed this document. That is not what the
9	letter states.
10	MR. TOMSKY: Your Honor, I'll clarify.
11	THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.
12	Q. The letter states in the third paragraph that there
13	are several steps that Mid Island will take on Courtney
14	Pope's behalf, correct, if that situation is to exist, if
15	M.V.B. and State Farm have a disagreement in the cost of
16	repair or the labor rate, et cetera?
17	A. Yes.
18	Q. Now, under the paragraph starting with "should you
19	choose," that's the the third to last paragraph if you
20	include the final line, it says, "should you choose to assign
21	your rights to us, you will no longer be responsible for any
22	payments to us, other than your deductible." That's what the
23	document says, correct?
24	A. Yes.
25	Q. It also says, "none of these steps will delay the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 5

1	repair of the vehicle," correct?	
2	A. Yes.	
3	Q. So one of those steps is seeking civil remedies in	
4	the court of law, it's step number four, correct?	
5	A. Yes.	
6	Q. So I want to make sure I got this straight. You	
7	guys, M.V.B., is not seeking any reimbursement from Ms. Pope	
8	for the additional \$21,000 that you believe is owed to you in	
9	this case, correct?	
10	A. I'm not sure what the legal is, but I believe no.	
11	Q. Well, as a general manager of the shop, are you	
12	aware of any pending litigation between Mid Island Collision	
13	as the plaintiff and Courtney Pope as a defendant for the	
14	difference in payments?	
15	A. No.	
16	Q. So the only civil lawsuit where Mid Island	
17	Collision is the plaintiff and someone else is a defendant	
18	for this case, that you're aware of, is the one where State	
19	Farm is the defendant for breach of contract; is that	
20	correct?	
21	A. To my understanding.	
22	Q. To your knowledge, that's all I could ask you, is	
23	to your knowledge.	
24	Essentially, to summarize, Mid Island Collision is	
25	not seeking any additional money from Ms. Pope, besides maybe	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 6

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	an issue with the deductible; is that correct?
2	A. To my knowledge, yes.
3	Q. To your knowledge, again.
4	So the only issue in terms of money being sought by
5	M.V.B. is through State Farm, correct?
б	A. I think it's indirectly State Farm through
7	Ms. Pope. Ms. Pope owes the money and then we get reimbursed
8	through State Farm.
9	Q. I understand that, but since Ms. Pope signed this
10	document, you've indicated that should she choose to assign
11	her rights to you, which she did do based on this document,
12	she will not be responsible for any other payments.
13	A. Correct.
14	Q. Now, I think you mentioned yesterday that if an
15	insurance company, in this case State Farm, and your shop
16	does not come up with an agreed upon price, it is usually the
17	general practice to charge the insured directly for the
18	differences in repairs, correct?
19	A. Correct.
20	Q. But in this case, since Ms. Pope signed that
21	document, you will not be seeking money from her directly?
22	A. Correct.
23	Q. In this instance, obviously we're here because
24	there is a difference in agreed upon price between Mid Island
25	Collision/M.V.B. and State Farm, correct?

ph

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 7

1	A. Correct.	
2	Q. So even though normally Ms. Pope would be	
3	responsible for the \$21,000 and change, she's not in this	
4	case based on her signing of that document?	
5	A. I don't know legally if that's the case, but she's	
6	responsible for the bill, but it's being pursued through the	
7	other carrier.	
8	Q. Through a breach of contract case?	
9	A. Correct.	
10	Q. But	
11	A. Ultimately.	
12	Q. In addition, you're also holding the vehicle up on	
13	a lien until additional money is paid to Mid Island	
14	Collision, correct, that's what we're here to do today?	
15	A. Yes, we liened the car.	
16	Q. So in addition to the breach of contract, which	
17	would be the civil remedy where you should be suing State	
18	Farm for this money, you're also holding the vehicle hostage	
19	until you get additional money?	
20	MR. KLEIN: Objection.	
21	THE COURT: It calls for a legal conclusion.	
22	Sustained.	
23	Q. I'm going to move on now to to the final bill.	
24	I forget what exhibit that was on yours, the final Mid Island	
25	Collision bill.	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 MR. KLEIN: Exhibit-E. If you could just show the witness again. 2 Ο. COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness 3 Defendant's Exhibit-E. 4 5 Ο. If I could direct your attention to number 146 on 6 the final bill, which is "rental overage due to State Farm 7 negligence." Α. Go ahead. 8 Just so I'm clear here, Mid Island Collision in the 9 0. final bill is charging State Farm for providing a rental 10 11 vehicle to Ms. Pope? 12 MR. KLEIN: Objection to the form. The charge 13 is not to State Farm. 14 MR. TOMSKY: It literally says -- all right, 15 I'll rephrase. 16 THE COURT: Please rephrase. 17 Ο. On the final bill is a charge for rental overage 18 due to State Farm negligence in the amount of \$1,280, 19 correct? 20 Α. Yes. 21 You indicated on direct that Mid Island Collision 0. 22 provided Ms. Pope a rental car in this matter; is that 23 correct? 24 Well, Ms. Pope rented a car. Whether or not I Α. 25 provided it, I don't recall.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 9

1	Q. I would have to look at the actual transcript, but
2	then I guess my next question is, did that rental vehicle
3	come from M.V.B./Mid Island Collision or somewhere else?
4	A. It came from Hertz.
5	Q. Is there a bill from Hertz that you furnished State
6	Farm?
7	A. I'm sure.
8	Q. Well
9	A. I'm sure there is a bill.
10	Q. Do you know if you ever gave it to State Farm?
11	A. I do not know.
12	Q. Because at this time no bill has been furnished to
13	my office or to State Farm as far as withdrawn.
14	To date, I have not been furnished with a bill for
15	this rental.
16	Do you have any proof that this rental was actually
17	provided and the cost, besides this number on the final bill?
18	A. It was in the hard file and I assume the digital
19	file, but I couldn't be sure.
20	Q. Do you know, as you're sitting here today, the date
21	that the rental began?
22	A. No.
23	Q. Do you know the date the rental ended?
24	A. No.
25	Q. Do you know the daily cost of the rental?

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 10

1	
1	A. No.
2	Q. So you don't know when it was given, when it was
3	returned or the daily amount for the rental; is that correct?
4	A. Correct.
5	Q. Now, the final bill is dated June 7th, 2017,
6	correct?
7	A. There are multiple dates on the document, but it
8	says the file was created on 6-7-17, this exact file.
9	Q. So at the very latest this document was created on
10	June 7th, 2017, correct?
11	A. At the very earliest.
12	Q. At the very earliest, okay. So at that time, is it
13	safe to say that any rental had been returned if you were
14	able to give a number for the final bill?
15	A. No. It just says the date it was corrected. It
16	doesn't say the date it ended. It doesn't say the date it
17	was edited.
18	Q. It says "created 6-7-17"?
19	A. Correct.
20	Q. So I'm saying, is it fair to say at that point that
21	any rental would have been returned if you're able to give a
22	final amount for rental overages?
23	A. No.
24	Q. It's not fair to say?
25	A. No, it's not.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 11

1	Q. So there is a possibility that there is additional	
2	billing for a rental vehicle?	
3	A. This document was printed on 8-2.	
4	Q. It says, "created 6-7-17."	
5	A. I understand. That's the date that this file is	
б	started in the computer, but the rental bill is on here and	
7	it was printed on 8-2, so anytime between 6-7 and 8-2, so it	
8	could have been added to the bill.	
9	Q. Since we don't know, I'll move on to the next	
10	question about this.	
11	Are you aware that in her policy Ms. Pope gets a	
12	rental vehicle from State Farm after an accident?	
13	A. If she has that coverage in her policy, yes.	
14	Q. I'm not asking you obviously well, have you	
15	seen the policy?	
16	A. No.	
17	Q. So you can't testify if that's in her policy or	
18	not?	
19	A. Correct.	
20	Q. And, if so, if she was given a rental car by State	
21	Farm, do you know when that was given to her?	
22	A. I do not know.	
23	Q. Do you know when that was returned to her?	
24	A. I do not know.	
25	Q. So the only thing that you know about the rental	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 12

1		
1	car is the number on the final bill; is that correct?	
2	A. Correct.	
3	Q. Moving on now, what's the number of the Auto Haus	
4	bill?	
5	MR. KLEIN: F.	
6	MR. TOMSKY: If you could show the witness	
7	Exhibit-F.	
8	COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness	
9	Defendant's Exhibit-F.	
10	Q. Please indicate when you've gotten the document in	
11	your hand.	
12	A. Got it.	
13	Q. So on direct we talked well, you and Mr. Klein	
14	discussed markups. I just want to make sure I'm clarifying	
15	that a markup is something that is done on the bill to	
16	guarantee a warranty, correct? Correct me if I'm wrong. I	
17	just want to make sure that I understand it.	
18	A. To guarantee warranty work done by a different	
19	vendor.	
20	Q. So if it's not done by Mid Island Collision, there	
21	is an additional markup because you have to guarantee that	
22	work to the owner of the car?	
23	A. Correct.	
24	Q. So looking at both the final bill, which you just	
25	looked at, and the Auto Haus repair, on the final bill there	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Г

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 13

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	is a markup of \$2,171.77. Do you see that?		
2	A. Yes.		
3	Q. I believe you testified on direct, and, again,		
4	correct me if I'm wrong, that markup was based on the Auto		
5	Haus bill as well as the Rockaway Nissan and Certified Towing		
б	aspects of the bill; is that correct?		
7	A. Correct.		
8	Q. What is the address of Mid Island on the final		
9	bill? On the final bill, what is the address of Mid Island?		
10	A. 478 Lakeview Avenue, Rockville Centre, New York.		
11	Q. Is that for the work done on the vehicle at Mid		
12	Island, is that the physical address of where the repairs		
13	were made?		
14	A. No.		
15	Q. Where was the physical address?		
16	A. It was repaired in three different locations.		
17	Q. Were any repairs made at 478 Lakeview Avenue?		
18	A. No.		
19	Q. So no actual repairs are made there?		
20	A. No, that address doesn't exist. That should be		
21	468.		
22	THE COURT: I was just going to say, I'm		
23	looking at this Auto Haus repair bill		
24	MR. TOMSKY: The Mid Island Collision final		
25	bill. I just want to make sure that we're being clear		

ph

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 14

1	here	
2		THE COURT: I thought you referred him to the
3	Auto	Haus repair bill.
4		MR. TOMSKY: We're going to refer to both, if
5	it's	easier for him to have both documents at the same
6	time	
7		THE COURT: Okay. Thank you.
8	Q.	So Mid Island Collision/M.V.B., the defendant for
9	this lien	
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	what is the address what is the business
12	address?	
13	Α.	20 Lakeview Avenue, Rockville Centre, New York.
14	Q.	What is the physical address where the car was when
15	it was not	t being subletted out?
16	Α.	20 Lakeview Avenue, Rockville Centre, New York.
17	Q.	So what is 478 Lakeview?
18	Α.	That's an error. There is no 478.
19	Q.	That was going to be something I wanted to talk
20	about, so	I'm glad we know it was an error.
21		Now, Auto Haus, is that actually at 468 Lakeview or
22	is that a	mistake as well?
23	Α.	468 Lakeview.
24	Q.	So 468 Lakeview Avenue in Rockville Centre is the
25	correct le	egal address for Auto Haus Auto Repairs?

ph

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 15

1	A. Yes.		
2	Q. And you mentioned that that is also owned by a		
3	Mr. Jesberger who is sitting at the table?		
4	A. Yes.		
5	Q. So is it your testimony that the Auto Haus auto		
6	repair bill, which is \$5,601.12 was marked up by 33 percent?		
7	A. Either 25 or 33. I would have to check.		
8	Q. And obviously Mr. Klein, neither one of us are		
9	mathematicians, but he could certainly check my math, when		
10	you include the 5,601 and the two other charges and multiply		
11	it by point 33 or 1.33, it does come up to the exact parts		
12	amount.		
13	A. Okay.		
14	Q. Again, feel free to clarify the math before any		
15	deliberations are made, but that's the math that I did.		
16	So the Auto Haus repair bill is marked up basically		
17	by you multiply the bill by 1.33 and that's the bill that		
18	comes on the final M.V.B. bill, whether it's 25 percent or		
19	33 percent, that's there is an amount from Auto Haus of		
20	5,601.12, you multiply it by either 25 percent or 33 percent		
21	and then you get the markup?		
22	A. Correct.		
23	Q. And you get that same markup for Rockaway Nissan		
24	Towing, correct?		
25	A. Correct.		

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Γ

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 16

1	Q. So I want to make sure I got this right, so M.V.B.
2	is owned by Mr. Jesberger?
3	A. Correct.
4	Q. He gets a bill from Auto Haus which is also owned
5	by Mr. Jesberger, correct?
6	A. Correct.
7	Q. So he gets a bill from himself and then he marks
8	that up again to 33 percent; is that correct?
9	A. M.V.B. Collision gets a bill from Auto Haus.
10	Q. I understand. That's all well and good, but when
11	you actually break it down, Mr. Jesberger is the owner of
12	M.V.B. and the owner of Auto Haus?
13	A. Correct.
14	Q. So he bills himself and then does a markup of the
15	work that was done at another place that he owns; is that
16	correct?
17	MR. KLEIN: Objection to the qualification.
18	THE COURT: Sustained.
19	MR. TOMSKY: All right, I can rephrase my
20	question, I guess.
21	Q. Are you aware if Mr. Jesberger is the sole owner of
22	M.V.B.?
23	A. Yes.
24	Q. So forgetting about things like profit margins, if
25	there is a bill from M.V.B withdrawn.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

He owns M.V.B. and he owns Auto Haus, so he owns 1 both locations, right? 2 3 Α. Yes. But on a bill that he sends to himself he still 4 0. 5 marks it up another 33 percent? 6 MR. KLEIN: Objection to the description. THE COURT: You're calling for a legal 7 8 conclusion as to whether the principal of each of the 9 corporations is the same as the individual, so I'm going 10 to sustain it. 11 MR. TOMSKY: All right, I'll ask it a 12 different way. 13 The bill received by M.V.B. from Auto Haus, which 0. 14 is owned by the same person, is marked up 33 percent when 15 received, correct? 16 Α. Correct. 17 Q. And in terms of markups, the same thing is done --18 Rockaway Towing is not owned by Mr. Jesberger, correct? 19 Α. Correct. 20 So the same thing is done where the amount is Q. 21 marked up 33 percent? 22 Α. Correct. 23 MR. TOMSKY: If the witness can be shown 24 Exhibit-P. 25 COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 Defendant's Exhibit-P. All right, so on the tow receipts, according to the 2 0. 3 final bill there are two different charges for towing, 4 correct? 5 Α. Yes. 6 Ο. So one of them was \$225 to tow the vehicle from 7 what we believe is Ms. Pope's address. Is that to Mid Island Collision? 8 9 Α. Yes. 10 And then there is another tow charge for -- for Ο. more than double that to take it from what, M.V.B. to 11 12 Rockaway Nissan? 13 The first tow is from a residence. The second tow Α. 14 is for a double tow to and from the dealer, so it's three 15 tows. 16 I'm not -- I just want to make sure that I know Q. 17 what I'm talking about on these bills. So one is 225 and the 18 other you're saying is 490, which includes two different 19 tows? 20 Correct. Α. 21 0. And then that gets marked up as well, the second 22 tow gets marked up as well? 23 Α. As well as? 24 I said the -- the two tows, the Rockaway -- the Ο. 25 Certified Towing for -- that gets marked up as well for

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 19

1	33 percent?
2	A. It gets marked up.
3	Q. Either 25 or 33?
4	A. Yes.
5	Q. Now, you mentioned the original manufacturing
6	agreement withdrawn.
7	You mentioned the OEM is a requirement from Nissan,
8	and Mr. Klein provided you with those pieces of paper?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. And what happens if you were to use a recycled part
11	on a vehicle? In terms of your certifications, is there
12	something that happens to your certifications if you use a
13	recycled part instead of an OEM, if you know? If you don't
14	know
15	A. I would rather not find out.
16	MR. KLEIN: Objection to a legal conclusion
17	about what might happen to a certification.
18	THE COURT: Overruled.
19	Q. So your answer was you're not sure and you don't
20	want to find out?
21	A. I don't want to find out.
22	Q. And you indicated that Mid Island or M.V.B., I
23	apologize for switching around, spent a lot of money to get
24	accredited by these different vehicle manufacturers, correct,
25	Audi, Nissan?

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 20

1	
1	A. Yes.
2	Q. Now I want to go back to the final bill. Is it
3	fair to say, and I believe you stipulated as such, that the
4	only repair that anybody is actually disputing is one
5	recycled wheel versus two new wheels, and, I apologize, it's
6	actually on the Auto Haus final bill for number 23?
7	A. What was the question? I'm sorry.
8	Q. I'll say it again.
9	Is it fair to say in terms of the actual repairs
10	done with the car, not the labor rate, not the rental, not
11	the towing, the only actual dispute, there's actually a court
12	stipulation saying this, is on number 23 on the Auto Haus
13	repair bill, looks like there was a charge on that final bill
14	for two 20-inch aluminum alloy wheels, whereas on the final
15	estimate from State Farm they wrote for a recycled part; is
16	that correct?
17	A. I don't have a dispute with that. We purchased two
18	wheels.
19	Q. No. No. I'm saying the only repair in dispute in
20	this case is that I'm not disputing that you bought the
21	two new wheels.
22	A. Okay.
23	Q. Is it fair to say from your recollection of the
24	case that that is the only thing in dispute when it comes to
25	the actual repairs?

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 21

1	MR. KLEIN: Objection. The dispute is
2	THE COURT: No, it's overruled. If he doesn't
3	know, he could say "I don't know."
4	A. I assume the dispute is over the entire final bill.
5	Q. Well, correct, the dispute is about the final bill
6	and aspects of it, but there's actually a court stipulation
7	where the only dispute on the actual repairs done is whether
8	one recycled wheel should have been used or two new alloy
9	wheels; is that correct? If you don't know, then say you
10	don't know.
11	A. I don't know that.
12	Q. Okay, now, isn't it fair to say that up until the
13	final loss determination made by State Farm that the goal of
14	both M.V.B. and State Farm was to get the vehicle back to as
15	close to pre-loss condition as possible?
16	A. I'm sorry, if I could ask you to repeat that.
17	Q. Is it fair to say that up until the total loss
18	determination was made by State Farm that the goal of both
19	sides, M.V.B. and State Farm, is to get the vehicle back to
20	pre-loss condition or as close to?
21	MR. KLEIN: Objection, calls for speculation.
22	A. No.
23	THE COURT: No, I'm going to allow it. As a
24	matter of fact, I think he testified as to that during
25	direct examination.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

1 Ο. Well, I believe his answer was no, that that was 2 not the goal. Why would that not be the goal, if you're 3 repairing the car, the point of you repairing it, besides 4 making money, obviously, is to try to get the car back to 5 either pre-loss condition or as best as possible, correct? 6 Α. When we repair cars, yes, we are -- our goal is to 7 repair them to their pre-loss condition. 8 Obviously, you can't speak for State Farm, but I Q. would imagine that's their goal as well until a total loss 9 10 determination is filed, correct? 11 MR. KLEIN: Objection. 12 THE COURT: Sustained. 13 So it's fair to say that you were told there was a 0. 14 total loss, it was M.V.B.'s goal to get the vehicle back to 15 pre-loss condition, correct, or as close to? 16 Our goal is to bring all cars back to pre-loss Α. 17 condition. I'm not understanding your question. 18 I'll move on. Are you aware that State Farm paid 0. 19 Ms. Pope and her lienholder over \$40,000 after the vehicle 20 was deemed a total loss? I was told they paid it off. I don't know the 21 Α. 22 numbers. 23 0. And you're aware that M.V.B. has already been paid 24 over \$29,000 or around \$29,000 so far for the repairs made on 25 this vehicle, correct?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 Α. I believe so. So far, again, I didn't major in math, but 29 and 2 0. 3 40, so far State Farm has already paid \$69,000 in repairs and 4 costs and payments for this vehicle, correct? 5 Α. That's their fault. 6 MR. TOMSKY: I didn't ask for that. I ask 7 that be stricken as nonresponsive. It's stricken. 8 THE COURT: Even with all that, M.V.B. is still demanding an 9 Ο. 10 additional \$21,000 in repairs for this vehicle? 11 Yes. We did those repairs. Α. 12 So that would bring it up to almost \$90,000 that 0. 13 you believe State Farm is responsible for this car between 14 payments to you and payments to Ms. Pope? 15 Well, I did tell them to total it early on. Α. 16 MR. TOMSKY: Again, it's not responsive. Ι 17 ask that it be stricken. 18 THE COURT: Would you read the question back, 19 please, Pat? 20 (The requested portion was read.) 21 Α. I only know what they're responsible to me for is 22 50 some odd thousand dollars. 23 0. So that plus whatever amount was given to Ms. Pope 24 and her lienholder in this case? 25 Α. I'm not sure what State Farm's responsibility is.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Г

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 24

1	I just know what my responsibility is to collect.
2	MR. TOMSKY: If I could have Exhibit-3 shown
3	to the witness.
4	(Whereupon, Plaintiff's Exhibit-3 was marked
5	into evidence.)
6	COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness
7	Plaintiff's 3 in evidence.
8	Q. Are you looking at the document, sir?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. Just a quick question, now, looking at the demand
11	for appraisal, can you just explain what a demand for
12	appraisal is?
13	A. Yes. In the standard New York policy, the consumer
14	has a right to an appraisal clause if they feel that their
15	insurance company is not properly estimating the car.
16	Q. And I'm looking at the date, it says March 17th of
17	2017, which is before the collision. Do you know, as you're
18	sitting here today, when that document was actually signed
19	and why sorry, please, go ahead.
20	A. It was signed on 3-28.
21	Q. So on 3-28? That's before an initial estimate was
22	written by State Farm, correct?
23	A. Correct.
24	Q. But by that time she had already, Ms. Pope had
25	already signed a document saying that she was that you

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 were dissatisfied with the appraisal written by the -- by 2 somebody? 3 Α. That's correct. How would that -- well, withdrawn. 4 Ο. 5 You said, "we find the estimate lacking in many 6 areas." 7 Α. Correct. 8 But there was no estimate yet. Q. 9 Α. Correct. 10 I guess I'm confused how somebody can say they were Ο. 11 dissatisfied with an estimate that hadn't been written yet, 12 but I guess that's just me. 13 MR. KLEIN: Is that a question? 14 I'm going to ignore that as an THE COURT: 15 unnecessary comment. 16 How would somebody -- as far as you know, how would Q. 17 somebody be dissatisfied with an estimate that wasn't written 18 vet? 19 Historically. Α. 20 Historically what? Q. 21 Α. Predictable. 22 So you basically went into this whole process Q. 23 thinking that State Farm was going to low ball you and not 24 pay what you think they were supposed to pay? 25 Α. And here we are, yes.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Cross/Tomsky 26

1	Q. I guess I could say the same thing, right?
2	THE COURT: Again, counsel, this probably is a
3	little bit directed at you, please keep your comments
4	and opinions to yourself. That can be taken care of
5	when we conclude the case in post trial memos. Please
6	just answer the questions.
7	THE WITNESS: I apologize.
8	THE COURT: The editorializing is not
9	something that I want.
10	MR. TOMSKY: Sorry, your Honor. If the jury
11	was here
12	THE COURT: If the jury was here, I probably
13	would have given them a curative instruction on that.
14	Q. So I just want to go back to this a little bit.
15	This demand for appraisal was not signed because there was an
16	actual disagreement with the appraisal at the time she signed
17	it, correct?
18	A. No. It relates back to the other Exhibit-11 where
19	we prepare the customer of all their rights, every right they
20	may have during the repair process, and it's one of their
21	rights.
22	Q. So this is one of their rights, so even though it
23	says it doesn't say we might be dissatisfied, it says we
24	are dissatisfied. She signed that before any estimate or
25	appraisal was ever done, correct?

COUNTY CLERK 03/22/2019 03:17 PM NASSAU

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Redirect/Klein 27

1 Α. But it's relevant because State Farm does not honor 2 the right to appraisal. 3 MR. TOMSKY: I'm going to object. He's not being responsive. I ask that it be stricken. 4 5 THE WITNESS: Okay. 6 THE COURT: Listen carefully to the questions 7 and answer them. It's not your job to argue the case. 8 I understand that you want to advocate for your 9 employer. It's admirable in terms of your relationship 10 with your employer. THE WITNESS: I understand. 11 12 THE COURT: It's not admirable in the 13 courtroom. 14 THE WITNESS: Understood. I'm sorry, the 15 question again. I apologize. 16 THE COURT: Would you read that back, Pat, 17 please? 18 (The requested portion was read.) 19 Α. Correct. 20 MR. TOMSKY: I have nothing further. Thank 21 you. Thank you for your cooperation, sir. 22 THE COURT: Thank you. Mr. Klein, any redirect? 23 24 MR. KLEIN: Yes, briefly, your Honor. 25 REDIRECT EXAMINATION

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

2

3

25

Brian McGauvran - Redirect/Klein

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 BY	MR.	KLEIN:
------	-----	--------

Q. Good morning, Mr. McGauvran.

A. Good morning.

Q. Mr. Tomsky asked you some questions concerning the
gross amount of money that State Farm had paid in this case.
What is your assessment of why the bill became as large as it
was?

Once the insurance carrier decided that the car 8 Α. 9 would be repairable, the repairs were commenced. Now, once 10 you repair a car and it exceeds the 75 percent, because the 11 insurance company now becomes responsible for the repairs 12 already done and responsible for taking possession of a total 13 loss salvaged vehicle and paying off the lienholder because 14 the lienholder will not accept the lien on a salvaged 15 vehicle, so the car can no longer be returned to the 16 consumer, it has to be salvaged, the lienholder has to be 17 paid off in full because they will not hold notes on a 18 totaled car. So, as a result of State Farm repairing a total 19 loss, they now become responsible for paying off the repairs 20 and paying off the lien.

Q. So until the insurance company declares the cartotal, what is Mid Island's obligation?

A. To repair the car to its pre-loss condition for theconsumer.

Q. And when did Mid Island initially inform State Farm

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Redirect/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 that it believed the car should be declared a total loss, and 2 if you don't know, you could describe to the best of your recollection? 3 4 Α. On or about the second reinspection by Mike 5 Thompson. 6 0. How many reinspections were there? 7 No less than 10. Α. If State Farm had declared the car a total loss 8 Q. 9 when Mid Island said so, what would have happened to the bill 10 that Mr. Tomsky was just complaining about? 11 MR. TOMSKY: I object, your Honor. He already 12 testified to this on his regular direct. 13 THE COURT: Yes, but I would like it 14 clarified. What was the -- in terms of dollars, what 15 was the amount of work that had been performed at the 16 time Mid Island recommended totalling the vehicle? 17 THE WITNESS: At the time the recommendation 18 was made, the only expense was for a standard 19 disassembly, towing, and storage as of that date, so it 20 was very minor. The bill would probably have been less than 2,000, \$2,500. 21 22 So to be clear and not to revisit anything, if Q. State Farm had acquiesced, how much money would State Farm 23 24 have been obligated to pay, to the best of your 25 understanding?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Redirect/Klein

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 MR. TOMSKY: Again, I'll object. It calls for 2 speculation. It's also been asked and answered 3 THE COURT: 4 by me. 5 Ο. You mentioned on cross-examination a moment ago that the demand for appraisal was predictable. 6 Why was it 7 predictable that this would be appropriate? We prepare our customers for all options when they 8 Α. come in for expedition to make sure they don't have to keep 9 10 coming back, so we have all documents ready in advance. 11 What I mean is, is this the only car that you have Ο. 12 had the occasion to be working with State Farm on? 13 Α. Well, no. If you have the same result where they 14 don't negotiate the claims when they come through the office, 15 you get used to the same pattern and you prepare for that 16 pattern. 17 Q. How often do you see State Farm on a monthly basis? 18 Everyday. Α. 19 Have their labor rates or their labor rate --Q. 20 withdrawn. 21 Where is Mid Island's labor rate posted in Mid 22 Island? 23 Right where the adjustor sits. He faces it. Α. 24 Do they ever come in and say -- withdrawn. Ο. 25 The demand for appraisal, as Mr. Tomsky pointed

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Redirect/Klein 31

1	out, is dated the 17th, and that was incorrect, right?
2	A. Yes.
3	Q. How do you know what date it was actually signed?
4	A. Because I did that paperwork. It was all done the
5	same day, but I'm ADD so when I write, sometimes I write the
б	numbers wrong, so I skipped the 28th, wrote 3-17 and then 17
7	again. I do that often.
8	Q. So Ms. Pope was at Mid Island that day?
9	A. Yes, with me.
10	Q. Did she drive her Nissan to Mid Island that day?
11	A. It was towed.
12	Q. And so she didn't come in her Nissan?
13	A. No.
14	Q. How did she get there?
15	A. I do not know.
16	Q. But you know that it wasn't in her own vehicle?
17	A. Correct.
18	Q. Mr. Tomsky asked you some questions about Auto
19	Haus, Mid Island Collision. Are those separate entities?
20	A. Two totally separate companies.
21	Q. Does Mid Island Collision give any special
22	privileges in its markup for Auto Haus versus anybody else?
23	A. The same.
24	Q. So any special privileges?
25	A. None.

SSAU COUNTY CLERK 03/22/2019 03:17 \mathbf{PM}

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Redirect/Klein 32

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1 Ο. Was Ms. Pope aware that Mid Island had paid for some or all of a rental bill? 2 3 Α. Yes. MR. TOMSKY: Objection. 4 5 I'm going to allow it. THE COURT: 6 Ο. When you sent the final bill, at that time, who 7 owed you, and when I say "you," Mid Island, who owed Mid 8 Island that money? 9 Α. Ms. Pope. 10 MR. TOMSKY: I believe that's a 11 mischaracterization as he previously testified that 12 Ms. Pope owed them nothing. 13 MR. KLEIN: That was not his testimony. The 14 testimony was that she owed him nothing once there was 15 an assignment. 16 Correct, and the assignment was THE COURT: 17 made, and, therefore, all she would be responsible for 18 was a deductible. I think that's pretty clear. It's 19 been brought out a number of different ways. 20 To the best of your understanding, Mr. McGauvran, Ο. who was it who owed Mid Island money, if anybody, when the 21 final bill was issued? 22 23 Α. When I completed the final bill, Ms. Pope owed us 24 the balance. 25 Ο. And was there any privity of contract between Mid

COUNTY CLERK 03/22/2019 03:17 PM NASSAU

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Brian McGauvran - Recross/Tomsky 33

Island Collision and State Farm? 1 2 MR. TOMSKY: I object. 3 THE COURT: That's sustained. Is there any contract that you're aware of between 4 Ο. 5 Mid Island and State Farm in connection with Ms. Pope's 6 vehicle? 7 Α. No. The lawsuit that Mr. Tomsky asked you about in 8 Q. which Mid Island is a plaintiff, is it acting in any special 9 10 capacity? 11 THE COURT: Sustained. 12 No further questions. MR. KLEIN: 13 THE COURT: Thank you. Any recross? 14 MR. TOMSKY: Very briefly. 15 RECROSS EXAMINATION 16 BY MR. TOMSKY: 17 Q. As of October 2018, I'll go back a month or so, 18 approximately, how many cases that you know of -- withdrawn. 19 I'll rephrase it. 20 Approximately, how many lawsuits has M.V.B. been 21 involved in for breach of contract with insurance companies 22 as of October 2018? 23 MR. KLEIN: Objection. 24 THE COURT: Also sustained. 25 MR. TOMSKY: Nothing further.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Brian McGauvran - Recross/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 THE COURT: Okay, thank you. All right, you 2 are excused. Thank you very much. 3 THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Honor. Ι 4 apologize again. 5 THE COURT: Okay, do we want to start the next 6 witness? 7 MR. KLEIN: Yes. 8 MR. TOMSKY: I believe we can get him done 9 this morning. 10 THE COURT: Let's just take five minutes. 11 (A recess was taken.) 12 THE COURT: Okay, are we ready? 13 MR. KLEIN: May I? 14 THE COURT: Please. 15 COURT CLERK: Please remain standing. Raise 16 your right hand. 17 Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the 18 testimony you're about to give in this case on trial 19 shall be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the 20 truth, so help you God? 21 THE WITNESS: Yes. 22 COURT CLERK: You can have a seat. 23 Please state and spell your first and last 24 name and state your address. 25 THE WITNESS: Lawrence Montanez, III,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 35

M-O-N-T-A-N-E-Z. The address is 893 Catapala Drive, 1 2 Franklin Square, New York 11010. 3 THE COURT: All right, you may inquire. 4 DIRECT EXAMINATION 5 BY MR. KLEIN: 6 0. Good afternoon, Mr. Montanez. How are you? 7 Α. Good. 8 Where do you work? Q. 9 Α. I'm self-employed. 10 What's the name of -- do you work at a company? Ο. 11 Α. I own a company. 12 What's the name of the company? 0. 13 Α. P&L Consultants, LLC. 14 What do you do at P&L Consultants? Q. 15 I consult for collision repair companies and I also Α. 16 teach classes to collision repair and industry personnel, 17 shop owners, technicians. 18 How long have you been working as a consultant to 0. 19 other members of the industry? 20 Α. Since 2001. 21 Ο. And how did you get into that line of work? 22 I was teaching classes for the Inter-Industry Α. 23 Conference on Auto Collision Repair. The acronym is I-CAR, 24 I, hyphen, C-A-R, and at the time I was working at a shop and 25 I was teaching classes back in 2001 and I decided that I

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

1

9 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 36
could offer some other services, like a part-time job,
besides my work at the shop to assist in collision education
furthering the knowledge of these advanced vehicles that were
coming up at the time back in 2001, which is how I met Jeff

2	besides my work at the shop to assist in collision education
3	furthering the knowledge of these advanced vehicles that were
4	coming up at the time back in 2001, which is how I met Jeff
5	Lange who I also worked for doing forensic engineering, I do
б	fraud investigations and accident reconstruction with him.
7	Q. In connection with your I-CAR teaching, how many
8	students do you have or did you have on a yearly basis?
9	A. Well, back when I worked for I-CAR from 2001 to
10	2009 I averaged about 9,300 student units a year, which
11	sometimes I wound up with multiple attendees being the same
12	person, so that 9,300, probably about if I had to guess,
13	probably about 5,500, 6,000 different students of that 93,
14	9,400.
15	Q. Who were your students?
16	A. Insurance personnel, body shop personnel. That's
17	who had to take the classes.
18	Q. Did you ever have a student by the name of James
19	Rice?
20	A. Yes, I have.
21	Q. Where does he work?
22	A. He works for State Farm Insurance Company.
23	Q. Did you ever have a student by the name of Michael
24	Thiele?
25	A. Yes, I have.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Lawrence Mon

ntanez,	III	_	 RECEIVED Direct/Klein	NYSCEF:	03/22/2 37	2019

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	Q. Where does he work?
2	A. Also for State Farm Insurance Company.
3	Q. What did you do that qualified you to become a
4	teacher to so many students in that industry?
5	A. I had to go through a training course with I-CAR
6	for a week on presentation, get peer reviewed by instructors
7	that have been around for a while who got chosen to be the
8	people who approve new instructors, and then I had to work
9	with an instructor by the name of Peter Pratti who is at
10	the time was Progressive's national claims manager and he was
11	stationed out of Long Island and he was the only instructor
12	in the area and I had to work with him for six months before
13	he signed off on me. So, all together, I would say it's
14	probably about seven months worth of training and myself and
15	Pete Pratti became such good friends that Pete Pratti is the
16	P of the P&L. It's Pete & Larry Consultants. So I became
17	very good friends with the national claims manager of
18	Progressive.
19	Q. How long have you been working in the auto body
20	industry or in connection with the auto body industry?
21	A. Well, when I graduated high school I went to Penn
22	State for about three months, so I would say from the time I
23	was 14 going to high school, the mechanic/body man that my
24	parents knew had a shop a few blocks from my high school and
25	I would go there and work after school as like an after

37 of 160

1	school job, so from 14 to 18 I worked at his shop, and then I		
2	went to college for a few months and didn't think it was for		
3	me. I played football for a while, didn't think that was for		
4	me either, and I came back to New York and I started working		
5	in the collision repair field and I started, you know, like a		
6	lot of other people start, just buffing cars, cleaning them		
7	and learning on the job.		
8	Q. Approximately, what year was that that you settled		
9	into New York?		
10	A. '87.		
11	Q. Have you been working consistently in New York		
12	since that time?		
13	A. Well, I worked for collision repair shops up until		
14	about 2005 in New York, and then I got affiliated with a shop		
15	in New Jersey, Ramsey, New Jersey, but really my job takes me		
16	all over the country between the collision hub repair,		
17	university TV show that we do once a month, the training		
18	courses I do throughout the year, consulting for shops, I'm		
19	all over the country really.		
20	MR. KLEIN: Your Honor, I don't think that		
21	there is any dispute from my adversary as to him		
22	qualifying him as an expert.		
23	THE COURT: All right, we will deem him an		
24	expert witness.		
25	Q. Mr. Montanez, is Mid Island Collision one of your		

1

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

customers?

2	A. I guess you could call them a customer. They're
3	more of a client I classify them as. They're a client of
4	mine. I have a few select clients over the United States.
5	Q. Who are some of your other clients?
6	A. Exclusive Auto Collision, Providence Auto Body, K&M
7	Collision down in North Carolina. Exclusive, I'm sorry, is
8	in New Jersey. Providence is, obviously, in Providence,
9	Rhode Island, and then I've done some work for D.C. Auto
10	Craft out in California. They have three locations.
11	The common denominator is they're all certified by
12	the German equipment manufacturers, basically Audi, Benz,
13	Porsche, Land Rover, Jaguar, Tesla, basically those
14	companies. They really need me for their aluminum repair
15	programs to help them and assist them.
16	Q. How common is it for an auto body or collision
17	company to have those types of certifications?
18	A. For the German companies, it's not that not that
19	common. It's you have to have a relationship with a
20	dealership. The dealers are only allowed to sponsor either
21	one or two shops. That would be inclusive of their own shop,
22	if they have one. Most of the Metropolitan city dealerships
23	don't have body shops. It's not cost-effective. There's
24	enough shops in the area, but it is a select group of people
25	that can do those aluminum high-end cars.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 40

1 Ο. What type of work have you performed for Mid Island 2 Collision in a consulting capacity? 3 Α. I've gone over estimate reviews, I've done post and 4 pre repair inspections of vehicles, in process inspection of vehicles. I've actually covered the shop a couple of times 5 6 when Mr. Jesberger and Mr. McGauvran were away on vacation 7 basically making sure that, you know, the shop ran okay and, 8 you know, covered for a day or two and taken care of 9 customers and be able to help them write estimates for the 10 personnel that are there. 11 I would like to show the witness what's been marked 0. 12 Exhibit-E, the final bill. I believe the Court has a copy of 13 this exhibit already. 14 I do. You're talking about the THE COURT: 15 M.V.B. final bill? 16 MR. KLEIN: Correct. 17COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness. 18 What is that document, Mr. Montanez? Ο. 19 It's a final bill from Mid Island Collision for Α. 20 repair to a vehicle. 21 Have you reviewed this final bill in advance of Ο. 22 your testimony here today? 23 May I look at it? Α. 24 Ο. Yes. 25 Α. Yes, I have.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 41

Ο. And there is an entry on that final bill pertaining to a company by the name of Auto Haus; is that right? You're referring to line 108? Α. Ο. Correct. That says Auto Haus. Α. Ο. I would like to show the witness Exhibit-F as an accompanying exhibit, please, and, again, I believe the Court has that exhibit. THE COURT: That's the Auto Haus bill? MR. KLEIN: Yes. COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness. Mr. Montanez, most broadly, are there any items on Ο. Mid Island's final bill that were in your judgment not necessary to repair the car to pre-loss condition? When I went over the bill and looked over it, no, I Α. didn't find anything that was unnecessary. I actually found a few items that they probably could have charged for that they didn't put on there. There is an entry on the Auto Haus bill that has Q. been placed at issue by the parties, item number 23 on the Auto Haus bill. It says wheels, alloy aluminum, 20 inch. Α. It's listing two as a quantity for \$1,823.76. That would be for the two rims together and point three for labor time to put it on, three tenths of an hour.

1	Q. What side of the Nissan was initially collided
2	into, as far as you know?
3	A. The left rear was impacted.
4	Q. So why would there be more than one wheel that
5	would need to be repaired?
6	A. My understanding is that, it was explained to me
7	that the car impacted something on the right-hand side.
8	Q. Why would that happen? How could that happen?
9	A. The applied impact forces and the angle in which
10	the bullet vehicle impacted the target vehicle would induce
11	the vehicle forward and towards the right.
12	Q. And so what could what are some of the risks
13	associated with only fixing the immediate wheel that is hit?
14	If you would like me to rephrase that, I can.
15	MR. TOMSKY: I was going to object to calling
16	for speculation.
17	THE COURT: I would like you to.
18	Q. So why was it appropriate to fix two wheels rather
19	than one in terms of the safety of this vehicle?
20	MR. TOMSKY: Objection.
21	THE COURT: Overruled.
22	A. It was related to the incident. If it's part of
23	the incident and the insurance company accepts the liability
24	for it, then it's part of the claim. Some of the other rims
25	on the vehicle had some light scratches on it from parking,

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

RECEIVED NYSCEF:03/22/2019Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein43

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

which were not part of the incident. Light, little scrapes or anything like that wouldn't be part of the incident, but something that's fresh, such as the damage on this rim would be related to this incident in question. Ο. And describe in terms of the safety of operating this car, if that other wheel had not been fixed --MR. TOMSKY: Again, calls for speculation. Well, as an expert, I'm going to THE COURT: allow him to testify as to that, but I'm somewhat confused now. What you call the target wheel was on the passenger side in the rear? THE WITNESS: Correct. MR. KLEIN: The driver's side? THE WITNESS: The driver's side was the impact wheel, so this is the left side of the vehicle. This is the right. A vehicle came in this way and hit it, and as you hit it, you're going to push the vehicle somewhat this way and it hit maybe the curb on the opposite side or the roadway, something in the roadway that did damage to the wheel. THE COURT: When did you inspect this car? THE WITNESS: During the repair process when it was first there, when it was first taken apart. THE COURT: What was the nature of the damage

ph

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 44

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	to that wheel on the passenger side?
2	THE WITNESS: That was a gauge and a scrape,
3	somewhat of a semi longitudinal scrape to it.
4	THE COURT: Okay, thank you. You can proceed.
5	Q. Mr. Montanez, so was that wheel repaired?
6	A. You can't repair a wheel.
7	Q. I'm sorry, was that wheel the subject of work
8	performed by Mid Island Collision on this car?
9	A. No. It was the subject of work completed by Auto
10	Haus. Auto Haus charged for it. Mid Island might have
11	ordered the part or Auto Haus might have ordered the part for
12	Mid Island, I'm not sure how that actually worked, but I have
13	a bill here from Auto Haus saying they purchased the rim and
14	installed it.
15	Q. And then the Auto Haus bill became a part of the
16	final bill, is that what your understanding of the
17	relationship between those bills is?
18	A. Generally, how I would teach it and how
19	Mr. Jesberger or Mr. McGauvran was following what I've always
20	trained people to do, and I'm assuming that they took my lead
21	on this, is they have a sublet bill, which is Exhibit-F, and
22	they listed the total cost on Exhibit-E on their final bill.
23	The attached bill would be from Auto Haus, a separate bill.
24	Q. With a markup?
25	A. With a markup, yes.

1

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 45

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

Ο. Why is a markup appropriate?

Well, a markup is a company is laying out money to 2 Α. another company because they either, you know, don't have the 3 4 equipment to do that type of repair, they don't have the 5 skill to do that type of repair, they don't -- in some cases 6 it's not cost-effective to have the equipment to do that type 7 of repair, and -- or the time limits on it. You know, it all 8 depends on different things, so when you do sublet, you're laying money out of your pocket and you have to keep the 9 warranty on it because you're really the general 10 11 subcontractor, you're subletting to somebody else who is a 12 subcontractor. Still Mr. Jesberger's liability for his 13 company, so he has to cover that.

14 Q. How common is it to have markups for sublet work? 15 On every sublet bill I've ever seen, anywhere from Α. 16 the construction field, aeronautic field, towing field or the 17 collision repair field there is a markup on it.

18 And is a 25 percent or a 33 percent markup, how 0. 19 does that compare to what you've seen in the industry? 20 Α. That would be based solely on what the shop or the

21 owner of the particular facility wants to markup their stuff. 22 I've -- I used to do glazier work and I know glass was marked 23 up like 300 percent. It was ridiculous. You know, in case 24 you broke it, you would be able to put in glass. Glass is 25 fairly cheap.

1	THE COURT: Mr. Montanez, please confine your
2	testimony to the collision industry, and, Pat, would you
3	read the question back because we went far afield with
4	that answer.
5	(The requested portion was read.)
6	A. It's around the same amount of markup. I've seen
7	anywhere between 15 to 40 percent markup, so I would say that
8	would be in the average area.
9	THE COURT: Thank you.
10	THE WITNESS: You're welcome, your Honor.
11	Q. Now, you testified that the final bill, I believe
12	you testified that the final bill represented what was
13	necessary for repairing the vehicle. On the final bill, can
14	you describe what the labor rate is or please describe what
15	the labor rate is?
16	A. I have to look at the it's listed here as \$120
17	per labor hour.
18	Q. And why would \$120 an hour be necessary for
19	repairing the car to pre-loss condition in this case?
20	MR. TOMSKY: Objection.
21	THE COURT: Sustained. Would you rephrase,
22	please?
23	MR. KLEIN: Sure.
24	Q. You testified that the final bill reflects work
25	that was necessary for repairing this vehicle, correct?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 47 Α. Yes. Now, was that labor rate part of that determination Ο. that you made of necessity? Yes. I go over the entire bill, inclusive of the Α. labor procedures, description of the procedures, any notes that might be on there, the amount of time that's charged that might be judgemental versus what's actually in the database as a standard time, and also the labor rates. Ι also check the tax a lot of times too to make sure it's the right tax. Why was \$120 an hour in your assessment reasonable 0. or necessary in this case? Objection. MR. TOMSKY: THE COURT: Overruled. I believe that 120 an hour for that vehicle is a Α. reasonable amount of money to charge for that, and working with Mid Island, I know their labor rates on different

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

18 vehicles, you know, either being aluminum or regular steel 19 vehicles, and that's around the area they charge for steel 20 vehicles.

Q. Can you briefly describe what was required torepair this vehicle and the complexity?

A. Well, the vehicle had sustained damage to the upper
body, which is unitized structure that's attached or affixed
or bolted to a full frame, steel, high strength steel frame.

1	There were the vehicle sustained structural damage to the		
2	left rear quarter panel, the door assembly, the attaching		
3	floor panel in the rear, the outer wheel house, the inner		
4	wheel house, suspension components, obviously the wheel in		
5	that area, and then also caused damage to the wheel in the		
6	opposite side as secondary damage, and there was some		
7	structural damage to the frame also in this particular case.		
8	Q. So why couldn't this be done at \$49 an hour?		
9	MR. TOMSKY: Objection, calls for speculation.		
10	THE COURT: Sustained.		
11	Q. Mr. Montanez, are you familiar with how Mid Island		
12	Collision determined its \$120 labor rate?		
13	A. I was part of the team that came up with that		
14	number.		
15	Q. How long ago was that number come up with?		
16	A. I believe it was about five years ago.		
17	Q. Where did that was that at a gathering?		
18	A. We had a meeting at Mid Island Collision.		
19	Q. Where at Mid Island Collision?		
20	A. There is an upstairs conference room.		
21	Q. Describe what the conference room looks like,		
22	please.		
23	MR. TOMSKY: Objection to relevance.		
24	THE COURT: Sustained.		
25	Q. And when you left that meeting, and don't say		

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 49

1 anything about statements other people made at that meeting, 2 but when you left that meeting, what was your understanding of whether Mid Island Collision could survive charging \$49 an 3 4 hour? 5 MR. TOMSKY: I'll object to that. 6 THE COURT: Sustained. That's outside the 7 scope of the witness' expertise. 8 MR. KLEIN: I'm asking him now as a fact witness because he was present for that. 9 10 THE COURT: As a fact witness, how would he 11 know whether the rate would make the business itself 12 sustainable? 13 Because he was -- could I ask him MR. KLEIN: 14 more about that? 15 Sure, please. THE COURT: 16 Mr. Montanez, could you describe some of the Q. 17 discussions that led to the \$120 an hour labor rate 18 determination at that meeting? 19 Α. I was asked to find out what the investment is for 20 the equipment within Mid Island Collision for not only steel 21 or to operate a steel, predominantly steel repair facility 22 but also what it would cost to operate an aluminum intensive 23 vehicle repair facility. Additionally, I had to find out the 24 cost of the spray booths. I had to come up with the cost of 25 what the paint on average costs per all the vehicles they

ph

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 50

1	work on in the shop. I had to also call up Mr. Jesberger's
2	hazardous waste companies that come in to retrieve oils, dry
3	hazardous waste and even wet hazardous waste, calculate that.
4	Also, I had to take into account the training that they have
5	to go through for each one of the programs, come up with an
6	average cost for this OEM training that they have to go to
7	multiple times throughout the year, and a lot of that was
8	what I used to write a white paper for the aluminum
9	association was actually all derived from the investigation I
10	did for the team for Mr. Jesberger to calculate what this
11	labor rate would need to be or what a break even point would
12	be and what his profitability area would have to be to have
13	his labor rate at.
14	Q. Okay, based upon those discussions, what was your
15	understanding of whether Mid Island Collision could charge
16	\$49 an hour for labor?
17	MR. TOMSKY: Same objection.
18	THE COURT: Overruled.
19	A. We found that I believe the number was 86.75 was
20	a break even, I basically can be open but be broke and not
21	make a dime, so it would be out of the goodness of his heart
22	he would just keep the store open and not make a dollar off
23	of it. So there had to be a profitability built into that
24	along with we had to take into account technicians, what they
25	cost the shop working there, and that became a little

ph

1	surprising, when they found out what the tech actually cost			
2	when you include their uniform allowance, some tool			
3	allowance, the vacations, health insurance, sick days, and			
4	then of course the loss of the employee when they have to go			
5	away for a week to two weeks for this intensive OEM training.			
б	Q. Are you familiar with other auto body shops on Long			
7	Island?			
8	A. Yes.			
9	Q. And you've been working on Long Island on and off			
10	for how long again?			
11	A. About 20 years.			
12	Q. How many auto body shops would you say that you			
13	have come into contact with over those 20 years?			
14	A. On Long Island or total?			
15	Q. Let's start with Long Island.			
16	A. Long Island, probably about 300, because of			
17	meetings I've talked at, but consulting wise, I probably			
18	dealt with maybe 15 shops in that time period who actually			
19	hired me for specific work not just generalized meetings.			
20	Q. Is Mid Island middle of the pack of those 300 auto			
21	body shops?			
22	MR. TOMSKY: Objection to the phrase "middle			
23	of the pack."			
24	THE COURT: Sustained.			
25	Q. How does Mid Island Collision compare to the other			

COUNTY CLERK 03/22/2019 03:17 \mathbf{PM}

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

5

6

9

11

25

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein 52

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1 auto body shops that you have seen? They're probably in a select group of only about 2 Α. 3 five shops in all of Long Island. 4 How about in New York State? Ο. MR. TOMSKY: Select shops of what? Ο. What do you mean by "select shops"? 7 Select shops of having the proper training, Α. 8 equipment and certifications to repair vehicles, have gone through the aluminum training programs that are out there, 10 the stringent European requirements to stay on these programs. 12 How does it compare in terms of the overall quality 0. 13 of the work provided to customers? 14 Α. They're in the top five percent of the country of, 15 you know, collision repair. I do probably three to 500, 16 depending on the year, post repair inspections. A lot of 17 them are photo reviews, and the work I see from certain shops 18 is far superior to the average work at other shops. It's 19 almost like they don't know they're not doing it the correct 20 way in some cases. 21 Ο. At some of the other shops that you're describing, 22 what have you seen happen when a vehicle gets repaired on the 23 cheap? 24 MR. TOMSKY: Objection to relevance.

> THE COURT: Sustained.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Lawrence Montanez, III - Direct/Klein

PM	INDEX NO.	606797/2017
	VED NYSCEF	: 03/22/2019 53

1	MR. KLEIN: One moment, your Honor.
2	Q. Mr. Montanez, just a few more questions. Please
3	describe the difference with some specificity in the type of
4	work performed on a car by Mid Island versus a car type of
5	work that would be performed at a shop that charges \$49 and
6	hour?
7	MR. TOMSKY: I will object to that as well.
8	THE COURT: I'm going to allow it.
9	A. What I've seen on average is when you have less of
10	a labor rate, and this goes to not only hourly paid employees
11	but also the commission based or what they call flat rate
12	where a technician gets a portion of the labor rate to repair
13	the car, corners are cut, they try and rush it through,
14	because, obviously, if you're on a flat rate, the more work
15	you get through the more money you get paid, you get paid on
16	commission, so if I can jockey around or move around stuff, I
17	can actually, you know, get more get paid more money and I
18	have to cut corners someplace.
19	With a lower labor rate, obviously the shop has an
20	hourly rate shop. Let's say they're paying their technicians
21	a certain amount of money every hour to be there. They're
22	going to try and force more work out of the shop to,
23	obviously, make more profit, which is what we're seeing
24	nowadays. We are teaching a lot or speaking a lot at
25	meetings, it's the busy but broke idea, meaning I have a lot

of work moving in and out of the shop, I have money moving in
and out but the second work slows up I realize I'm broke
because that money isn't flowing through anymore, bills are
catching up to me, so it does become an issue. Money or
labor rate per hour does relate to how much time I can put
into the vehicle which leads to quality.
Q. Now, with your expertise in the industry, you know
it would be a struggle to make a living at \$49 an hour, why
would you accept \$49 an hour?
MR. TOMSKY: Objection.
THE COURT: Sustained.
Q. What is your understanding of the role that
insurance companies, large insurance companies play in the
labor rate accepted by smaller repair companies?
A. Insurance company has no say in the matter, on what
the labor rate can be, unless you're on their direct repair
program. Then it's a contractual agreement between you and
the insurance company. But if you're not on their direct
repair program, you charge whatever you feel is necessary and
that your market, meaning the consumer, can afford, not what
somebody, third-party that's uninterested wants to say or
wants to payout. That's not a contract between the insurance
company and the shop. Mr. Jesberger has no direct repair
programs or insurance companies. So if I bring my car to
Mr. Jesberger and I'm covered by ABC Insurance, ABC Insurance

1	has no contract with Mr. Jesberger, I'm the only one who can	
2	approve the labor rates, the repair procedures or anything	
3	else. The insurance company is there to indemnify the claim	
4	and they have to put a certain amount of money in the fund	
5	for the state.	
6	Q. So describe how a direct repair company differs in	
7	that respect?	
8	A. Well, they make an agreement like a health	
9	insurance type of thing with a doctor, I'll accept your	
10	insurance and whatever they pay me they pay me, but in some	
11	cases, even with an HMO or health insurance company, you	
12	still get a bill in the mail that they're not covering.	
13	Q. Try to limit your testimony to this industry.	
14	Okay? I know you're trying to be helpful.	
15	A. Okay.	
16	Q. What is more common, an auto body shop that is a	
17	direct repair company or an auto body shop like Mid Island?	
18	A. Well, Mid Island would not be common at all because	
19	they specialize in a select group of vehicles, because their	
20	relationship with not only the consumer but demographically	
21	the dealerships in their area and the types of cars that they	
22	work on versus other shops that will get work directed	
23	towards them as far as a direct repair program and they'll	
24	see a wide range of vehicles.	
25	Q. What do you mean by "directed toward them"?	

1	A. The insurance company will the consumer will
2	call up and the insurance company will offer, if the
3	consumers asks for it, or sometimes they offer you can bring
4	it to other direct repair facilities, you can bring it to a
5	drive-in facility. There's a drive-in facility up the block
6	from Mr. Jesberger, and there's been times cars have left
7	that place and came directly to Mid Island because they
8	weren't able to repair that vehicle. They couldn't buy the
9	parts.
10	THE COURT: Again, Mr. Montanez, please don't
11	add comments. Listen to the question and answer the
12	question.
13	THE WITNESS: Sorry, your Honor. Yes.
14	MR. KLEIN: No further questions at this time.
15	Thank you.
16	MR. TOMSKY: I have very few questions, if we
17	could finish him before lunch.
18	THE COURT: Yes. You may inquire.
19	CROSS EXAMINATION
20	BY MR. TOMSKY:
21	Q. Good afternoon, Mr. Montanez. How are you? My
22	name is Michael Tomsky. I work at Rubin, Fiorella &
23	Friedman. We are State Farm's attorney in this matter.
24	I believe you do work for State Farm as well,
25	correct?

I

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Cross/Tomsky 57

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	A. I've done a lot of work for State Farm.		
2	Q. A couple things, you mentioned that you were		
3	involved in creating a labor rate for Mid Island, correct?		
4	A. I was part of the team that came up with them, yes.		
5	Q. In the conference room that we didn't get to		
6	describe?		
7	A. Correct.		
8	Q. Are you aware that the posted labor rate in the		
9	shop is \$120?		
10	A. It's \$120, I think, for steel vehicles, and I'm		
11	trying to remember I remember helping them set that up,		
12	and I believe for boron, aluminum, magnesium, I believe it's		
13	175.		
14	Q. Are you aware only if you are, are you aware		
15	that the person who was involved in the collision, Ms. Pope,		
16	agreed to the \$120 labor rate before any estimate by State		
17	Farm or Mid Island was made?		
18	A. I would believe that should be proper because it's		
19	under CR 82 of the New York State DMV law that requires the		
20	shop to let the consumer know what the rates are before they		
21	start repairs.		
22	THE COURT: All right, I'm not that answer		
23	is stricken.		
24	Pat, would you read the question back, please?		
25	(The requested portion was read.)		

1	THE COURT: You can answer that, if you can.
2	Q. If you are aware of an agreement.
3	THE COURT: Counsel.
4	MR. TOMSKY: I apologize.
5	A. To my knowledge, that's what Mid Island should be
6	doing on every single case.
7	THE COURT: Strike that. Do you know if that
8	was done in this case?
9	THE WITNESS: No, I do not know.
10	THE COURT: Thank you.
11	THE WITNESS: Sorry, your Honor.
12	Q. You indicated that there's profitability margins.
13	It obviously makes sense that the higher the labor rate the
14	more money you would make for the same work, correct?
15	A. Obviously, yes. That's math.
16	Q. If I charge 120 versus \$140, you'll make more money
17	with the 140?
18	A. Correct.
19	Q. That goes to the profitability of the shop,
20	correct, the amount of money you charge for the labor rate?
21	A. Correct, yes.
22	Q. You mentioned that you taught Mr. Rice and taught
23	Mr. Thiele at one of your was it a lecture or conference
24	or a class?
25	A. It's classes, I-CAR, the Inter-Industry Conference

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Cross/Tomsky 59

on Auto Collision Repair, teaches a course on a wide range of
subjects. Sometimes they're specific such as aluminum body
repair or aluminum structure repair or steel repair or just
structural damage. Sometimes it's diagnosis. Part of State
Farm's, I guess, job title at the time was that the not
the technicians, I'm sorry, the adjusters to keep their jobs
or have their jobs had to go ongoing training not required by
the state but by State Farm, and there would be four-hour
sessions we would do and we usually do it, as a matter of
fact, not too far from here. They had a drive-in center
across from the mall over here by McDonald's on Stewart
Avenue.
Q. How many sessions do you do for something like that
with Mr. Rice and Mr. Thiele, how many sessions would you
provide to them?
A. We would do a clip of about nine of them and then
take off, let's say, for the summer and in the fall might do
three or four more. They had a certain amount to keep what
they call a gold class designation or individual platinum
they call a gold class designation or individual platinum
they call a gold class designation or individual platinum designation, so they had to get a certain amount of classes
they call a gold class designation or individual platinum designation, so they had to get a certain amount of classes upfront, let's say like 10, and every year they had to take

Q. I would imagine that the point of these trainings

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Redirect/Klein 60

1 and these sessions is to improve the quality of the work and 2 the quality of the estimates done by the State Farm team, 3 correct? 4 Well, they don't perform work, but yes, increase Α. 5 their education on what would be required in a shop, so yes 6 to that point. You think you did a good job teaching that? 7 0. I believe I did. 8 Α. So you think you did a good job teaching Mr. Rice 9 0. 10 and Mr. Thiele, right? 11 I believe they understood what I said, and we've Α. 12 had conversations. 13 Thanks. Nothing further. MR. TOMSKY: 14 THE COURT: Mr. Klein. 15 Very brief. MR. KLEIN: 16 REDIRECT EXAMINATION 17BY MR. KLEIN: 18 Mr. Montanez, what is your understanding of when it 0. 19 is proper for an auto body shop to enter into an agreement 20 with a customer over a labor rate? I believe the time they introduce the paperwork 21 Α. 22 for -- in New York State you have to get a designated 23 representative signature to be able to represent them. 24 Just answer the question. Ο. 25 Α. My understanding would be at the beginning of the

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Lawrence Montanez, III - Redirect/Klein 61

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1 paperwork.

2	Q. Before, during or after the work is commenced?
3	A. It would have to be before the work commences. I
4	mean, it's the only time that the customer is there, to drop
5	off the car and again to pick up the car, so the first time
6	is when they first bring the car to the shop you would
7	explain the paperwork, have them sign it and explain to them
8	what your rates are and your storage fees and anything else.
9	Q. A moment ago Mr. Tomsky asked you about whether you
10	did whether you're happy with the job you did with your
11	students, Mr. Thiele and Mr. Rice. Did you provide any
12	actual hands-on training to them?
13	A. No, not in those classes. Those were not hands-on
14	training classes. They were more of a classroom lecture type
15	of thing, and then there was a fill-in sheet. You know, you
16	have to fill in one or two words and certain paragraphs, and
17	there would be an open book test at the end, is how I-CAR
18	runs their classes.
19	MR. KLEIN: Thank you. No further questions.
20	MR. TOMSKY: No recross.
21	THE COURT: Thank you. You're excused.
22	All right, let's recess until about 2:15.
23	MR. TOMSKY: Just so we're clear, we are going
24	to go we will be a bit out of order, as we discussed.
25	THE COURT: Yes.

COUNTY CLERK 03/22/2019 03:17 PM SSAU

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

1 MR. TOMSKY: I would like to preserve -- since it's the defendant's burden, I would like to preserve 2 3 any post --THE COURT: If necessary, you could request a 4 recall. 5 6 MR. TOMSKY: I'm saying I would like -- if 7 there are any motions or any requests that I was going 8 to make --THE COURT: Yes, understood. 9 10 (A recess was taken.) 11 COURT CLERK: Remain seated. Come to order. 12 THE COURT: Are we ready? I know we're taking 13 a witness out of order. 14 MR. TOMSKY: Yes. 15 THE COURT: And all rights are reserved with 16 respect to motions and so forth. 17 COURT CLERK: Remain standing. Raise your 18 right hand. 19 Do you solemnly swear or affirm that the 20 testimony you're about to give in this case on trial 21 will be the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the 22 truth, so help you God? 23 THE WITNESS: I do. 24 COURT CLERK: Have a seat. Please state and 25 spell your first and last name and state your address.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Г

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 63

1	THE WITNESS: Michael Thiele, T-H-I-E-L-E, One
2	State Farm Drive, Ballston Spa, New York 12020.
3	THE COURT: You may inquire.
4	MR. TOMSKY: Thank you, your Honor.
5	DIRECT EXAMINATION
6	BY MR. TOMSKY:
7	Q. Now, the address you just gave, is that a corporate
8	office or a particular business address you work at?
9	A. It's a corporate office.
10	Q. Is there a particular address that you work out of?
11	A. I work out of my home, my home address.
12	Q. You don't have to give that. How long well,
13	what company do you work for?
14	A. State Farm Insurance.
15	Q. How long have you worked for State Farm?
16	A. 22 years.
17	Q. What is your current job responsibility at State
18	Farm?
19	A. An auto Estimatics Appraiser.
20	MR. TOMSKY: Your Honor, do you mind if I say
21	AEA or estimator?
22	THE COURT: That's fine.
23	Q. How long have you been an estimator for State Farm?
24	A. 22 years.
25	Q. What did you do before working for State Farm?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

I worked at an independent company doing desk 1 Α. review of estimates. 2 3 Approximately, how long have you been involved in 0. 4 the Estimatics game, I guess? 5 Α. Probably 25 years. 6 Ο. Do you have any particular certifications as it 7 pertains to estimating? I have I-CAR certifications. 8 Α. What is that? 9 0. 10 It's the international -- it's an industry Α. 11 conference for the insurance industry and for repairs, just 12 general knowledge of automobiles. 13 You have to do that during a particular time or Ο. 14 every couple of years, how does that work? 15 It's good to just keep up on the knowledge of the Α. 16 new cars coming out, so it's just an experience. 17 Q. You've done a little bit already, but can you 18 briefly describe what you have to do to get the I-CAR 19 certification? 20 There are certain online courses you can take. Α. 21 There's also in-class courses. They range three or four 22 hours in class. 23 Do you have to do that up to a certain point for Ο. 24 the certification or is it ongoing? 25 Α. It's an ongoing process. Right now I'm at Pro

ph

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 65

1	Level 2, which is a certain certification. They have Pro
2	Level 1, 2 and 3.
3	Q. Can you briefly describe Level 1 for me?
4	A. It's just a basic knowledge of courses. I can't
5	explain how many courses there are, but it's just installing
6	glass, they talk about suspensions, steering, damage
7	analysis, just basic appraising knowledge.
8	Q. How about you mentioned that you're now a Level
9	2. Can you please describe what that is?
10	A. It's similar as the basic knowledge it's just more
11	involved courses. Once again, steering and suspension,
12	airbags, electronics. They try and keep it keeps you up
13	to date with the new technologies that are coming out.
14	Q. Does that assist with your day-to-day duties as an
15	estimator?
16	A. Yes.
17	Q. How so?
18	A. Once again, just keeps me up to date with the
19	current knowledge, the current practices, how vehicles are
20	going are rebuilt, going together.
21	Q. Let's talk about your general day to day. Do you
22	have a specific geographic area that you cover?
23	A. Mostly Nassau County, like southern Nassau County.
24	Q. And approximately how long have you been working in
25	that area for?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

I

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 66

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	Α.	Approximately, 12 years.
2	Q.	On an average week, again, average, approximately,
3	how many o	estimates do you write for various cars?
4	Α.	About 25.
5	Q.	And, approximately, how many different shops will
6	you visit	in a given week?
7	Α.	Between 18 and 20.
8	Q.	Are you an hourly employee or a salaried employee
9	at State 1	Farm?
10	Α.	Salary.
11	Q.	Do you get any kind of overtime?
12	A.	Yes.
13	Q.	Can you just briefly describe how that works?
14	Α.	Whatever overtime there is on a daily basis I fill
15	out a time	ecard that gets approved by management.
16	Q.	How about bonuses?
17	A.	They don't have necessarily bonuses. They have
18	raises.	They may have a company wide incentive program.
19	That's no	t every year.
20	Q.	As far as you know, is your bonus determined based
21	on the am	ount of estimates you write?
22	A.	No.
23	Q.	Do you know if I say overwrite process as it
24	refers to	estimates, do you know what that means?
25	A.	Yes.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 67

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	Q. Can you describe for the Court what that is?	
2	A. On certain vehicles they may send out a	
3	re-inspector to look at some of my passed vehicles that I	
4	have inspected and written an estimate on, and the re-	
5	inspector might look at it and say you know, he may have	
6	allowed two more hours than normal or purchased a part that	
7	wasn't needed on an estimate.	
8	Q. Now, does this happen with every vehicle that you	
9	inspect?	
10	A. No.	
11	Q. Do you know how it's determined what vehicle is	
12	inspected in this overwrite process?	
13	A. No, I don't.	
14	Q. Does how well you do in the overwrites have any	
15	determination on salary, commission, bonus, anything like	
16	that?	
17	A. It does. It's just not it's just a part of.	
18	Q. Is there something that's considered a good score	
19	on an overwrite?	
20	A. Pretty much anything that's less than 10 percent.	
21	Q. Are you told ahead of time if there is a certain	
22	reinspection on one of your vehicles?	
23	A. No.	
24	Q. Are you told after the fact?	
25	A. Sometimes, if it's a poor reinspection.	

I

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 68

1	Q. Briefly, in general, what does happen if there is a
2	larger discrepancy?
3	A. It's just a discussion between me and my manager
4	just so I can fix the problem on the next inspection or be
5	better alert for the next time.
6	Q. As far as this claim goes for Ms. Pope's 2015
7	Nissan Armada, is there an is there an overwrite or
8	reinspection that you're aware of?
9	A. No.
10	Q. Now, you said that you're an estimator. Can you
11	briefly describe, again, briefly, what that means in terms of
12	what you do for State Farm?
13	A. I would look at a vehicle, take photographs, and my
14	estimate would be written as far as the scope of the damage
15	from what I can see.
16	Q. What do you mean by inspecting and looking it over,
17	what does that mean?
18	A. I would electronically write down the vehicle
19	identification number, mileage, options, and then go over the
20	vehicle and write an estimate for the damages that I see.
21	Q. Now, when you actually provide an estimate, is it
22	just a final number or is it broken down in some way?
23	A. Well, it's a line by line itemized estimate.
24	Q. What is that?
25	A. So I would start at the front of the vehicle and

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 69

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	work my way back towards the damage, or, vice versa, if the
2	damage is in the rear, work myself work my way in.
3	Q. And does your estimate usually involve a specific
4	dollar amount that you believe is adequate to repair the
5	vehicle?
6	A. Yeah, at the end there would be total with a dollar
7	amount.
8	Q. In terms of the estimate itself in making up
9	that coming to that number, what elements are needed to
10	come up with that final dollar amount?
11	A. Well, each part may have a labor attached to it,
12	may have a part price, a labor, and then I would that
13	would be multiplied by the labor rate and you would come up
14	with a total.
15	Q. When you say you do a line by line, does each line
16	have a particular amount for the part and line for labor?
17	A. Yes. If it's a part that's being refinished, there
18	would be a line for that, so there would be, say, a bumper
19	cover, for an example, would have a part price, would have a
20	labor attached to it, and there would be a refinish
21	operation.
22	Q. Again, I'm going to keeping it general for right
23	now, when you are drafting an estimate, do you use the repair
24	shop's labor rate or is there a particular labor rate that
25	State Farm uses?

ph

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 70

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	A. It would be a labor rate State Farm supplies to me.
2	Q. Are you the person who determines the labor rate?
3	A. No.
4	Q. Do you know who provides that to you?
5	A. It would be our supervisor who usually gives out
6	the rates for the local area.
7	Q. Just based on your experience as an estimator, can
8	the labor rate change based on location, geographic location
9	in the country?
10	A. I believe it does, yes.
11	Q. Does the labor rate sometimes differ based on the
12	type of car?
13	A. Yes, it could.
14	Q. And does it, again, sometimes differ based on the
15	type of repair that's being done?
16	A. It's possible, yes.
17	Q. Can you describe what a new part or an OEM part is?
18	A. That would be a part supplied by the original
19	equipment manufacturer.
20	Q. And can you describe what a recycled part is?
21	A. That would be a part off a similar vehicle that was
22	in a loss but it may actually come from a salvage yard, a
23	salvage vehicle or part that was never used and just in a
24	salvage yard.
25	Q. In terms of deciding again, keeping it general,

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 71

1	deciding what part to use, when you make up your estimate, do
2	you always use either a new or recycled part or is it a
3	mixture?
4	A. It could be a mixture of whatever is available
5	that's a quality part and that's that's a lower cost.
6	Q. How would you determine, again, keeping it general,
7	whether to use a new or recycled part for a particular
8	repair?
9	A. Just depends on the availability of the parts
10	really.
11	Q. Now, in general, would the use of a recycled versus
12	a new part change the amount in the estimate?
13	A. It could.
14	Q. For that particular part?
15	A. It could, yes.
16	Q. Can you give me an example of why it would?
17	A. Most of the time, if I use a recycled part, it's
18	probably a lower part cost than the OEM list price.
19	Q. Can you give me an example of when it would not
20	change the cost?
21	A. I'm not sure of your question.
22	Q. Well, you indicated just now that there would be
23	there are times when there's a difference in price between
24	recycled and new, correct?
25	A. Right.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 72

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	Q. Is there an example that you can give where there
2	would be no difference in cost between new and recycled?
3	A. Well, if there is no difference, I'm not going to
4	allow for the recycled part. I would just go with the new
5	part.
6	Q. Now, when you're giving your estimate, are you the
7	one who determines new versus recycled?
8	A. Yes.
9	Q. As far as you know, do certain types of vehicles
10	recommend only new parts as opposed to the use of a recycled
11	part?
12	A. Yes.
13	Q. What kind of car is that, as far as you know
14	offhand?
15	A. Most manufacturers have some sort of a
16	recommendation for their new parts.
17	Q. Now, you say "recommendation." Is that a
18	requirement or recommendation?
19	A. It's a recommendation on the manufacturer if they
20	would like you to use their parts.
21	Q. Now, would you write an estimate including a part
22	that was not recommended by the manufacturer?
23	A. Like a recycled part?
24	Q. Correct.
25	A. Okay, yeah, I would use it, yeah, if it's a lower

Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 cost alternative and it came off the similar vehicle and if 2 the quality is similar or better, I would go with the 3 recycled part. 4 When you say "quality is similar," is there a Ο. 5 particular determination that you use to make sure that the 6 part, the recycled part would at least be a quality part? In the database that we use, there is a part 7 Α. 8 search, and the part search will tell you if the part is --9 has any damage on it or if it's a decent quality part, and if 10 it's not, I just don't choose it. If it is, I will allow for 11 it. 12 How would you go about getting a recycled part for 0. a vehicle? 13 14 The body shop would place the order for the part Α. and it would be delivered to the shop. 15 16 Now, in making your estimates as it concerns making Q. 17 your estimate when dealing with recycled versus new, do you 18 speak to the repair shop about whether to use a new or 19 recycled part? 20 Α. Yes. 21 0. And why do you do that? 22 Because you want to get an agreed price with the Α. 23 shop. 24 I'm having a little trouble MR. KLEIN: 25 hearing the witness.

Г

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 74

1	THE COURT: Could you speak up just a bit?
2	THE WITNESS: Sure.
3	THE COURT: Thank you.
4	MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Judge.
5	Q. Now, when you're using a recycled part, does the
6	recycled part have to come from the same make of car, for
7	example, a Nissan, does it have to come from a Nissan or can
8	it come from a different type of car?
9	A. If I'm buying it for a Nissan, it would come from a
10	Nissan.
11	Q. Now, do you I think you started going into it,
12	how do you actually get that recycled part to use on that
13	on a car?
14	A. I would choose the part from the database on my
15	estimate, and it's the shop that would have to order the
16	part, and he would have to look at it to see if it was a
17	quality part to be used.
18	Q. Now, during your time as an estimator, has there
19	come a time when you wrote for a recycled part and later on
20	it was deemed unacceptable for the repair?
21	A. Yes, it does happen.
22	Q. And take me through what happens in that type of
23	scenario?
24	A. Let's say maybe a fender would arrive and maybe it
25	has damage, so the shop would present to me the invoice for

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 75

1	the recycled part and I would look at the fender and say,
2	okay, this fender is no good, and then we would talk about
3	what we needed to do to fix the situation. We would either
4	give more repair on that recycled part or we would just go
5	with a new OEM part.
6	Q. Would you draft an estimate for a recycled part
7	that was clearly inferior to a new part?
8	A. No.
9	Q. In general, where do these recycled parts come
10	from?
11	A. Salvage yards. They would be from salvage
12	vehicles.
13	Q. What is a salvage vehicle?
14	A. It's a vehicle that was either in a prior loss that
15	can no longer be deemed safe for roads and it would be parted
16	out. They would take off pieces of it to be used and resold.
17	Q. In general, what is the goal of an estimate that
18	you give to the repair shop?
19	A. To come up with an agreed price how to fix the car.
20	Q. What if you believe that the vehicle cannot get
21	back to I guess I'll call it a pre-loss condition?
22	A. If it's over a threshold, I believe New York it's
23	75 percent, then it would be deemed a total loss.
24	Q. Are you the one who makes a total loss
25	determination?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 76

1	A. I would take the options and the estimate amount
2	and send it up to the claim handler and they would make that
3	determination, if it's a total loss or not.
4	Q. Now, if it's a car that you have been working on
5	where withdrawn.
6	If it's a car that you have been involved in the
7	estimates for, how are you notified if a car has been deemed
8	a total loss by other people at State Farm?
9	A. Unless they had a question, I wouldn't know about
10	it. If it gets to a certain threshold, I would just send
11	them the information and the claim handler would make the
12	determination and call the repair shop for the charges.
13	Q. Now, is there can you think of an example where
14	a vehicle would be a clear total loss from the jump, from the
15	start?
16	A. Sure. Sometimes just looking at a car you can tell
17	if the airbags have deployed, if there's some severe damage
18	structurally, it would just be considered an obvious total
19	loss.
20	Q. Is there an example of the kind would there
21	be withdrawn.
22	Would there be an example of a car that you did not
23	believe was a total loss initially and then later on became
24	one?
25	A. Yes, that has happened, yes.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 77

1	Q. Is there a term for that where you can't tell
2	initially but later on you deem that?
3	A. That would be called a constructive total loss.
4	Q. So I kind of mangled my question. Can you kind of
5	describe what a constructive total loss is?
б	A. Yes.
7	Q. Please do.
8	A. It would be a car that I would write an estimate
9	and maybe the shop might take it apart and determine it has
10	inner damage or severe frame damage or something that would
11	require the car, some heavy more repairs and we would just
12	say, you know what, at this point, let's just total loss the
13	car and be done with it.
14	Q. In general, how are you notified that you have to
15	come in and inspect a vehicle and give an estimate?
16	A. I get notice through my dispatching system. They
17	send an electronic attachment and I would get the sent
18	into my estimating kit, which is on my laptop.
19	Q. And is there a particular time frame that an
20	initial estimate must be done from the time the car gets into
21	the repair shop?
22	A. Six days, yes.
23	Q. What happens when you're done making your estimate,
24	in general?
25	A. Just if the car is repairable, I would leave an

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 78

1	estimate copy with the shop.
2	Q. When you say leave it with the shop, what do you
3	mean by that?
4	A. Either an electronic e-mail or the estimate would
5	be dropped on the desk of a representative of the repair
6	shop.
7	Q. Now, again, in general, once you give an estimate,
8	whether it's an initial or supplement, which we'll talk about
9	soon, does the repair shop have to accept that estimate and
10	repair the car for that price?
11	A. No.
12	MR. KLEIN: Objection.
13	THE COURT: What's the basis of your
14	objection?
15	MR. KLEIN: He's asking Mr. Thiele about what
16	the auto body shop has to do. It's beyond the scope
17	of well, it's speculative and I think calls for a
18	legal opinion of what Mid Island's obligations are.
19	THE COURT: Good try. Overruled.
20	Q. You could answer. I should have said this ahead of
21	time. If you need the question repeated to you, just let me
22	know and I could ask the Judge. Okay?
23	A. Okay.
24	Q. Would you like it redone?
25	A. I said no on the answer.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 79

1	Q. You would not have to take your estimate and repair
2	the car for that amount of money?
3	A. No. They can repair the car in any manner they
4	deem safe. That's up to the shop.
5	Q. So if there is a disagreement between the estimate
6	that you write and the determination from the repair shop,
7	what happens?
8	A. That would be discussed and there would be what's
9	considered a non-agreed price situation, and I would inform
10	my claim management of the situation.
11	Q. In general, does there come a time where a shop
12	requests something called a supplement?
13	A. Yes.
14	Q. And what is a supplement to an estimate?
15	A. The vehicle is further dismantled or exposed more
16	damage that we have to come and take a look at it again.
17	Q. Is there any particular reason that you know of why
18	that type of internal inspection would not be done initially?
19	A. You mean on the first inspection or
20	Q. Correct.
21	A. Well, most of the time those internal damages can't
22	be seen. Most vehicles, they have like bumper covers, they
23	have things in the way or there might be some collision
24	damage that you just can't access the inner parts of the car.
25	Q. Now, is there a particular reason why that is not

Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 discussed or done immediately? For example, in this case there was more than one estimate, correct? 2 3 Α. Correct. And on the initial estimate, it was -- was it a 4 Ο. 5 visual inspection or was that internal done? I believe it was a physical inspection done on the 6 Α. 7 vehicle by another estimator. 8 Then I'll have him do that, but is there any Q. 9 particular reason why only an external inspection would be 10 done initially as opposed to a more in depth inspection? 11 Well, you only have a certain amount of time to Α. 12 really do an inspection on the vehicle, and seeing it on site 13 in the parking lot, it's not inside the repair shop, you 14 know, in better conditions, torn down, so you kind of just 15 write the scope of the damages pretty much what you can see. 16 Again, you kind of mentioned it, as far as you Q. 17 know, if there is a disagreement between the shop and you on 18 an estimate, including all supplements, what do you do? 19 Α. If there is a disagreement, we discuss it with the 20 shop that there is a disagreement. I would present my 21 estimate and I would call my management and explain to them 22 the situation and just upload my estimate, and that would be it for me. 23 24 Now, in general, when you make an estimate, is it Ο. 25 based on your physical inspection of the vehicle or is it

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 81

1	based on a photo inspection of somebody else?
2	A. It's my physical inspection.
3	Q. Now, obviously, I'm sure it changes from inspection
4	to inspection, but approximately how long does it take for
5	you to do an inspection of a vehicle?
6	A. Between 50 and 60 minutes on average.
7	Q. Now, if a supplement is needed, which party is the
8	one who requests it, is it State Farm or is it the repair
9	shop?
10	A. The repair shop would send a request to State Farm.
11	Q. Do you know how that's done?
12	A. I believe it's done electrically.
13	Q. And then what happens, again, in general, when you
14	receive or you're dispatched for a supplement?
15	A. I usually get the assignment the night before and
16	review what's being needed and go and inspect the vehicle
17	physically the next day.
18	Q. Did that happen in this case?
19	A. Yes.
20	Q. Do you know, approximately, how many times that you
21	provided a supplement for the 2015 Nissan Armada involved in
22	this case?
23	A. I believe it was seven times. Yeah, seven times.
24	Q. Now, you indicated before that you go to many
25	different repair shops?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 82

1	Α.	Yes.
2	Q.	Are all the repair shops that you go to located in
3	Nassau Co	ounty?
4	Α.	Most of them, yes.
5	Q.	Where would the other ones be?
6	Α.	Possibly Suffolk.
7	Q.	Now, in general, are you familiar with
8	Mr. Jesbe	erger sitting at the table over there?
9	Α.	Yes, I am.
10	Q.	How do you know him?
11	Α.	He's the shop manager at Mid Island.
12	Q.	Have you dealt with Mid Island Collision or M.V.B.
13	prior to	this claim involving Ms. Pope's Nissan Armada?
14	Α.	Yes, I have.
15	Q.	Have you had issues reaching an agreed upon price
16	with Mid	Island Collision on more than one occasion?
17	A.	I have.
18	Q.	For different types of vehicles?
19	A.	Yes.
20	Q.	And for different types of repairs?
21	A.	Yes.
22	Q.	Do you have issues reaching an agreed upon price
23	with othe	er repair shops in the Nassau area?
24	Α.	No.
25	Q.	In this claim, did you conduct the initial

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 83

1	inspection of the vehicle?
2	A. No, I did not.
3	Q. Do you know who did?
4	A. I believe it was Jim Rice.
5	Q. And then you indicated that you crafted multiple
6	supplements in this claim?
7	A. Yes.
8	MR. TOMSKY: Can the witness be shown E and F,
9	please?
10	COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness Exhibits E
11	and F in evidence.
12	Q. Now, these documents, E and F, have you seen both
13	these documents before today?
14	A. Yes, I have.
15	Q. When did you first, if you remember the date or
16	around the time, when did you first see that final bill from
17	M.V.B.?
18	A. This was shown to me when we got together in an
19	office.
20	Q. So is it fair to say that you did not see that
21	final bill on the day that it was created back in June 2017?
22	A. No.
23	Q. All right, now, in general, forgetting about
24	peripheral things such as rental agreements and towing, is
25	there anything on the final bill from M.V.B., and, again,

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 84

1	forgetting about the labor rate, is there anything on the
2	final bill that was done, allegedly done by M.V.B. that you
3	disagree with that should either not have been done or not
4	have been done in the manner that you believe it should have
5	been done? Actually, I apologize. I ask that you look at
6	the Auto Haus bill for that.
7	A. Okay. Well, I see there's two wheels on here OEM.
8	Q. How does that differ well, can you please read
9	what was done on that final Auto Haus bill involving the two
10	wheels?
11	A. It looks like it's two OEM alloy wheels.
12	Q. Just so I'm clear, the OEM is two new wheels?
13	A. Correct, yes.
14	Q. How does that differ from what you believed was the
15	appropriate course of action as it relates to that part?
16	A. I had written a recycled wheel for the left rear.
17	MR. TOMSKY: I believe I want the witness
18	shown Exhibit-Y supplement nine.
19	COURT OFFICER: Showing the witness Exhibit-Y.
20	Q. I'm going to have you specifically look at
21	subsection 44, which is on the wheels. What did you write
22	that is in conflict with what was on the final bill from Auto
23	Haus?
24	A. There's one wheel for \$300, plus the markup.
25	Q. Can you please explain the difference between

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 your -- what you put on your final estimate and what M.V.B. 2 put on their final bill as it relates to this -- for this one subsection? 3 4 Α. I see two wheels. I'm not sure why there's two 5 wheels on here. 6 Ο. Now, the wheel that you wrote, you indicated that 7 it was a recycled part? Correct. 8 Α. 9 Ο. Now, why in your opinion did you write the wheel as 10 one recycled as opposed to two new wheels based on your 11 dealing with the car? 12 The damage was to the left rear and that's where Α. 13 the impact was on the wheel. 14 Why did you write for a recycled wheel as opposed Q. 15 to a new wheel? 16 It was available and was cost-effective. Α. 17 Q. When you say "available and cost-effective," is 18 there a certain level of quality that you want to make sure 19 is involved in a recycled part? 20 Α. Yes. Please describe that. 21 0. 22 The same quality of wheel that's on the car. Α. In 23 this case, it was a chrome wheel, so it has to be usable, it 24 has to be of quality, not scratched, not damaged. You know, 25 just like the one that was own the car.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 86

1	Q. And why in your opinion did you not write for a
2	second wheel at all?
3	A. The recycled, there was no recycled. I don't
4	believe it was even ordered. I was never presented with an
5	invoice for a recycled wheel, so I didn't change the
6	estimate.
7	Q. So, in general, I know
8	THE COURT: I'm sorry, I don't think I
9	think there was a disconnect there.
10	Could you read the question back, please, Pat?
11	(The requested portion was read.)
12	THE WITNESS: Oh, a second wheel?
13	THE COURT: Yes.
14	Q. Correct?
15	A. I don't think I was presented with damage on
16	another wheel.
17	Q. When you say not presented with damage, when you
18	look when you do your inspection or a supplement, you look
19	at the vehicle, correct?
20	A. Yes.
21	Q. At any time during any of your inspections, did you
22	look at the rear right wheel?
23	A. Possibly. I'm not sure if my images show a picture
24	of it. If I looked at it, I probably took a picture of it.
25	Q. Now, in general, when you write an estimate, is

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 87

1	that supposed to predate the work being done or postdate the
2	work that's being done?
3	A. Usually it predates the work.
4	Q. When you say "usually," can you be more specific?
5	A. Well, sometimes, like suspension work, it might
6	need to be replaced first. I was looking at a car on the
7	ground, I can't physically see where the damages are. I know
8	that there is a wheel impact, but I don't know what the
9	severity of that damage is.
10	Q. When you say "suspension work," what do you mean by
11	that?
12	A. Behind the wheel, the brakes, the axle, the
13	components holding the suspension in position.
14	Q. So it was your determination that on this
15	particular car, after looking at all looking at the
16	vehicle multiple times, that the only for those two
17	wheels, the only thing that needed to be done was one
18	recycled wheel on the back left?
19	A. From the information that was presented to me, yes.
20	Q. When was the first time, and you could feel free to
21	look at that entire exhibit, it's already been marked, when
22	was the first time that you viewed the vehicle?
23	A. I believe it was supplement two.
24	Q. Please look at that and let me know the date.
25	A. Supplement two was April 20th.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 88

1	Q. Of what year?
2	A. 2017.
3	Q. Now, did you actually physically write a line item
4	estimate for the vehicle on that date?
5	A. Yes. I added damages to the original estimate,
6	yes.
7	Q. And did you give that estimate, the supplement
8	estimate to Mid Island Collision somehow?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. Do you recall how that was done?
11	A. I believe it was possibly e-mailed. I don't have
12	an exact
13	Q. Now, when you go to Mid Island Collision to look at
14	a vehicle, can you take me through from the time you walk in
15	until the time you walk out? You can even limit it to the
16	initial inspection that you did on this car, the supplements.
17	A. In general or in this particular case?
18	Q. If you recall this particular case, please answer
19	it that way. If you don't, let me know.
20	A. I believe I walked into the shop and Bob pointed me
21	to the vehicle. We discussed some labor operations at the
22	vehicle and I was left to write my estimate.
23	Q. Is Mr. Jesberger or anybody else that works for
24	M.V.B., are they with you when you write an estimate?
25	A. There might be a shop manager or a worker around,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 89

1	but there's no discussion with them.
2	Q. On this particular the first supplement that you
3	wrote, so the first time that you saw the car, do you recall
4	if anybody from Mid Island Collision, whether Mr. Jesberger,
5	Mr. McGauvran or anybody else who worked there, was with you
6	as you inspected it?
7	A. No, I don't remember.
8	Q. Now
9	A. No, I don't remember there was.
10	Q. Now, just to be clear, during all your inspections,
11	did anyone from M.V.B., whether Bob, Brian or anybody else
12	give you any hassle about looking at the car?
13	A. No, not about the inspection, no.
14	Q. Now, looking at that first estimate, the first
15	supplement that you wrote, what was the labor rate you used
16	for sheet metal?
17	A. \$49 an hour.
18	Q. What was the labor rate you used for mechanical?
19	A. 49.
20	Q. What was the labor rate you used for frame?
21	A. 51.
22	Q. And what was the labor rate you used for refinish?
23	A. 49.
24	Q. Now, starting with sheet metal, why was that the
25	rate that you used in this case?

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 90

1 Α. This is a standard type of vehicle, nothing out of 2 the ordinary, so I just offered the standard rate that State Farm offers. 3 4 Ο. Same question as it deals with mechanical/electric, 5 why did you use the \$49 per hour rate there? 6 Α. The same reasons, it's a standard vehicle, any 7 repair shop can repair this vehicle for the same price. 8 Q. And the \$51 rate for frame, same question? 9 Α. That's the same rate that we offer for other shops 10 in the same area. 11 For similar cars? 0. 12 For similar cars, yes. Α. 13 How about finally on the refinish, the \$49 rate, Ο. 14 what was the reason for offering that rate at that time? 15 Α. It's also the same rate that we allow for. 16 Now, as you look through your final estimate, did Q. 17 you give any higher labor rate for any particular part or action in this case? 18 19 Α. I don't believe so. 20 And why is that? 0. 21 Α. State Farm's prevailing rate in this area is any 22 other vehicle, any other Nissan would get the same rate in 23 any other repair shop in Nassau County. 24 Okay, now, in your -- I'll focus on the last couple Ο. 25 of years so we can at least be timely with that.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

Would there be instances where you would give a higher labor rate for -- withdrawn. Would you give a higher labor rate for certain repairs? Α. For certain specialty vehicles, yes, I would. 0. Can you describe what a specialty vehicle is at least in terms of how you define it? Α. Specialty vehicle would be one where you would need certified -- certifications. As an example, a Tesla, you can't just fix a Tesla at the shop around the corner. It has to have certifications. And does the 2015 Nissan Armada fall into that 0. category? No, it does not. Α. Now, is there certain type of work that you would 0. authorize at a higher labor rate? Α. Not in this case, no. I'm sorry, I should have specified. In general, is 0. there a higher labor rate that you would authorize on a particular vehicle?

A. If there is -- if a vehicle may have just strictly
mechanical damage and it's in a strictly mechanical shop, I
would offer a higher rate, yes.

Q. Can you just describe what you mean by that?A. In Nassau County there's no prevailing competitive

ph

Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky

RECEIVED	NYSCEF:	03/22/2019
lskv		92

1 price for mechanical repairs, whereas there is a prevailing price for body refinish and frame repairs. 2 3 Ο. Now I want to go back to the date of your first estimate on this vehicle, which you said was April 20th. On 4 5 that date, do you have any recollection of Nick from M.V.B. 6 speaking to you about the labor rate that you put on your 7 estimate? 8 Α. Not on the first inspection, no. 9 0. Did there come a time later on where somebody from 10 Mid Island Collision, whether it was Mr. Jesberger, 11 Mr. McGauvran or somebody else, spoke to you about labor 12 rate? 13 I believe it was supplement number four is when we Α. 14 first sat down and we discussed the estimate line by line and 15 we discussed the labor rate. 16 What date was that, was supplement number four? Q. 17 Α. I believe it was May. 18 Just take a look so you don't have to believe. 0. 19 Yeah, let me find it. May 4th, 2017. Α. 20 What date was the collision, as far as you know? Q. 21 The date of loss was March 27th. Α. 22 You said there was a supplement four. What number Q. 23 was your first supplement? 24 Supplement two. Α. 25 Q. Did you also prepare supplement three?

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 93

1	A. Yes.
2	Q. So is it fair to say that it wasn't until the third
3	time you went to the shop that you had any discussion about
4	labor rate with anyone from M.V.B.
5	A. Correct.
6	Q. And without telling us what anyone from M.V.B.
7	said, what did you talk about in that conversation?
8	A. As far as the labor rate or
9	Q. Correct.
10	A. We discussed his posted labor rate, and I believe
11	Bob asked me if I could move upwards on our labor rate, and I
12	said I could not.
13	Q. And this is after supplement four?
14	A. Supplement four, yes.
15	Q. Now, at any time did somebody from Mid Island
16	Collision tell you that they believe this vehicle was a total
17	loss?
18	A. Yes.
19	Q. Do you recall when that was?
20	A. Probably all the supplements that I went on Bob
21	stated that this vehicle might be a total loss.
22	Q. Now, let's focus on the first time. Again, I'm not
23	sure what the date was, but the first time that he indicated
24	that to you, did you agree with him?
25	A. No, I didn't agree. I was not close to the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 94

1	threshold of being a total loss.
2	Q. Now, when you're talking about thresholds,
3	obviously you said it was a 75 percent value, are you using
4	your estimates or someone else's?
5	A. My estimates.
6	Q. So when you're referring to the 75 percent for this
7	particular vehicle, that's your estimate at that time was
8	not at that at that point yet?
9	A. Correct, using State Farm's labor rates.
10	Q. Is it fair to say at some point M.V.B. thought it
11	was a total loss and you actually believed it was not?
12	A. Yes. In the initial supplements, yes.
13	Q. Do you recall the first time that you indicated to
14	anybody at State Farm that you believe this was getting to
15	the total loss threshold?
16	A. I believe it was supplement four.
17	Q. And what date was that again?
18	A. That was, I think, May 4th. Let me just confirm
19	that. Supplement four, yeah, May 4th.
20	Q. Now, going back to the I guess the first time
21	that you got to M.V.B. concerning this vehicle, that was at
22	the supplement phase, correct?
23	A. Yes.
24	Q. And did you agree with M.V.B. that the vehicle
25	needed additional repairs?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 Α. Did I? Yes. And did you write an estimate, the supplement 2 Ο. estimate for those additional repairs? 3 4 Α. Yes. 5 And did you continue doing that on multiple Ο. 6 occasions? 7 I did, yes. Α. And each time you give a supplement, do you have to 8 Q. look at the vehicle again? 9 10 Α. Yes. 11 Now, besides the issue with the wheel, was there Ο. 12 any repairs made by M.V.B. that you believe were 13 inappropriate? 14 The removal of the body of the frame was taken off Α. 15 a couple of times. 16 Can you please explain? Q. 17 MR. KLEIN: Objection. We've stipulated --18 MR. TOMSKY: Well --19 THE COURT: If we're going to have this, we'll 20 have a side-bar and I will have to exclude the witness. 21 MR. TOMSKY: Can we please do that? 22 THE COURT: Yes. All right, would you? 23 THE WITNESS: Yes. 24 THE COURT: You're going to have to step down 25 for a minute.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 96

1	THE WITNESS: Sure.
2	THE COURT: Okay, why don't you come up.
3	(Whereupon, a side-bar was held.)
4	THE COURT: The parties have previously
5	entered into a stipulation concerning the work on the
6	bill and limiting the objections to the second wheel,
7	the use of an OEM wheel, and the labor rate. There are
8	also some disagreement as to peripheral things such as
9	towing, but in terms of the car repair, those are the
10	only things which the parties don't agree on.
11	I am going to permit testimony concerning the
12	removal of the body only for the purpose of showing that
13	the witness approved some items which might have not
14	been his preferable way of making a repair.
15	MR. TOMSKY: Okay.
16	MR. KLEIN: Thank you, Judge.
17	THE COURT: We need to get him back.
18	COURT CLERK: You're reminded you're still
19	under oath.
20	THE COURT: Pat, read the question back,
21	please?
22	(The requested portion was read.)
23	Q. Can you please explain your objection to that being
24	done by M.V.B.?
25	A. Right. We had negotiated some frame time, pull

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Direct/Tomsky 97

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	time to square the structure, the frame. If there was an
2	issue with the frame at that point, it should have been noted
3	and that could have been repaired a lot sooner or a lot
4	earlier than it was. The repairs continued on the body and
5	the frame should have been completed first before the body
6	was put back down on the frame.
7	Q. Now, despite that objection, did you still allow
8	for that final payment withdrawn.
9	Despite that objection, on your final estimate, did
10	you allow for the for that time to be included in the
11	final bill excluding the labor rate?
12	A. I allowed for the removal of the body twice, not
13	three times.
14	THE COURT: All right, now I'm somewhat
15	confused.
16	MR. KLEIN: I just would reiterate my
17	objection at this point that his last answer be stricken
18	from the record.
19	MR. TOMSKY: If it's better, I can say our
20	stipulation still exists, that we're not challenging
21	THE COURT: The issue of the body
22	MR. TOMSKY: It's more that he allowed for a
23	certain amount of time for something despite that.
24	THE COURT: All right, let's let it stand the
25	way it is. I understand it. I think the record is

ph

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 98

1	clear. Might have done it differently when we started
2	but let's not spend anymore time on it.
3	MR. TOMSKY: All right.
4	Q. Now, in general, you indicated that you have had
5	issues with M.V.B. in the past about labor rates, correct?
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. Now, just in general and on this case, on this
8	claim, is it up to you to change the labor rate?
9	A. It is not.
10	MR. TOMSKY: Nothing further.
11	THE COURT: Mr. Klein.
12	CROSS EXAMINATION
13	BY MR. KLEIN:
14	Q. Good afternoon, Mr. Thiele. Thank you for coming
15	in today.
16	A. Sure.
17	Q. In general, your estimations pertain to damaged
18	automobiles, right?
19	A. Yes.
20	Q. In particular, damaged automobiles get brought
21	that get brought to an auto body shop, right?
22	A. Yes.
23	Q. And then you visit the shop and, among other
24	things, you evaluate the damage to the car, right?
25	A. Yes, I would look at the car and write an estimate.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 99

1	Q. In particular, what you're estimating is what's
2	necessary to restoring the car to its pre-loss condition,
3	right?
4	A. Yes.
5	Q. One form that these estimates take is in cost,
6	which is to say you write the price that you think it should
7	cost for bringing the car back to pre-loss condition, right?
8	A. Correct.
9	Q. And you try not to write a higher cost than what's
10	necessary to fix the car, right?
11	A. In some cases, yes.
12	Q. In some cases what?
13	A. Is the higher cost.
14	Q. The question is, you try not to write a higher cost
15	than what's necessary to fix the car, right?
16	A. Yeah, you're writing an estimate to repair the car
17	to the cost of the car, to the repairs.
18	Q. You try not to write a higher cost than what's
19	necessary to fixing the car, right?
20	A. I'm not sure what you're asking, your question.
21	Q. Do you try to overwrite the estimate?
22	A. No.
23	Q. You try not to write a lower cost than what's
24	necessary to fix the car, right?
25	A. Correct.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 100

1	Q.	You've been doing this, you testified, I believe,
2	with State	e Farm for 22 years?
3	Α.	22 years, yes.
4	Q.	And in the industry for 25 years?
5	Α.	Approximately, yes.
6	Q.	Your services were deployed on a 2015 Nissan Armada
7	belonging	to Courtney Pope, right?
8	Α.	Yes.
9	Q.	Your first estimate was on April 20th, 2017, right?
10	Α.	Yes.
11	Q.	And your estimate for the cost of repairing this
12	vehicle ba	ack to pre-loss condition was \$17,052.51, right?
13	Α.	Yes, it is.
14	Q.	But this wasn't the first estimate that had been
15	performed	on this car, was it?
16	Α.	No, it was not.
17	Q.	You had to revise the prior estimate upward, right?
18	Α.	I did in this case, yes.
19	Q.	And, in fact, in comparison to the first estimate
20	on the car	r, you had to revise State Farm's original estimate
21	upward by	about 69 percent, right?
22	Α.	I don't know about the percentages, but \$3,674.
23	Q.	Your colleague that you testified to about a moment
24	ago, Mr. R	Rice, had initially written the vehicle for
25	\$10,802.70), right?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 101

1		
1	A	If that was the amount minus my supplement, then
2	Q. 3	You tell me.
3	A. I	His estimate was \$13,377.
4	Q. 1	No. Mr. Rice's initial estimate was for
5	\$10,802.70,	, wasn't it, on March 31st, 2017?
6	A. N	March 31st, there it is, yes, 10,082.
7	Q. 4	And your estimate was higher than that by
8	\$6,969.89,	right?
9	A	If I had a calculator I don't have a calculator
10	in front of	E me to
11	Q. (Okay. So you complete this estimate on April 20th,
12	right, Mr.	Thiele?
13	A. 3	Yes.
14	Q. 4	And there may have been a lower estimate in the
15	past but yo	ou had come in and inspected the vehicle without a
16	problem giv	ven to you by State Farm, by Mid Island, right?
17	A. 2	I'm not understanding your question.
18	Q. V	Well, you testified on direct that there was,
19	quote, no h	nassle, right?
20	A. V	Well, as far as inspecting the vehicle?
21	Q. H	Right.
22	A. (Or walking into the shop?
23	Q. 3	You testified on direct that you were given, quote,
24	no hassle i	in inspecting the vehicle, correct?
25	A. 2	If that was my words.

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 102

1	Q. Well, okay. So you had been given no hassle, you	
2	came in and performed another estimate on the vehicle, so now	
3	you're done, right, you were done with this car?	
4	A. Are we still talking about the second inspection	
5	or	
6	Q. Was your role finished with regard to this Nissan?	
7	A. On the second inspection?	
8	Q. No. In general, is this the last time you saw the	
9	car?	
10	A. I'm not understanding your question.	
11	Q. Was this the last time that you saw Ms. Pope's	
12	Nissan?	
13	MR. TOMSKY: Could we provide some dates?	
14	Q. Sure. On April 20th, was April 20th the last time	
15	that you saw the car?	
16	A. No, it wasn't.	
17	Q. In fact, you came back six days later to give	
18	another estimate, right?	
19	A. Yes.	
20	Q. And you had to revise your estimate upward, right?	
21	A. I believe so.	
22	Q. You believe so?	
23	A. Let me look estimate three. Yes, I did.	
24	Q. And then you came back a third time on May 4th,	
25	2017, right?	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 103

1	A. May 4th, that was supplement four, yes.		
2	Q. And this was now more than two weeks later than		
3	your first estimate, right?		
4	A. I believe so.		
5	Q. And this was over a month later than when State		
б	Farm had first seen the vehicle, right?		
7	A. Yes.		
8	Q. And so all of this while Ms. Pope was not in her		
9	Nissan, correct?		
10	A. I don't know what she was in.		
11	Q. But you do know that she wasn't in that car, don't		
12	you?		
13	A. Correct, yes.		
14	Q. So on May 4th you come in, did you finally say, I		
15	got it right, my prior estimate was correct, no change?		
16	A. On May 4th I submitted a valuation to see if the		
17	car was still repairable.		
18	Q. No. My question was, when you came in on May 4th,		
19	did you say, I nailed it last time, that was right?		
20	A. No, I never said that.		
21	Q. Did you have to revise your estimate upward again?		
22	A. I did, yes.		
23	Q. Then you came back six days later on May 10th		
24	again, right?		
25	A. Yes, May 10th.		

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Г

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 104

1	Q. And you revised your prior estimate upward again?		
2	A. I did.		
3	Q. And by now your view was that it would take		
4	\$23,201.24 to restore Courtney Pope's Nissan to its pre-loss		
5	condition, correct?		
6	A. Yes.		
7	Q. Not a dollar more, not a dollar less, right?		
8	A. Sure.		
9	Q. And this was now 36 percent higher than your own		
10	original estimate, right?		
11	A. Yes.		
12	Q. And 130 percent higher than State Farm's very first		
13	estimate on this car, right?		
14	MR. TOMSKY: I'm not stipulating to the math		
15	being correct, I'm just saying I haven't checked the		
16	math to see if that's specifically accurate to the		
17	percentages.		
18	THE COURT: And the witness said the same		
19	thing, he hasn't done the math. We get the point.		
20	Q. At this point, were you done now after that		
21	estimate?		
22	A. Well, I knew that there was going to be more		
23	damage.		
24	Q. Were you done at that point?		
25	A. No.		

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 105

ſ				
1	Q.	In fact, you came back six days later again, right?		
2	A.	Yes, I did.		
3	Q.	And you had to revise your prior estimate upward		
4	again, right?			
5	A.	I did, yes.		
б	Q.	And you had to come back once again on May 25th,		
7	2017, right?			
8	A.	Yes, I did.		
9	Q.	And you revised your estimate upward again, right?		
10	A.	I did, yes.		
11	Q.	And you came back a final time on June 1st, 2017,		
12	correct?			
13	Α.	Yes, I did.		
14	Q.	And you revised your estimate upward again, right?		
15	Α.	Yes.		
16	Q.	So you had seen the car seven times and seven times		
17	you had to revise your prior estimate upward, right?			
18	Α.	I did, yes.		
19	Q.	And on each case you thought that your estimate was		
20	correct,	right?		
21	Α.	I never said it was correct.		
22	Q.	On each case you thought it was though, right?		
23	Α.	I thought I was close.		
24	Q.	You thought it was		
25	Α.	I was close, yes.		
	1			

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 in 106

1 Ο. For your visits alone, this back and forth spanned more than 40 days, didn't it? 2 If that's the -- I don't know if that's the 3 Α. timeline. 4 5 O. Feel free to check. You had testified that your 6 first visit was on April 20th. 7 And this is May 1st. So calendar days, is that 40 Α. 8 days? I don't know. THE COURT: What was the date of the last 9 10 visit? 11 THE WITNESS: May 1st. No, I'm sorry, June 12 lst. 13 THE COURT: So I'll take judicial notice that 14 that's 40 days. 15 And your final estimate, your final estimate was 0. 16 for \$28,999.89, correct? 17 Α. Yes. 18 Ο. Higher than State Farm's initial estimate by over 19 187 percent, right? 20 MR. TOMSKY: Same. 21 0. Does that sound right to you? 22 Α. I guess. 23 THE COURT: Was it nearly double the original 24 estimate? 25 THE WITNESS: Yes.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 MR. KLEIN: Nearly triple. Nearly triple the original 2 THE COURT: 3 estimate, I'm sorry. 4 THE WITNESS: Yes. 5 Ο. Indeed, even your estimate later on was revised 6 upward, as far as you know, right? 7 I believe Jim Rice looked at it again, yes. Α. 8 During this period of time, while you were coming Q. back and forth to Mid Island, Mid Island was telling you that 9 10 you were understating or underestimating the damage to this 11 car, weren't they? 12 He stated it was grossly underwritten. Α. 13 In fact, you testified that Mid Island told you to Ο. 14 deem it a total loss on, quote, all of the supplements, 15 correct? 16 Correct. Α. 17 Q. Mid Island cannot declare a car a total loss on its own, formally speaking. The only party in this case that 18 19 could have done that was State Farm, correct? 20 Α. Yes. 21 But State Farm did not heed Mid Island's advice or 0. 22 request to deem it a total loss when Mid Island first 23 requested it, correct? 24 When I sent the information on my supplement? Α. 25 Ο. State Farm did not deem the car a total loss when

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

108

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 Mid Island first requested it, correct? 2 Α. No. 3 Ο. That is correct, isn't it? 4 Α. That's correct, yes. 5 In fact, State Farm doesn't even claim to have Ο. 6 reported a total loss until mid June, correct? 7 I don't know that. Α. You don't know that? 8 Q. 9 Α. No. 10 Have you inspected the claim file in connection Ο. 11 with this case? 12 Α. Yes. 13 What's your understanding of when it was declared a Ο. 14 total loss? 15 I believe it was supplement nine. Α. 16 I'm sorry, the date? Q. I don't know what the date is. Let me look. 17 Α. 18 Would it surprise you to hear that it was June 0. 19 14th? 20 MR. TOMSKY: I believe there is a question 21 outstanding. 22 THE COURT: There is. 23 What was the question? MR. KLEIN: 24 THE COURT: The question was what was the date 25 they declared it a total loss?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 THE WITNESS: Actually, I don't know the specific date. I'm sorry, I don't know the specific 2 3 date. I didn't look that up. 4 If Mid Island had declared the car -- if State Farm Ο. 5 had declared the car a total loss when Mid Island first 6 pleaded for one, that would have cut off Mid Island's 7 reasonable expectation to be paid, correct? 8 MR. TOMSKY: Objection as to M.V.B.'s state of mind. 9 10 I'm sustaining the objection not THE COURT: 11 The question is compound and a little for that reason. 12 confusing. I think you need to break it into two 13 pieces. 14 MR. KLEIN: Sure. 15 0. Mid Island told you, asked you to declare it a 16 total loss on all of the supplements, correct? 17 Α. Yes. And if that had happened, in other words, if State 18 Ο. 19 Farm had immediately acceded to that request, Mid Island 20 could not have reasonably billed passed that point, could it 21 have? 22 I don't know what they could bill for at that Α. 23 point. 24 Well, is State Farm's position that billing should Ο. 25 continue even after an auto body shop is notified of a total

COUNTY CLERK 03/22/2019 03:17 \mathbf{PM}

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

5

6

9

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 loss declaration? MR. TOMSKY: Objection to State Farm's 2 3 position. 4 THE COURT: Overruled. MR. KLEIN: He's here --Ο. Can you please answer the question? 7 Can you repeat the question? Α. THE COURT: Let me see if I could clarify it. 8 If you declared the car a total loss, when I say "you," 10 I mean State Farm, is the body shop, in this case Mid 11 Island, but, in any event, in any case, is the body shop permitted to continue with the work and then bill State 12 Farm for it? 13 14 THE WITNESS: No. They're told to stop work 15 and the storage will cut off a certain day. 16 And if State Farm had heeded Mid Island's advice, Q. 17 it would have cost Mid Island money, right? 18 MR. TOMSKY: Objection. 19 THE COURT: Sustained. 20 Mid Island's bill would not have been what it Ο. 21 ultimately became, if State Farm had heeded Mid Island's 22 advice, correct? 23 MR. TOMSKY: Objection, calls for speculation 24 on what M.V.B.'s bill would have been. He doesn't work 25 for M.V.B.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 in 111

1 THE COURT: No, I'm going to overrule that 2 objection. You could answer it, if you can. Do you need it read back? 3 THE WITNESS: Yes, please. 4 5 THE COURT: Please, Pat. 6 (The requested portion was read.) 7 Correct, it would not be that large. Α. 8 Q. Would it have been -- as far as you know --MR. KLEIN: Permission to continue? 9 10 THE COURT: Yes. 11 As far as you know, Mr. Thiele, who owed Mid Ο. Island's final bill when it was issued, State Farm or 12 13 Courtney Pope? Who owed money to Mid Island? 14 Α. I'm not sure at what point. You mean the final bill itself who do I think? 15 16 Who owed the money to Mid Island? Q. 17 THE COURT: State Farm or its insured. 18 The final bill, I think Ms. Pope. Α. 19 I would like to show the witness what's been marked Q. 20 as Exhibit-E. It's a copy of the final bill. The Court has 21 a copy. 22 THE COURT: Mr. Klein, are you going to be a 23 lot longer on cross, because we could take a break now, 24 if you like? 25 MR. KLEIN: I don't need a break. If the

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 in 112

1 Court would like one --THE COURT: Let's take 10 minutes. 2 3 (A recess was taken.) 4 COURT CLERK: Please remain seated. THE COURT: All right, why don't you come on 5 6 back up. 7 COURT CLERK: You're reminded that you're still under oath. 8 9 THE COURT: Okay, you may now continue your 10 inquiry. 11 Thank you, your Honor. MR. KLEIN: 12 I think where we left off was that I was just 0. 13 showing the witness the final bill, which is Exhibit-E. 14 Would you like a moment to review that, Mr. Thiele? 15 Yes. Thank you. Α. 16 Let me just know when you're finished. Q. 17 Α. Yeah, I'm good. 18 This bill is made up of labor, parts and taxes, for 0. 19 the most part, right? 20 Α. Yes. And the number of labor hours for body work here 21 0. 22 was 128.8 hours, right? 23 Α. Yes. 24 And the number of hours for refinishing the paint Ο. 25 was 47.9 hours, right?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 113

1	A. Yes.	
2	Q. Labor hours on the car's frame	was 15, right?
3	A. Yes.	
4	Q. And the number of labor hours	on mechanical is 2.8,
5	right?	
6	A. Yes.	
7	Q. So it's a total of 194 and a h	alf hours on this
8	vehicle, right?	
9	A. I'm not sure.	
10	Q. Is it your contention that 194	and a half hours is
11	too much labor to fix this car?	
12	A. What's the labor on my estimat	e?
13	Q. Okay, so as you sit here, you	don't know whether
14	194.5 hours was too much to fix this car	?
15	A. Not without looking at my estim	mate.
16	Q. Would you like me to show you	a copy of your
17	estimate to refresh your recollection?	
18	A. Yes, please.	
19	Q. Would you like to see I this	nk what would make
20	more sense, if we could show the witness	Exhibit-Y, which is
21	all of the estimates, please.	
22	If you could just quietly read	the estimates to
23	yourself, please.	
24	A. Okay.	
25	Q. Yes or no, 194 and a half hour	s was too much labor

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 on this car? No, it's not. 2 Α. In fact, State Farm's own final estimate welcomed 3 Ο. 244.8 hours of labor, correct? 4 5 Α. Correct. 6 0. So there actually is a difference between the amount of work done on this car versus how much work State 7 Farm thought should be done on this car, right? 8 9 MR. TOMSKY: Objection to the classification 10 of "work." It's labor hours. 11 MR. KLEIN: Labor hours. 12 Labor hours, yes. Α. 13 There was actually a difference, right? Q. 14 There was a difference, yes. Α. 15 Mid Island spent less than State Farm thought was 0. 16 appropriate, correct? 17 Α. Yes. And not a little less, right? 18 0. 19 No, there is a sizable difference. Α. 20 About 50 hours difference. Q. 21 In this final bill, yes. Α. 22 Well, the final bill from State Farm is what State Q. Farm deems to be necessary to repair the car to pre-loss 23 24 condition. That's what you testified, right? 25 Α. No, this is not the same final bill that I went

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 over the car with Bob with. 2 MR. KLEIN: Could we have the question read 3 back, your Honor? THE COURT: You did say "bill," if that's the 4 5 question, State Farm bill. I think you meant estimate. 6 MR. KLEIN: Okay, I appreciate the correction. 7 State Farm deemed it, in its final estimate, 0. 8 necessary to spend 244.8 hours to repair the car to pre-loss condition, right? 9 10 Α. Yes. 11 And Mid Island managed to do it for less, right, on 0. its final bill? 12 13 The car wasn't completed though, was it? Α. 14 Okay, so Mid Island's final bill is for less than Q. 15 what State Farm welcomed on its final estimate? 16 Α. Yes. 17 MR. TOMSKY: In terms of labor hours? 18 MR. KLEIN: In terms of labor. 19 Do you believe that 120 hours, I'm sorry, \$120 per Q. 20 hour at Mid Island is unreasonable for the auto repair work 21 that it performs? 22 Α. Yes. 23 But you have personally approved payments for auto Ο. 24 repair work in general at \$120 an hour or above, correct? 25 Α. At this particular shop?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 116

1	Q. In general, correct?
2	A. No, that's not correct.
3	Q. It's not correct that you have personally approved
4	payments for auto repair work at a labor rate of \$120 an
5	hour?
6	A. Are you talking mechanical or body work?
7	Q. I'm asking you auto repair work.
8	A. No, not for 120.
9	Q. I'm sorry, not for 120, not for 120 or above?
10	A. For this particular type of car?
11	Q. I'm not asking you for this particular car. I
12	suppose I could have the question read back, but I'll ask it
13	again.
14	Have you personally approved payments for auto
15	repair work in general at \$120 an hour or not?
16	A. Yes, I have.
17	Q. In fact, on July 10th, 2018, about four months ago,
18	you approved payments for auto repair work at \$145 an hour,
19	didn't you?
20	A. I guess. Is there an estimate?
21	MR. KLEIN: Could we please show the witness
22	Exhibits AA and BB, please?
23	Q. Mr. Thiele, I point your attention to the State
24	Farm supplement in front of you, line 80, line 238, and line
25	28.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

I

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 117

1	Α.	Yes, I see it.
2	Q.	Those entries correspond to a bill for services
3	performed	at Audi, correct?
4	Α.	Yes.
5	Q.	And what was the labor rate that Audi charged?
6	Α.	Looks like 145.
7	Q.	And that was approved by State Farm, correct?
8	Α.	Yes.
9	Q.	Who was the estimator who approved that?
10	Α.	I was.
11	Q.	What was the work that Audi performed on that
12	vehicle?	You can read it, if it would help you.
13	Α.	It was a sublet mechanical operation.
14	Q.	What was the actual mechanical operation?
15	A.	Looks like a wheel alignment and electrical resets
16	and aiming	g headlamps.
17	Q.	Could you say that again, please?
18	Α.	Electrical resets, aiming the headlamps, and a
19	wheel alig	gnment.
20	Q.	Aim the headlamps, is that what you said?
21	A.	Correct.
22	Q.	What's involved in aiming the headlamps?
23	Α.	The vehicle has to be sitting on a flat surface, it
24	has to be	tire pressures checked, it has to be aligned at
25	a certain	angle.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 118

1	Q.	Just aiming it?
2	Α.	Aiming headlamps, yes.
3	Q.	What was the labor rate paid for that?
4	Α.	It was paid at a sublet operation, not at a labor
5	rate.	
б	Q.	What did Audi charge for that?
7	Α.	Audi charged, looks like, 145.
8	Q.	And State Farm paid that, correct?
9	Α.	Yes. On the estimate, yes.
10	Q.	And the electrical, what's involved in testing the
11	electrica	l that you described?
12	Α.	I'm not sure in this case. It was done at the Audi
13	dealershi	p, but it was, looks like, normalization.
14	Q.	Basically plugging it in?
15	Α.	Pretty much plugging it in, checking everything,
16	making su	re it works.
17	Q.	Plugging it in and unplugging it?
18	A.	I don't think it's that simple, but yes.
19	Q.	Elaborate, how difficult is it?
20	Α.	Obviously the dealership had to do it so it had to
21	be an ope	ration
22		MR. KLEIN: I'm sorry, nonresponsive.
23		THE COURT: Well, let him finish the answer.
24	You	don't make that determination. I do.
25		MR. KLEIN: Sorry.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

I

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 119

1	THE COURT: Do you want to fini	sh your answer
2	or is that the full answer?	
3	THE WITNESS: Yes, I would like	to finish it,
4	yes.	
5	THE COURT: Please.	
6	A. I believe it was more involved than	that. It was
7	probably an Audi machine that they use with an	Audi
8	technician, and he probably plugged it in and	made sure that
9	everything was working properly.	
10	Q. What was the third item on the bill?	
11	A. Looks like the four wheel alignment.	
12	Q. What's involved in doing that?	
13	A. It's having specific alignment equip	ment, has to go
14	up on another machine, and they align it using	probably a
15	laser setup.	
16	Q. And that was billed by Audi at what	rate?
17	A. Looks like they charged 199.95.	
18	Q. And was that paid?	
19	A. Yes, it was.	
20	Q. By State Farm?	
21	A. Yes.	
22	Q. I would like to show the witness wha	t's been marked
23	as Exhibits II and JJ, which I do not believe	the Court has.
24	(Whereupon, Defendant's Exhibits II	and JJ were
25	marked into evidence.)	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 120

1	Q.	So was paying a dealership's bill just limited to
2	Audi last	year?
3	Α.	No.
4	Q.	In February of this year you approved \$174 an hour
5	for BMW,	didn't you?
6	Α.	Yes, I did.
7	Q.	I would like to show the witness what's been marked
8	as Exhibi	t-OO and PP, which the Court has, I believe.
9		Mr. Thiele, you've had a chance to review the most
10	recent ex	hibit placed in front of you, OO and PP?
11	Α.	Yes.
12	Q.	You approved \$120 an hour to Nissan, didn't you?
13	I'm sorry	, withdrawn.
14		Nissan charged \$120 an hour and you agreed to pay,
15	right?	
16	Α.	125, actually.
17	Q.	That's right, correct. Thank you.
18		What was the work done on that Nissan?
19	Α.	It was mechanical work performed at the dealership.
20	Q.	What kind of mechanical work?
21	Α.	Four wheel alignment and also aiming the headlamps
22	and elect	rical resets.
23	Q.	And the labor rate for those three tasks was \$125
24	an hour?	
25	Α.	Yes.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 121

1	Q. And State Farm paid it?
2	A. We did.
3	Q. And you personally approved it?
4	A. I did.
5	Q. In fact, in your experience it's regular practice
6	at State Farm to approve \$120 an hour or above for work
7	performed at a dealership; isn't that right?
8	A. Yes.
9	Q. And that's regardless of whether the work is easier
10	or less superb than the work performed at an auto body shop
11	like Mid Island, right?
12	A. That's not correct.
13	Q. Not correct?
14	A. No.
15	Q. So was the work performed on this Nissan at the
16	dealership more or less complicated than the work that was
17	performed at the auto body shop?
18	A. This is more complicated.
19	Q. At the dealership it was more complicated?
20	A. Yes, it is.
21	Q. That includes aiming the headlamps?
22	A. I would assume so. If it was done at the
23	dealership, I would assume it is more complicated.
24	Q. So it is your testimony that because it is done at
25	the dealership that means it's more complicated?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 122

i		
1	Α.	No, it is a complicated operation, it is.
2	Q.	Aiming the headlamps is complicated?
3	Α.	Sure.
4	Q.	More complicated than the work done at
5	A.	If the repair shop can't do it, then it must be a
6	complicat	ed operation.
7	Q.	So your testimony is that the only reason why it
8	would be o	done at the dealership is because of how complicated
9	it is?	
10	A.	Correct.
11	Q.	It has nothing to do with warranties?
12	A.	The warranties wouldn't matter in this case.
13	Q.	I'm sorry, does it ever matter?
14	A.	Of course. The new car if it's a new car, sure.
15	Q.	Aren't there computer programs that only the
16	dealershi	p has?
17	Α.	Yes.
18	Q.	It's intellectual property?
19	Α.	Sure.
20	Q.	That they don't give out and that makes it more
21	complicat	ed?
22	Α.	Yes.
23	Q.	Is that State Farm's view or your view, as far as
24	you know?	
25	Α.	That's well, it could be both views, it could be

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 my view and State Farm's view. So institutionally, as far as you know, State 2 0. 3 Farm's view is if it is done at the dealership, that means 4 it's more complicated than the work performed at the auto 5 body shop? 6 Α. Not necessarily in every case, but it could be, 7 yes. 8 But I think your testimony a moment ago was because Q. it was done on a computer program that meant it was more 9 10 complicated? 11 MR. TOMSKY: Objection, that's not what he 12 said. 13 MR. KLEIN: I think it is. 14 THE COURT: I will allow him to answer. 15 What I said was the body shop could not do Α. No. 16 these operations so they had to send it out to a mechanical 17 shop for these operations to be completed, so they must be 18 more complicated than the shop can handle. 19 If a hand surgeon doesn't have a Band-Aid and they Q. 20 send the patient to CVS to buy one, does that mean that the 21 Band-Aid is more complicated? 22 MR. TOMSKY: Objection. 23 Sustained. THE COURT: 24 On Ms. Pope's particular vehicle, the car was taken Ο. 25 to Nissan, correct?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Г

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 124

1	A. From seeing this estimate, yes.
2	Q. And Nissan charged what labor rate?
3	A. I don't do we have it here?
4	Q. I'm sorry?
5	A. I didn't handle that supplement, so that's
6	Q. Okay, that's fine. I'll move on.
7	On November 8th, 2018, last month, you approved a
8	payment to Mid Island directly at \$125 an hour, hadn't you?
9	A. In this particular case, I'm not sure.
10	Q. Do you need your memory refreshed?
11	A. That was a while ago, yes.
12	Q. It wasn't that long ago, but okay. It was on
13	November 8th. You want your memory refreshed?
14	A. What kind of car? What's the name of the customer?
15	That's how I'll remember.
16	Q. This is Exhibit-RR. Is it true that on November
17	8th, 2018 you approved a payment directly to Mid Island at a
18	labor rate of \$125 an hour?
19	A. Yes. 125, actually.
20	Q. And that was not the first time that you have
21	offered Mid Island more than \$49 an hour, is it?
22	A. No, it's not.
23	Q. Back in 2012, over half a decade ago, you already
24	were paying Mid Island close to \$100 per hour on occasion,
25	weren't you?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 125

1	A.	If it was a complex vehicle, that's possible.
2	Q.	I would like to show the witness Exhibit-TT, like
3	Tango Ta	ango.
4		(Whereupon, Defendant's Exhibit-TT was marked into
5	evidence	e.)
6	Q.	Mr. Thiele, in 2012, is it true that you paid \$95
7	an hour	directly to Mid Island Collision in connection with
8	the repa	air of an automobile?
9	A.	Yes.
10	Q.	That was on a Mercedes-Benz, correct?
11	A.	Yes. It was a complex vehicle also.
12	Q.	If you could do your best to limit your answers to
13	my quest	cions, please.
14		Now, 2012 to now, has repairing cars gotten easier,
15	has the	job gotten easier?
16	Α.	No, it has not.
17	Q.	How has the economy performed since 2012, as far as
18	you know	1?
19		MR. TOMSKY: Objection.
20		THE COURT: Sustained.
21	Q.	Are prices down in the automotive industry?
22	A.	I don't think so.
23	Q.	Are they up?
24	Α.	Sure, everything is up.
25	Q.	Everything is up, right? I mean, when did GM

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein declare bankruptcy? MR. TOMSKY: Objection. Sustained. THE COURT: Up to now we've been talking about labor rates. Ι Ο. would like to turn your attention to parts, which is the subject that you answered some questions a moment ago from my friend Mr. Tomsky. To be clear, when a car gets damaged in an accident, sometimes it's not enough to put labor into parts that are already there, sometimes you actually need to replace the hardware itself, right? Labor into parts? I'm not sure --Α. Ο. It's one thing to work on a part or on the car, it's another to replace parts, right? Α. Sure. And that happened on Courtney Pope's Nissan, Q. correct? There were many parts replaced, yes. Α. I'm sorry? Q. Α. Many parts, yes. 0. Nissan has a rule about how to replace parts, doesn't it? They have recommendations, yes. Α. Recommendations? Ο.

MR. KLEIN: Can we please show the witness

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 Exhibit-K? 2 (Whereupon, Defendant's Exhibit-K was marked 3 into evidence.) Mr. Thiele, you referred to Nissan's treatment of 4 Ο. OEM as a, quote, recommendation, right? 5 6 Α. Yes. 7 Would you mind reading the first sentence on what's 0. 8 been handed to you as Exhibit-K, please? 9 Α. "Nissan North America," that sentence there? 10 Yes. Ο. "Recognizes the importance of recycling, but the 11 Α. 12 use of salvaged recycled parts to repair collision damaged 13 vehicles raises serious concerns about quality, suitability, 14 safety and warranty. For this reason, Nissan North America 15 does not approve of the repair of our vehicles with salvaged 16 parts or assemblies." 17 Q. That's what you would describe as a recommendation? 18 Α. Correct. 19 Is there another page in Exhibit-K, Mr. Thiele? Q. 20 Yes, there is. Α. Would you mind reading the first sentence of 21 0. 22 Exhibit-K, please? 23 "Original parts used on a Nissan automobile are Α. 24 designed and built to provide optimum fit, function, safety 25 and structural integrity. For this reason, Nissan North

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

I

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 128

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	America does not approve of the use of aftermarket, grand
2	market or imitation parts."
3	Q. Do they say we recommend that you don't use that or
4	do they say they do not approve of it?
5	A. Do not approve.
б	Q. But you still say it's a recommendation, not a
7	rule?
8	A. Of the salvaged sentence, not the that what you
9	just told me to read.
10	Q. So that's a rule, the one that you just read?
11	A. We wouldn't put a non-quality part on a car, yes.
12	Q. How about the first page, that was the
13	recommendation?
14	A. Yes.
15	Q. Does it say we recommend or does it say we do not
16	authorize?
17	A. It says does not approve.
18	Q. I'm sorry, I don't know if we if the lingo has
19	been put in, but OEM is the reference to
20	A. Original Equipment Manufacturer.
21	Q. OEM is what's depicted on that document?
22	A. Yes.
23	Q. So when State Farm writes up an estimate for fixing
24	a vehicle, surely they do their best to comply with these
25	obligations?

128 of 160

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 129

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

1	A. Yes.
2	Q. Or these recommendations?
3	A. Yes.
4	Q. Because using non-OEM would violate Nissan's rule
5	or recommendation, right?
6	A. Yes.
7	Q. And, in fact, you testified on direct examination
8	that generally using a non-OEM part depresses the price,
9	right, in comparison to the OEM?
10	A. Yes.
11	Q. And so when State Farm writes an estimate or if
12	anyone writes an estimate using a non-OEM part, generally
13	speaking, the estimate will be cheaper for the insurance
14	company than it would have been if an OEM part was used,
15	right?
16	A. Generally, yes.
17	Q. And if an auto body shop decided hey, we're going
18	to abide by Nissan's recommendation as you described it and
19	the insurance company did not, that in and of itself could
20	cause or would cause a divergence between the estimate and
21	the auto body shop's final bill, correct?
22	A. Correct.
23	Q. In fact, in this case that happened, correct?
24	A. Yes.
25	Q. On some of the estimates State Farm provided

ph

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 estimates based upon the assumption of a, quote, non-OEM; isn't that right? 2 3 Α. I'm sorry, what was that question? 4 On some of State Farm's estimates the estimates Ο. 5 were based upon the assumption of a, quote, non-OEM; is that 6 correct? 7 Recycled or non-OEM? Α. 8 Q. The question was --9 MR. KLEIN: If we could have the question read 10 back, Judge. Would that be okay? 11 THE COURT: Please. 12 (The requested portion was read.) 13 It would be correct, yes. Α. Yes. 14 Mr. Thiele, do you still have Exhibit-Y in front of Q. 15 you? 16 Yes, I do. Α. 17 Q. Would you mind -- would you please turn to -- I suppose any one of them, but the final estimate? 18 19 Α. Okay. 20 Is that okay? Q. 21 Α. Yep. 22 Now, in the print at the bottom of the estimate Q. State Farm has some fine print you would call it, right? 23 24 Α. Okay. 25 Q. And State Farm actually offers code letters to

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 131

1	indicate non-OEM or recycled parts, correct?			
2	A. Two different things.			
3	Q. Okay, does it offer code letters for each of those			
4	things?			
5	A. Yes, it does.			
6	Q. And then periodically it uses those code letters on			
7	an estimate, right?			
8	A. Yes.			
9	Q. So it's regular enough at State Farm to use a			
10	non-OEM or recycled part that it actually is on its form for			
11	its estimates, right?			
12	A. Yes.			
13	Q. Again, using the non-OEM parts or recycled parts			
14	reduces the cost or the amount of its estimates, generally,			
15	right?			
16	A. Yes.			
17	Q. And, in fact, that happened in this case, right?			
18	A. Yes, there were some non-OEM.			
19	Q. Now, if an auto body shop withdrawn.			
20	In your experience, is it unreasonable for an auto			
21	body shop to comply with a manufacturer's recommendation for			
22	the use of OEM parts?			
23	MR. TOMSKY: Objection. How would he know if			
24	it was unreasonable for a different entity?			
25	THE COURT: Pat, read the question back,			

COUNTY CLERK 03/22/2019 03:17 PM NASSAU

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 1 please. 2 (The requested portion was read.) Overruled. You can answer it. 3 THE COURT: No, the shop can do that. Yes, the shop can do 4 Α. 5 that. 6 Ο. The question was, is it reasonable for them to do 7 that? 8 Sure, it's reasonable. Α. 9 Ο. You testified on direct about the terminology, I 10 think, of an overwrite; is that right? 11 Α. Okay, yes. 12 Is that one word or two? Ο. 13 One word. Α. 14 Is that a term in the industry? Q. 15 Yeah, insurance industry, yes. Α. 16 And an overwrite is when an estimator basically Q. 17 writes for more parts or more labor than what a supervisor 18 later deems to have been necessary, right? 19 Α. Yes. 20 In fact, at State Farm, if you have too many Q. 21 overwrites it can negatively effect your salary, can't it? 22 It's possible. Α. 23 MR. KLEIN: May I have a moment, your Honor? 24 THE COURT: Yes. 25 MR. KLEIN: Is it okay if I use a computer for

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 133

1	a moment please to show him
2	THE COURT: Well, it depends what you're going
3	to show. I don't mind you using a computer, but I think
4	we're entitled to see what you intend to show him.
5	MR. KLEIN: I intend to show him his
6	deposition testimony.
7	MR. TOMSKY: We have it. He's welcome to use
8	our copy.
9	THE COURT: We're off now.
10	(A discussion was held off the record.)
11	Q. The page number, by the way, is 33 and 34.
12	Have you had a chance to review your testimony,
13	Mr. Thiele? First of all, I draw your attention to page 35,
14	which is, obviously, the next page. I'm sorry, it is on page
15	34. There is a question read to you during your deposition
16	do you remember being deposed?
17	A. Yes.
18	Q and the question was:
19	"QUESTION: Initially, based upon the impression
20	that your bonus could be determined by minimizing overwrites,
21	right?
22	A. Well, it's not necessarily a bonus.
23	Q. No. No. That was the question on line 16 and 17,
24	right?
25	A. Right.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 134

i	
1	Q. And, in fact, the question was: "So your bonus is
2	determined by minimizing overwrites"; correct?
3	A. Yes.
4	Q. And would you mind reading what your answer was,
5	please?
6	A. I'm not sure the threshold part or
7	Q. The answer to that question beginning on line 18.
8	A. 18? "Over the years, the 22 years"?
9	Q. No. Okay, you're on page 34.
10	A. 35. You said 35.
11	Q. The confusion is my fault.
12	THE COURT: All right, line 16:
13	"QUESTION: So your bonus is determined by
14	minimizing the overwrites?
15	ANSWER: Not my bonus, my salary increase, so
16	the salary increase at the end of the year is determined
17	by my performance throughout the year and the overwrites
18	are a part of that performance."
19	Do you want any further reading?
20	MR. KLEIN: Thank you, your Honor.
21	Q. In your experience, anything over 10 percent is
22	considered not good, right?
23	A. It would be an issue, yeah.
24	Q. Well, do you remember actually using the words "not
25	good" during your deposition? Do you remember?

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 Α. I don't remember, no. I call your attention to page 35, lines 18 to 20. 2 0. 3 Would you mind reading your answer that is reflected on those 4 lines, please? 5 "I mean, over the years the 22 years, anything over Α. 6 10 percent is not good." Now, Mr. Thiele, as far as you understand the 7 Ο. industry, State Farm is allowed to dictate certain limits on 8 9 the amount of insurance coverage that it will provide to the 10 general public, right? 11 I don't know that. Α. Well, there is a difference between the amount of 12 0. 13 money an insurance company will cover or the amount of money 14 that State Farm would cover and the amount of money an 15 insured driver wants to devote to fixing a vehicle. That's 16 possible, right? 17 MR. TOMSKY: Objection. Sustained. I don't even 18 THE COURT: 19 understand the question. 20 Suppose a motorist was in an accident, okay? Q. 21 Α. Yes. 22 And suppose the car suffered damage in excess of Q. what State Farm would ordinarily deem a total, okay? 23 24 Α. Okay. 25 Ο. If the motorist wanted to, the motorist could still

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 136

1	ask the auto body shop to continue working, couldn't they?			
2	A. Sure.			
3	Q. And what would happen in this case would be that			
4	State Farm just would probably not cover that expense, right?			
5	A. Right.			
6	Q. But that doesn't mean that the motorist can't still			
7	ask the auto body shop to perform the services, right?			
8	A. Sure.			
9	Q. And that's because there is a difference between			
10	the relationship between a customer and the auto body shop			
11	and that person and their insurance company, right?			
12	A. Okay.			
13	Q. Right?			
14	A. Yeah.			
15	Q. And so the limitations on an insurance policy do			
16	not govern what an auto body shop can do, do they?			
17	MR. TOMSKY: Objection to that			
18	characterization. It's not a policy. It's not in the			
19	policy. It's not what he testified to.			
20	THE COURT: Could you read the question back,			
21	please, Pat?			
22	(The requested portion was read.)			
23	THE COURT: It's calling for a conclusion that			
24	he can't draw. I'm going to sustain the objection.			
25	MR. KLEIN: I'm sorry, could you just read the			

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

1 question again so I could think of another way to ask it? 2 3 THE COURT: Please, Pat. 4 (The requested portion was read.) 5 Ο. If a motorist wants to continue repairs on their 6 vehicle and the insurance company says you're on your own, it 7 is reasonable for the auto body shop to abide by its customers wishes, isn't it? 8 9 Α. Sure. 10 Are you familiar with whether Courtney Pope was Ο. 11 over financed on her Nissan? 12 I have no idea. Α. 13 Do you know what over financed means? Never heard 0. 14 that term? 15 I've heard the term, yeah. I never looked into it Α. 16 though. 17 Ο. It's when, correct me if I'm wrong, a motorist has 18 more debt on the car than what it's worth, right? 19 Α. Sure. 20 And so in those cases, if the car is totaled, they Q. 21 actually still theoretically can owe money, right? 22 Α. Sure. Isn't that one reason why a motorist might want 23 Ο. 24 work to continue? 25 MR. TOMSKY: Objection, calls for speculation.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 138

1	THE COURT: Sustained.
2	Q. Have you ever heard the term corrective repairs?
3	A. Yes.
4	Q. What's a corrective repair, in general?
5	A. A shop might have fixed the vehicle in the past and
б	it wasn't done to a quality standard and it had to be redone.
7	Q. By whom?
8	A. Whatever repair shop.
9	Q. And, in fact, corrective repairs, or using your
10	description, basically re-repairs, can add to the complexity
11	of the job, right?
12	A. A repair job, yes.
13	Q. It can actually inflate the cost of repairing a
14	vehicle, right?
15	A. Sure.
16	Q. And if the corrective repair is not made, the
17	motorist can be operating an unsafe vehicle, right?
18	A. Possible.
19	Q. Well, if the first repair needed a corrective
20	repair, then by definition there was a problem with it,
21	right?
22	A. It could have just been body work or paint.
23	Q. Now, you testified on direct, and I think I'm
24	quoting exactly right, but you can tell me if I'm not, that
25	any repair shop could have repaired at the same price, and

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 139

1	that was in reference to Courtney Pope's Nissan, right?				
2	A. Okay, yes.				
3	Q. Is that right? Any repair shop could have done it,				
4	right?				
5	A. Within my market area, yes.				
6	Q. Could any repair shop have also screwed it up?				
7	A. Yes, that's possible too.				
8	Q. And if they had screwed it up, it might have				
9	required a corrective repair, right?				
10	A. It's possible.				
11	Q. And one thing that factors into the quality of an				
12	auto body shop is how often do they need corrective repairs,				
13	isn't it?				
14	A. Possibly, yeah.				
15	Q. So even if an auto body shop could have performed a				
16	repair, that doesn't say anything about the risk that it				
17	would fail to do that safely, right?				
18	A. I don't know. I'm guessing.				
19	Q. What?				
20	A. I don't know.				
21	Q. You don't know you don't know whether it's				
22	relevant?				
23	THE COURT: No. I'm sorry, could you read the				
24	question back, please, Pat?				
25	(The requested portion was read.)				

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 in 140

1 Α. I don't understand the question. MR. KLEIN: I will rephrase it. 2 3 You testified that any repair shop could have done Ο. 4 these repairs, right? 5 Α. Yes. 6 0. But the fact that other repair shops could have 7 done them doesn't take into account the difference in risk between getting it done properly, does it? 8 MR. TOMSKY: Objection. 9 10 I will allow him to answer it, if THE COURT: 11 he can. 12 I don't know. I mean, it's -- honestly, I don't Α. 13 know how to answer that. It's -- it could be done, it could 14 not be done right. Each shop does repairs differently. 15 Each shop does repairs differently? 0. 16 Α. Sure. 17 Q. But you pay most of them the same? 18 Α. Yes. 19 MR. KLEIN: This is an exhibit that was not --20 I didn't know it would be necessary until his direct 21 testimony. 22 THE COURT: All right, I think we're going to 23 pick that up then tomorrow morning, if we're starting 24 with new exhibits. 25 MR. KLEIN: It's very quick. It's very quick.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 in 141

THE COURT: Let's get it done, a couple questions. (Whereupon, Defendant's Exhibit-YY was marked for identification.) MR. KLEIN: Your Honor, permission to hand a copy of this exhibit to the witness, please. THE COURT: You may. Mr. Thiele, take a moment to read the document and Q. let me know when you've had the chance. Α. Okay. Is this a letter sent to a State Farm customer? Ο. THE COURT: He can't answer that question. It's not in evidence. It's only marked for ID. Do you recognize this document? Q. No, I do not. Α. Do you recognize a -- any documents like this? Q. Α. No, I don't. It looks like it was sent from a claim handler. I mean, your Honor, I view this as MR. KLEIN: a party admission, a document used against the adversary. THE COURT: Absolutely not. That is a huge stretch. This is not an admission. It's not even in this case. MR. KLEIN: Right, but we're using it against

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 Michael Thiele - Cross/Klein 142

1	State Farm.				
2	THE COURT: Okay, we are recessing for the				
3	day. I would like to see both attorneys at the bench				
4	when we get settled.				
5	Okay, you could step down. We'll see you				
6	tomorrow morning at 10. I'm sorry, Monday morning at				
7	10.				
8					
9	* * * * * * * *				
10					
11	CERTIFIED TO BE A TRUE AND ACCURATE TRANSCRIPT OF THE STENOGRAPHIC MINUTES				
12	TAKEN HEREIN:				
13					
14					
15	PATRICIA HOLSGROVE, RPR OFFICIAL COURT REPORTER				
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 1

\$	10th [3] - 103:23,	20th [7] - 87:25, 92:4,	5	accepted [1] - 54:14
Ψ	103:25, 116:17	100:9, 101:11,	5	accepts [1] - 42:23
\$1,280 [1] - 8:18	11010 [1] - 35:2	102:14, 106:6	5,500 [1] - 36:13	access [1] - 79:24
\$1,823.76 [1] - 41:23	11501 [1] - 1:10	22 [6] - 63:16, 63:24,	5,601 [1] - 15:10	accident [4] - 11:12,
\$10,802.70 [2] -	11530 [1] - 1:19	100:2, 100:3, 134:8,	5,601.12 [1] - 15:20	36:6, 126:9, 135:20
100:25, 101:5	12 [2] - 1:10, 66:1	135:5	50 [3] - 23:22, 81:6,	accompanying [1] -
\$100 [1] - 124:24	120 [6] - 47:15, 58:16,	225 [1] - 18:17	114:20	41:7
\$120 [15] - 46:16,	115:19, 116:8, 116:9	23 [3] - 20:6, 20:12,	500 [1] - 52:15	according [1] - 18:2
46:18, 47:11, 48:12,	12020 [1] - 63:2	41:20	51 [1] - 89:21	account [3] - 50:4,
49:17, 57:9, 57:10,	125 [2] - 120:16,	238 [1] - 116:24	•	50:24, 140:7
57:16, 115:19,	124:19	244.8 [2] - 114:4, 115:8	6	accredited [1] - 19:24
115:24, 116:4, 116:15, 120:12,	128.8 [1] - 112:22	25 [9] - 1:2, 15:7,	6,000 [1] - 36:13	ACCURATE [1] - 142:11
120:14, 121:6	130 [1] - 104:12 14 [2] - 37:23, 38:1	15:18, 15:20, 19:3,	6-7 [1] - 11:7	accurate [1] - 104:16
\$125 [3] - 120:23,	14 [2] - 37.23, 38.1 140 [1] - 58:17	45:18, 64:5, 66:4,	6-7-17 [3] - 10:8,	acquiesced [1] -
124:8, 124:18		100:4	10:18, 11:4	29:23
\$13,377 [1] - 101:3	145 [2] - 117:6, 118:7 146 [1] - 8:5	25th [1] - 105:6	60 [1] - 81:6	acronym [1] - 35:23
\$140 [1] - 58:16	146 [1] - 108:19	27th [1] - 92:21	606797/2017 [1] - 1:5	acting [1] - 33:9
\$145 [1] - 116:18	15 [3] - 46:7, 51:18,	28 [1] - 116:25	630 [1] - 1:15	action [2] - 84:15,
\$17,052.51 [1] -	113:2	28th [1] - 31:6	666 [1] - 1:19	90:18
100:12	16 [2] - 133:23, 134:12	29 [1] - 23:2	69 [1] - 100:21	actual [9] - 9:1, 13:19,
\$174 [1] - 120:4	17 [2] - 31:6, 133:23	2:15 [1] - 61:22		20:9, 20:11, 20:25,
\$2,171.77 [1] - 13:1	175 [1] - 57:13		7	21:7, 26:16, 61:12,
\$2,500 [1] - 29:21	17th [2] - 24:16, 31:1	3	-	117:14
\$21,000 [3] - 5:8, 7:3,	18 [5] - 38:1, 66:7,		700 [1] - 1:19	add [2] - 56:11, 138:10
23:10	134:7, 134:8, 135:2	3 [2] - 24:7, 65:2	75 [4] - 28:10, 75:23,	ADD [1] - 31:5
\$225 [1] - 18:6	187 [1] - 106:19	3-17 [1] - 31:6	94:3, 94:6	added [2] - 11:8, 88:5
\$23,201.24 [1] - 104:4	194 [3] - 113:7,	3-28 [2] - 24:20, 24:21	7th [2] - 10:5, 10:10	addition [2] - 7:12,
\$28,999.89 ^[1] -	113:10, 113:25	300 [3] - 45:23, 51:16,		7:16
106:16	194.5 [1] - 113:14	51:20	8	additional [9] - 5:8,
\$29,000 [2] - 22:24	199.95 [1] - 119:17	31st [2] - 101:5, 101:6	9.3 rol 11.2 11.7	5:25, 7:13, 7:19,
\$3,674 [1] - 100:22	1st [4] - 105:11, 106:7,	33 [13] - 15:6, 15:7,	8-2 [3] - 11:3, 11:7 80 [1] - 116:24	11:1, 12:21, 23:10,
\$300 [1] - 84:24	106:11, 106:12	15:11, 15:19, 15:20,	80 [1] - 110.24 82 [1] - 57:19	94:25, 95:3
\$40,000 [1] - 22:19		16:8, 17:5, 17:14,	86.75 [1] - 50:19	additionally [1] -
\$49 [10] - 48:8, 49:3,	2	17:21, 19:1, 19:3, 45:18, 133:11	893 [1] - 35:1	49:23
50:16, 53:5, 54:8,	0	34 [3] - 133:11,	8th [3] - 124:7, 124:13,	address [17] - 13:8,
54:9, 89:17, 90:5,	2 [3] - 65:1, 65:2, 65:9	133:15, 134:9	124:17	13:9, 13:12, 13:15, 13:20, 14:11, 14:12,
90:13, 124:21	2,000 [1] - 29:21 2.8 [1] - 113:4	35 [4] - 133:13,	121.11	14:14, 14:25, 18:7,
\$5,601.12 [1] - 15:6		134:10, 135:2	9	34:24, 35:1, 62:25,
\$51 [1] - 90:8 \$6 969 89 [1] - 101:8	20 [7] - 14:13, 14:16, 41:22, 51:11, 51:13,	36 [1] - 104:9		63:7, 63:8, 63:10,
\$6,969.89 [1] - 101:8 \$69,000 [1] - 23:3	66:7, 135:2		9,300 [2] - 36:10,	63:11
\$90,000 [1] - 23:3	20-inch [1] - 20:14	4	36:12	adequate [1] - 69:4
\$95 [1] - 125:6	2001 [4] - 35:20,	•	9,400 [1] - 36:14	adjusters [1] - 59:6
	35:25, 36:4, 36:9	40 [5] - 23:3, 46:7,	93 [1] - 36:13	adjustor [1] - 30:23
	2005 [1] - 38:14	106:2, 106:7, 106:14		admirable [2] - 27:9,
	2009 [1] - 36:10	44 [1] - 84:21	Α	27:12
'87 [1] - 38:10	2012 [4] - 124:23,	468 [4] - 13:21, 14:21,	A A	admission [2] -
	125:6, 125:14,	14:23, 14:24	AA [1] - 116:22	141:20, 141:23
1	125:17	47.9 ^[1] - 112:25	ABC [2] - 54:25	advance [2] - 30:10,
	2015 [4] - 68:6, 81:21,	478 [4] - 13:10, 13:17,	abide [2] - 129:18,	40:21
1 [2] - 65:2, 65:3	91:12, 100:6	14:17, 14:18	137:7 able [6] - 10:14, 10:21,	advanced [1] - 36:3
1.33 [2] - 15:11, 15:17	2017 [11] - 10:5, 10:10,	49 [2] - 89:19, 89:23	40:9, 45:24, 56:8,	adversary [2] - 38:21,
10 [8] - 29:7, 59:21,	24:17, 83:21, 88:2,	490 [1] - 18:18	40.9, 45.24, 56.8, 60:23	141:21
67:20, 112:2,	92:19, 100:9, 101:5,	4th [8] - 92:19, 94:18,	absolutely [1] -	advice [3] - 107:21,
134:21, 135:6,	102:25, 105:7,	94:19, 102:24, 103:1, 103:14,	141:22	110:16, 110:22
142:6, 142:7	105:11	103:16, 103:18	acceded [1] - 109:19	advocate [1] - 27:8
10,082 [1] - 101:6	2018 [6] - 1:10, 33:17,	100.10, 100.10	accept [4] - 28:14,	AEA [1] - 63:21
10017 [1] - 1:15	33:22, 116:17,		54:9, 55:9, 78:9	aeronautic [1] - 45:16
108 [1] - 41:3	124:7, 124:17			affiliated [1] - 38:14

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

affirm [2] - 34:17,	52:19	128:1, 128:4, 128:5,	authorize [3] - 91:16,	В
62:19	alone [1] - 106:1	128:17	91:19, 128:16	<u> </u>
affixed [1] - 47:24	alternative [1] - 73:1	approved [13] - 66:15,	authorized [2] - 3:5,	balance [1] - 32:24
afford [1] - 54:20	aluminum [11] - 20:14,	96:13, 115:23,	3:17	ball [1] - 25:23
afield [1] - 46:3	39:14, 39:25, 41:22,	116:3, 116:14,	Auto [39] - 12:3,	Ballston [1] - 63:2
aftermarket [1] - 128:1	47:18, 49:22, 50:8,	116:18, 117:7,	12:25, 13:4, 13:23,	Band [2] - 123:19,
afternoon [4] - 2:11,	52:9, 57:12, 59:2,	117:9, 120:4,	14:3, 14:21, 14:25,	123:21
35:6, 56:21, 98:14	59:3	120:12, 121:3,	15:5, 15:16, 15:19,	Band-Aid [2] - 123:19,
ago [11] - 30:5, 48:15,	America [3] - 127:9,	124:7, 124:17	16:4, 16:9, 16:12,	123:21
48:16, 61:9, 100:24,	127:14, 128:1	April [7] - 87:25, 92:4,	17:1, 17:13, 20:6,	bankruptcy [1] - 126:1
116:17, 123:8,	amount [34] - 8:18,	100:9, 101:11,	20:12, 31:18, 31:22,	bar [2] - 95:20, 96:3
124:11, 124:12,	10:3, 10:22, 15:12,	102:14, 106:6	35:23, 39:6, 39:9,	BARKET [1] - 1:18
124:23, 126:6	15:19, 17:20, 23:23,	area [14] - 37:12,	41:2, 41:5, 41:9,	based [17] - 6:11, 7:4,
agree [4] - 93:24,	28:5, 29:15, 46:6,	39:24, 46:8, 47:19,	41:19, 41:21, 44:9,	13:4, 45:20, 50:14,
93:25, 94:24, 96:10	47:6, 47:16, 53:21,	48:5, 50:12, 55:21,	44:10, 44:11, 44:13,	53:11, 66:20, 70:7,
agreed [9] - 6:16,	55:4, 58:20, 59:18,	65:22, 65:25, 70:6,	44:15, 44:23, 59:1,	70:8, 70:11, 70:14,
6:24, 57:16, 73:22,	59:20, 66:21, 69:4,	82:23, 90:10, 90:21,	84:6, 84:9, 84:22	80:25, 81:1, 85:10,
75:19, 79:9, 82:15,	69:7, 69:10, 69:16,	139:5	auto [35] - 15:5, 37:19,	130:1, 130:5, 133:19
82:22, 120:14	71:12, 76:1, 79:2,	areas [1] - 25:6	37:20, 39:16, 51:6,	basic [3] - 65:4, 65:7,
agreement [6] - 3:5,	80:11, 97:23, 101:1,	argue [1] - 27:7	51:12, 51:20, 52:1,	65:10
19:6, 54:17, 55:8,	114:7, 131:14,	Armada [5] - 68:7,	55:16, 55:17, 60:19,	basis [4] - 30:17, 36:8,
58:2, 60:19	135:9, 135:12,	81:21, 82:13, 91:12,	63:19, 78:16, 98:21,	66:14, 78:13
agreements [1] -	135:13, 135:14	100:6	109:25, 115:20,	BB _[1] - 116:22
83:24	analysis [1] - 65:7	arrive [1] - 74:24	115:23, 116:4,	BE [1] - 142:11
ahead [4] - 8:8, 24:19,	AND [1] - 142:11	aspects [2] - 13:6,	116:7, 116:14,	became [7] - 28:6,
67:21, 78:20	angle [2] - 42:9,	21:6	116:18, 121:10,	37:15, 37:16, 44:15,
Aid [2] - 123:19,	117:25	assemblies [1] -	121:17, 123:4,	50:25, 76:23, 110:21
123:21	answer [26] - 19:19,	127:16	129:17, 129:21,	become [3] - 28:19,
aim [1] - 117:20	22:1, 26:6, 27:7,	assembly [1] - 48:2	131:19, 131:20,	37:3, 54:4
aiming [8] - 117:16,	46:4, 56:11, 57:22,	assessment [2] - 28:6,	136:1, 136:7,	becomes [1] - 28:11
117:18, 117:22,	58:1, 60:24, 78:20,	47:11	136:10, 136:16,	began [1] - 9:21
118:1, 118:2,	78:25, 88:18, 97:17,	assign [2] - 4:20, 6:10	137:7, 139:12,	beginning [2] - 60:25,
120:21, 121:21,	110:6, 111:2,	assignment [3] -	139:15	134:7
122:2	118:23, 119:1,	32:15, 32:16, 81:15	automobile [2] -	behalf [3] - 3:24, 4:3,
airbags [2] - 65:12,	119:2, 123:14,	assist [3] - 36:2,	125:8, 127:23	4:14
76:17	132:3, 134:4, 134:7,	39:15, 65:14	AUTOMOBILE [1] -	behind [1] - 87:12
ALDEA [1] - 1:18	135:3, 140:10,	associated [1] - 42:13	1:4	
alert [1] - 68:5	140:13, 141:12	association [1] - 50:9	automobiles [3] -	belonging [1] - 100:7 bench [1] - 142:3
ALEXANDER [1] -	ANSWER [1] - 134:15	assume [4] - 9:18,	64:12, 98:18, 98:20	
1:20	answered [2] - 30:3,	21:4, 121:22, 121:23	automotive [1] -	Benz [2] - 39:12,
align [1] - 119:14	126:6	assuming [1] - 44:20	125:21	125:10
aligned [1] - 117:24	answers [1] - 125:12	assumption [2] -	availability [1] - 71:9	best [6] - 22:5, 29:2,
alignment [5] -	anytime [1] - 11:7	130:1, 130:5	available [3] - 71:4,	29:24, 32:20,
117:15, 117:19,	apart [2] - 43:24, 77:9	attached [4] - 44:23,	85:16, 85:17	125:12, 128:24
119:11, 119:13,	apologize [7] - 19:23,	47:24, 69:11, 69:20	Avenue [7] - 1:15,	better [4] - 68:5, 73:2,
120:21	20:5, 26:7, 27:15,	attaching [1] - 48:2	13:10, 13:17, 14:13,	80:14, 97:19
allegedly [1] - 84:2	34:4, 58:4, 84:5	attachment [1] - 77:17	14:16, 14:24, 59:12	between [26] - 3:5, 5:12, 6:24, 11:7,
allow [11] - 21:23,	applied [1] - 42:9	attendees [1] - 36:11	average [8] - 46:8,	
32:5, 43:9, 53:8,	appraisal [10] - 24:11,	attention [6] - 3:15,	49:25, 50:6, 52:18,	23:13, 32:25, 33:4, 38:16, 44:17, 46:7,
72:4, 73:10, 90:15,	24:12, 24:14, 25:1,	8:5, 116:23, 126:5,	53:9, 66:2, 81:6	
97:7, 97:10, 123:14,	26:15, 26:16, 26:25,	133:13, 135:2	averaged [1] - 36:10	54:17, 54:22, 66:7, 68:3, 71:23, 72:2
140:10	27:2, 30:6, 30:25	attorney [1] - 56:23	aware [13] - 5:12,	68:3, 71:23, 72:2, 79:5, 80:17, 81:6
allowance [2] - 51:2,	Appraiser [1] - 63:19	Attorneys [2] - 1:14,	5:18, 11:11, 16:21,	79:5, 80:17, 81:6, 84:25, 114:6,
51:3	appraising [1] - 65:7	1:18	22:18, 22:23, 32:1,	129:20, 135:12,
allowed [5] - 39:20,	appreciate [1] - 115:6	attorneys [1] - 142:3	33:4, 57:8, 57:14,	
67:6, 97:12, 97:22,	appropriate [5] - 30:7,	Audi [12] - 19:25,	58:2, 68:8	136:9, 136:10, 140:8
135:8	42:18, 45:1, 84:15,		axle [1] - 87:12	beyond [1] - 78:16
alloy [4] - 20:14, 21:8,	114:16	39:12, 117:3, 117:5, 117:11, 118:6		bill [107] - 7:6, 7:23,
41:22, 84:11	approve [8] - 37:8,	117:11, 118:6, 118:7, 118:12		7:25, 8:6, 8:10, 8:17,
almost [2] - 23:12,	55:2, 121:6, 127:15,	118:7, 118:12, 110:7, 110:16, 120:2		9:5, 9:9, 9:12, 9:14,
amost [2] - 23.12,		119:7, 119:16, 120:2		9:17, 10:5, 10:14,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 3

11:6, 11:8, 12:1,	121:17, 123:5,	0	carrier [2] - 7:7, 28:8	133:12, 141:9
12:4, 12:15, 12:24,	123:15, 129:17,	С	cars [11] - 22:6, 22:16,	change [7] - 7:3, 70:8,
12:25, 13:5, 13:6,	129:21, 131:19,	coloulate un E0:0		• • • •
		calculate [2] - 50:3,	38:6, 39:25, 55:21,	71:12, 71:20, 86:5,
13:9, 13:23, 13:25,	131:21, 136:1,	50:10	56:6, 64:16, 66:3,	98:8, 103:15
14:3, 15:6, 15:16,	136:7, 136:10,	calculator [2] - 101:9	90:11, 90:12, 125:14	changes [1] - 81:3
15:17, 15:18, 16:4,	136:16, 137:7,	calendar [1] - 106:7	case [46] - 5:9, 5:18,	characterization [1] -
16:7, 16:9, 16:25,	138:22, 139:12,	California [1] - 39:10	6:15, 6:20, 7:4, 7:5,	136:18
17:4, 17:13, 18:3,	139:15	cannot [2] - 75:20,	7:8, 20:20, 20:24,	charge [12] - 6:17,
20:2, 20:6, 20:13,	bolted [1] - 47:25	107:17	23:24, 26:5, 27:7,	8:12, 8:17, 18:10,
21:4, 21:5, 28:6,	bonus [7] - 66:20,	capacity [2] - 33:10,	28:5, 34:18, 45:23,	20:13, 47:16, 47:19,
29:9, 29:20, 32:2,	67:15, 133:20,	40:2	46:19, 47:12, 48:7,	50:15, 54:19, 58:16,
32:6, 32:22, 32:23,	133:22, 134:1,	car [109] - 7:15, 8:22,	58:6, 58:8, 62:20,	58:20, 118:6
40:12, 40:15, 40:19,	134:13, 134:15	8:24, 11:20, 12:1,	80:1, 81:18, 81:22,	charged [8] - 41:17,
40:21, 41:1, 41:9,	bonuses [2] - 66:16,	12:22, 14:14, 20:10,	85:23, 88:17, 88:18,	44:10, 47:6, 117:5,
41:13, 41:15, 41:19,	66:17	22:3, 22:4, 23:13,	89:25, 90:18, 91:17,	118:7, 119:17,
41:21, 44:13, 44:15,	book [1] - 61:17	24:15, 28:8, 28:10,	98:7, 100:18,	120:14, 124:2
44:16, 44:21, 44:22,	booths [1] - 49:24	28:15, 28:18, 28:21,	105:19, 105:22,	charges [4] - 15:10,
44:23, 45:15, 46:11,	boron [1] - 57:12	28:23, 29:1, 29:8,	107:18, 108:11,	18:3, 53:5, 76:12
46:12, 46:13, 46:24,	bottom [1] - 130:22	30:11, 41:14, 42:7,	110:10, 110:11,	charging [2] - 8:10,
47:4, 55:12, 83:16,	bought [1] - 20:20	43:6, 43:22, 44:8,	118:12, 122:12,	49:3
83:21, 83:25, 84:2,	brakes [1] - 87:12	46:19, 53:4, 53:13,	123:6, 124:9,	cheap [2] - 45:25,
84:6, 84:9, 84:22,	breach [4] - 5:19, 7:8,	40.19, 55.4, 55.15, 54:24, 61:5, 61:6,	129:23, 131:17,	52:23
85:2, 96:6, 97:11,	7:16, 33:21	70:12, 72:13, 74:6,	136:3, 141:24	cheaper [1] - 129:13
109:22, 110:12,	,		cases [7] - 33:18,	
110:20, 110:24,	break [6] - 16:11,	74:8, 74:13, 75:19, 76:4, 76:6, 76:7,	45:5, 52:20, 55:11,	check [4] - 15:7, 15:9, 47:9, 106:5
111:12, 111:15,	50:11, 50:20,		99:11, 99:12, 137:20	
111:18, 111:20,	109:12, 111:23,	76:16, 76:22, 77:8,	Catapala [1] - 35:1	checked [2] - 104:15,
112:13, 112:18,	111:25	77:11, 77:13, 77:20,	catching [1] - 54:4	117:24
114:21, 114:22,	Brian [1] - 89:11	77:25, 78:10, 79:2,		checking [1] - 118:15
114:25, 115:4,	brief [1] - 60:15	79:3, 79:24, 85:11,	category [1] - 91:13	choose [5] - 4:19,
115:5, 115:12,	briefly [9] - 27:24,	85:22, 85:25, 87:6,	caused [1] - 48:5	4:20, 6:10, 73:10,
115:14, 117:2,	33:14, 47:21, 64:18,	87:15, 88:16, 89:3,	center [1] - 59:10	74:14
119:10, 120:1,	65:3, 66:13, 68:1,	89:12, 96:9, 98:24,	Centre [4] - 13:10,	chosen [1] - 37:7
129:21	68:11	98:25, 99:2, 99:7,	14:13, 14:16, 14:24	chrome [1] - 85:23
	bring [6] - 22:16,	99:10, 99:15, 99:16,	certain [22] - 52:17,	City [1] - 1:19
billed [2] - 109:20, 119:16	23:12, 54:24, 56:3,	99:17, 99:19, 99:24,	53:21, 55:4, 59:18,	city [1] - 39:22
	56:4, 61:6	100:15, 100:20,	59:20, 61:16, 64:20,	civil [3] - 5:3, 5:16,
billing [2] - 11:2,	bringing [1] - 99:7	102:3, 102:9,	64:23, 65:1, 67:2,	7:17
109:24	broadly [1] - 41:12	102:15, 103:11,	67:21, 72:9, 76:10,	claim [13] - 42:24,
bills [4] - 16:14, 18:17,	broke [4] - 45:24,	103:17, 104:13,	80:11, 85:18, 91:3,	55:3, 68:6, 76:2,
44:17, 54:3	50:20, 53:25, 54:2	105:16, 107:11,	91:5, 91:15, 97:23,	76:11, 79:10, 82:13,
bit [5] - 26:3, 26:14,	broken [1] - 68:22	107:17, 107:25,	110:15, 117:25,	82:25, 83:6, 98:8,
61:24, 64:17, 74:1	brought [3] - 32:19,	109:4, 109:5, 110:9,	135:8	108:5, 108:10,
block [1] - 56:5	98:20, 98:21	113:11, 113:14,	certainly [1] - 15:9	141:18
blocks [1] - 37:24	buffing [1] - 38:6	114:1, 114:7, 114:8,	certification [4] -	claims [3] - 30:14,
BMW [1] - 120:5	built [2] - 50:23,	114:23, 115:1,	19:17, 64:19, 64:24,	37:10, 37:17
Bob [5] - 88:20, 89:11,	127:24	115:8, 115:13,	65:1	clarified [1] - 29:14
93:11, 93:20, 115:1	bullet [1] - 42:10	116:10, 116:11,	certifications [8] -	clarify [3] - 4:10,
Body [1] - 39:6	bumper [2] - 69:18,	122:14, 123:24,	19:11, 19:12, 39:17,	15:14, 110:8
body [45] - 36:16,	79:22	124:14, 126:8,	52:8, 64:6, 64:8,	clarifying [1] - 12:14
37:19, 37:20, 39:16,		126:13, 128:11,	91:9, 91:11	class [4] - 58:24,
39:23, 47:24, 51:6,	burden [1] - 62:2	135:22, 137:18,	Certified [2] - 13:5,	
51:12, 51:21, 52:1,	business [3] - 14:11,	137:20	18:25	59:19, 64:21, 64:22
55:16, 55:17, 59:2,	49:11, 63:8	CAR [9] - 35:23,	certified [2] - 39:11,	classes [10] - 35:16,
60:19, 73:14, 78:16,	busy [1] - 53:25	35:24, 36:7, 36:9,	91:9	35:22, 35:25, 36:17,
92:2, 95:14, 96:12,	buy [2] - 56:8, 123:20	37:5, 58:25, 61:17,	CERTIFIED [1] -	58:25, 59:20, 59:22,
97:4, 97:5, 97:12,	buying [1] - 74:9	64:8, 64:18	142:11	61:13, 61:14, 61:18
97:21, 98:21,	BY [10] - 1:16, 1:20,	car's [1] - 113:2		classification [1] -
109:25, 110:10,	2:20, 28:1, 33:16,	care [2] - 26:4, 40:8	cetera [1] - 4:16	114:9
110:11, 112:21,	35:5, 56:20, 60:17,	carefully [1] - 27:6	challenging [1] -	classify [1] - 39:3
116:6, 121:10,	63:6, 98:13	Carolina [1] - 39:7	97:20	classroom [1] - 61:14
. 10.0, 121.10,		Gal Ullia [1] - 39.7	chance [3] - 120:9,	clause [1] - 24:14
4				

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019

cleaning [1] - 38:6	55:16, 55:18	17:8, 19:16, 136:23	cooperation [1] -	120:17, 121:12,
clear [11] - 3:7, 8:9,	companies [10] -	condition [16] - 21:15,	27:21	121:13, 122:10,
13:25, 29:22, 32:18,	31:20, 33:21, 35:15,	21:20, 22:5, 22:7,	copy [7] - 40:12, 78:1,	123:25, 125:10,
61:23, 76:14, 84:12,	39:14, 39:18, 50:2,	22:15, 22:17, 28:23,	111:20, 111:21,	126:17, 127:18,
89:10, 98:1, 126:8	54:13, 54:14, 54:24	41:14, 46:19, 75:21,	113:16, 133:8, 141:6	129:21, 129:22,
		99:2, 99:7, 100:12,		129:23, 130:6,
clearly [1] - 75:7	Company [2] - 36:22, 37:2	104:5, 114:24, 115:9	corner [1] - 91:10	130:13, 131:1,
CLERK [9] - 2:1,			corners [2] - 53:13,	134:2, 137:17
34:15, 34:22, 62:11,	COMPANY [1] - 1:5	conditions [1] - 80:14	53:18	
62:17, 62:24, 96:18,	company [31] - 3:21,	conduct [1] - 82:25	corporate [2] - 63:7,	corrected [1] - 10:15 correction [1] - 115:6
112:4, 112:7	6:15, 24:15, 28:11,	conference [5] -	63:9	
client [2] - 39:3	28:21, 35:10, 35:11,	48:20, 48:21, 57:5,	corporations [1] -	corrective [7] - 138:2,
clients [2] - 39:4, 39:5	35:12, 39:17, 41:2,	58:23, 64:11	17:9	138:4, 138:9,
clip [1] - 59:16	42:23, 45:2, 45:3,	Conference [2] -	correct [149] - 3:3,	138:16, 138:19, 120:0, 120:12
close [7] - 21:15,	45:13, 54:15, 54:18,	35:23, 58:25	3:21, 3:24, 4:14,	139:9, 139:12
21:20, 22:15, 93:25,	54:23, 55:3, 55:6,	confine [1] - 46:1	4:23, 5:1, 5:4, 5:9,	correspond [1] -
105:23, 105:25,	55:11, 55:17, 56:1,	confirm [1] - 94:18	5:20, 6:1, 6:5, 6:13,	117:2
124:24	56:2, 63:13, 64:1,	conflict [1] - 84:22	6:18, 6:19, 6:22,	cost [31] - 4:15, 9:17,
code [3] - 130:25,	66:18, 129:14,	confused [3] - 25:10,	6:25, 7:1, 7:9, 7:14,	9:25, 39:23, 44:22,
131:3, 131:6	129:19, 135:13,	43:10, 97:15	8:19, 8:23, 10:3,	45:6, 49:22, 49:24,
colleague [1] - 100:23	136:11, 137:6	confusing [1] - 109:12	10:4, 10:6, 10:10,	50:6, 50:25, 51:1,
collect [1] - 24:1	compare [3] - 45:19,	confusion [1] - 134:11	10:19, 11:19, 12:1,	71:5, 71:18, 71:20,
college [1] - 38:2	51:25, 52:12	connection [5] - 33:5,	12:2, 12:16, 12:23,	72:2, 73:1, 85:16,
collided [1] - 42:1	comparison [2] -	36:7, 37:20, 108:10,	13:4, 13:6, 13:7,	85:17, 99:5, 99:7,
COLLISION [2] - 1:7,	100:19, 129:9	125:7	14:25, 15:22, 15:24,	99:9, 99:13, 99:14,
1:8	competitive [1] -	considered [4] -	15:25, 16:3, 16:5,	99:17, 99:18, 99:23,
Collision [39] - 3:4,	91:25	67:18, 76:18, 79:9,	16:6, 16:8, 16:13,	100:11, 110:17,
5:12, 5:17, 5:24,	complaining [1] -	134:22	16:16, 17:15, 17:16,	131:14, 138:13
7:14, 7:25, 8:9, 8:21,	29:10	consistently [1] -	17:18, 17:19, 17:22,	cost-effective [4] -
9:3, 12:20, 13:24,	complete [1] - 101:11	38:11	18:4, 18:20, 19:24,	39:23, 45:6, 85:16,
16:9, 18:8, 31:19,	completed [5] - 32:23,	construction [1] -	20:16, 21:5, 21:9,	85:17
31:21, 33:1, 35:23,	44:9, 97:5, 115:13,	45:16	22:5, 22:10, 22:15,	costs [2] - 23:4, 49:25
38:25, 39:6, 39:7,	123:17	constructive [2] -	22:25, 23:4, 24:22,	counsel [2] - 26:2,
40:2, 40:19, 44:8,	complex [2] - 125:1,	77:3, 77:5	24:23, 25:3, 25:7,	58:3
48:12, 48:18, 48:19,	125:11	consult [1] - 35:15	25:9, 26:17, 26:25,	country [4] - 38:16,
49:3, 49:20, 50:15,	complexity [2] -	consultant [1] - 35:18	27:19, 31:17, 32:16,	38:19, 52:14, 70:9
51:25, 59:1, 82:12,	47:22, 138:10	Consultants [3] -	40:16, 41:4, 43:13,	Country [1] - 1:19
82:16, 88:8, 88:13,	complicated [15] -	35:13, 35:14, 37:16	46:25, 52:19, 56:25, 57:3, 57:7, 58:14,	County [5] - 65:23,
89:4, 92:10, 93:16,	121:16, 121:18,	consulting [3] - 38:18,	, , ,	82:3, 90:23, 91:25
125:7	121:19, 121:23,	40:2, 51:17	58:18, 58:20, 58:21, 60:3, 71:24, 72:24,	COUNTY [1] - 1:2
collision [15] - 24:17,	121:25, 122:1,	consumer [7] - 24:13,		couple [7] - 2:12,
35:15, 35:16, 36:2,	122:2, 122:4, 122:6,	28:16, 28:24, 54:20,	79:20, 80:2, 80:3, 84:13, 85:8, 86:14,	40:5, 57:2, 64:14,
38:5, 38:13, 38:16,	122:8, 122:21,	55:20, 56:1, 57:20		90:24, 95:15, 141:1
39:16, 45:17, 46:2,	123:4, 123:10,	consumers [1] - 56:3	86:19, 93:5, 93:9, 94:9, 94:22, 98:5,	course [5] - 37:5,
52:15, 57:15, 79:23,	123:18, 123:21	contact [1] - 51:13	94.9, 94.22, 98.5, 99:8, 99:25, 101:24,	51:4, 59:1, 84:15,
92:20, 127:12	comply [2] - 128:24,	contention [1] -	99:8, 99:25, 101:24, 103:9, 103:13,	122:14
Collision/M.V.B [2] -	131:21	113:10	103:15, 104:5,	courses [6] - 38:18,
6:25, 14:8	components [2] -	continue [8] - 95:5,	103.15, 104.3, 104:12,	64:20, 64:21, 65:4,
coming [7] - 30:10,	48:4, 87:13	109:25, 110:12,	105:20, 105:21,	65:5, 65:11
36:4, 64:16, 65:13,	compound [1] -	111:9, 112:9, 136:1,	106:16, 107:15,	court [3] - 5:4, 20:11,
69:9, 98:14, 107:8	109:11	137:5, 137:24	107:16, 107:19,	21:6
commenced [2] -	computer [5] - 11:6,	continued [1] - 97:4	107:23, 108:1,	COURT [165] - 1:1,
28:9, 61:2	122:15, 123:9,	contract [8] - 5:19,	107.23, 108.1, 108:3, 108:4, 108:6,	1:23, 2:1, 2:5, 2:9,
commences [1] - 61:3	132:25, 133:3	7:8, 7:16, 32:25,	109:7, 109:16,	2:14, 2:17, 3:12, 4:5,
comment [1] - 25:15	concerning [5] - 3:4,	33:4, 33:21, 54:22,	110:22, 111:7,	4:11, 7:21, 8:3, 8:16,
comments [2] - 26:3,	28:4, 94:21, 96:5,	55:1	114:4, 114:5,	12:8, 13:22, 14:2,
56:11	96:11	contractual [1] - 54:17	114:16, 115:24,	14:7, 16:18, 17:7,
commission [3] -	concerns [2] - 73:16,	conversation [1] -	116:1, 116:2, 116:3,	17:25, 19:18, 21:2,
53:11, 53:16, 67:15	127:13	93:7	117:3, 117:7,	21:23, 22:12, 23:8,
common [6] - 39:11,	conclude [1] - 26:5	conversations [1] -	117:21, 118:8,	23:18, 24:6, 25:14,
39:16, 39:19, 45:14,	conclusion [4] - 7:21,	60:12		26:2, 26:8, 26:12,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 5

27:6, 27:12, 27:16,	courtroom [1] - 27:13	79:21, 80:15, 87:7,	135:23	73:5, 75:25, 76:3,
27:22, 29:13, 30:3,	cover [6] - 45:13,	79.21, 80.15, 87.7, 88:5	deemed [6] - 22:20,	76:12, 79:6, 87:14,
32:5, 32:16, 33:3,	••	database [3] - 47:8,	74:20, 75:15, 75:23,	118:24
33:11, 33:13, 33:24,	65:22, 69:19, 135:13, 135:14,	73:7, 74:14	74.20, 75.15, 75.23, 76:7, 115:7	determine [2] - 71:6,
34:1, 34:5, 34:10,	136:4	date [28] - 9:14, 9:20,	deems [2] - 114:23,	77:9
34:12, 34:14, 34:15,	coverage [2] - 11:13,	9:23, 10:15, 10:16,	132:18	determined [7] -
34:22, 35:3, 38:23,	135:9	11:5, 24:16, 29:19,	defendant [4] - 5:13,	48:12, 66:20, 67:11,
40:14, 40:17, 41:9,	covered [3] - 40:5,	31:3, 65:13, 65:18,	5:17, 5:19, 14:8	133:20, 134:2,
41:11, 42:17, 42:21,	40:8, 54:25	83:15, 87:24, 88:4,	Defendant [2] - 1:8,	134:13, 134:16
43:8, 43:22, 43:25,		92:3, 92:5, 92:16,	1:18	determines [2] - 70:2,
44:4, 46:1, 46:9,	covering [1] - 55:12 covers [1] - 79:22	92:20, 92:21, 93:23,	defendant's [1] - 62:2	72:7
46:21, 47:14, 48:10,		94:17, 106:9,		devote [1] - 135:15
48:24, 49:6, 49:10,	CR [1] - 57:19	108:16, 108:17,	Defendant's [7] - 8:4,	diagnosis [1] - 59:4
49:15, 50:18, 51:24,	Craft [1] - 39:10	108:24, 109:2, 109:3	12:9, 18:1, 119:24,	
52:25, 53:8, 54:11,	crafted [1] - 83:5	dated [2] - 10:5, 31:1	125:4, 127:2, 141:3	dictate [1] - 135:8
56:10, 56:18, 57:22,	created [5] - 10:8,	dates [2] - 10:3, 31:1	define [1] - 91:7	differ [5] - 3:21, 70:11,
58:1, 58:3, 58:7,	10:9, 10:18, 11:4,	102:13	definition [1] - 138:20	70:14, 84:8, 84:14
58:10, 60:14, 61:21,	83:21		delay [1] - 4:25	difference [15] - 5:14,
61:25, 62:4, 62:9,	creating [1] - 57:3	day-to-day [1] - 65:14	deliberations [1] -	6:24, 53:3, 71:23, 72:2, 72:2, 84:25
62:11, 62:12, 62:15,	cross [4] - 2:8, 2:9,	days [9] - 51:3, 77:22,	15:15	72:2, 72:3, 84:25,
62:17, 62:24, 63:3,	30:5, 111:23	102:17, 103:23,	delivered [1] - 73:15	114:6, 114:13,
63:22, 74:1, 74:3,	CROSS [3] - 2:19,	105:1, 106:2, 106:7,	demand [5] - 24:10,	114:14, 114:19,
78:13, 78:19, 83:10,	56:19, 98:12	106:8, 106:14	24:11, 26:15, 30:6,	114:20, 135:12,
84:19, 86:8, 86:13,	cross-examination [1]	dealer [1] - 18:14	30:25	136:9, 140:7
95:19, 95:22, 95:24,	- 30:5	dealers [1] - 39:20	demanding [1] - 23:9	differences [1] - 6:18
96:2, 96:4, 96:17,	curative [1] - 26:13	dealership [12] -	demographically [1] -	different [17] - 12:18,
96:18, 96:20, 97:14,	curb [1] - 43:19	39:20, 118:13,	55:20	13:16, 17:12, 18:3,
97:21, 97:24, 98:11,	current [3] - 63:17,	118:20, 120:19,	denominator [1] -	18:18, 19:24, 32:19,
104:18, 106:9,	65:19	121:7, 121:16,	39:11	36:13, 45:8, 47:17,
106:13, 106:23,	customer [7] - 26:19,	121:19, 121:23,	depicted [1] - 128:21	66:5, 74:8, 81:25,
107:2, 108:22,	39:2, 60:20, 61:4,	121:25, 122:8,	deployed [2] - 76:17,	82:18, 82:20, 131:2,
108:24, 109:10,	124:14, 136:10,	122:16, 123:3	100:6	131:24
110:4, 110:8,	141:11	dealership's [1] -	deposed [1] - 133:16	differently [3] - 98:1,
110:19, 111:1,	customers [5] - 30:8,	120:1	deposition [3] - 133:6,	140:14, 140:15
111:5, 111:10,	39:1, 40:9, 52:13,	dealerships [2] -	133:15, 134:25	differs [1] - 55:6
111:17, 111:22,	137:8	39:22, 55:21	depresses [1] - 129:8	difficult [1] - 118:19
112:2, 112:4, 112:5,	cut [4] - 53:13, 53:18,	dealing [2] - 73:17,	depth [1] - 80:10	digital [1] - 9:18
112:7, 112:9, 115:4,	109:6, 110:15	85:11	derived [1] - 50:9	dime [1] - 50:21
118:23, 119:1,	CVS [1] - 123:20	deals [1] - 90:4	describe [23] - 29:2,	DIRECT [2] - 35:4,
119:5, 123:14,		dealt [2] - 51:18, 82:12	43:5, 46:14, 47:21,	63:5
123:23, 125:20,	D	debt [1] - 137:18	48:21, 49:16, 53:3,	direct [20] - 3:15, 8:5,
126:3, 130:11,		decade [1] - 124:23	55:6, 57:6, 64:18,	8:21, 12:13, 13:3,
131:25, 132:3,	D.C [1] - 39:9	December [1] - 1:10	65:3, 65:9, 66:13,	21:25, 29:12, 54:16,
132:24, 133:2,	d/b/a [1] - 1:7	decent [1] - 73:9	67:1, 68:11, 70:17,	54:18, 54:23, 55:6,
133:9, 134:12,	daily [3] - 9:25, 10:3,	decided [3] - 28:8,	70:20, 77:5, 85:21,	55:17, 55:23, 56:4,
135:18, 136:20,	66:14	35:25, 129:17	91:6, 91:24, 127:17	101:18, 101:23,
136:23, 137:3,	damage [29] - 43:3,	deciding [2] - 70:25,	described [2] -	129:7, 132:9,
138:1, 139:23,	43:20, 43:25, 47:23,	71:1	118:11, 129:18	138:23, 140:20
140:10, 140:22,	48:1, 48:5, 48:6,	declaration [1] - 110:1	describing [1] - 52:21	directed [3] - 26:3,
141:1, 141:7,	48:7, 59:4, 65:6,	declare [3] - 107:17,	description [4] - 3:25,	55:22, 55:25
141:12, 141:22,	68:14, 69:1, 69:2,	109:15, 126:1	17:6, 47:5, 138:10	directly [6] - 6:17,
142:2, 142:15	73:9, 74:25, 76:17,	declared [7] - 29:1,	designated [1] - 60:22	6:21, 56:7, 124:8,
Court [10] - 1:9, 1:12,	77:10, 79:16, 79:24,	29:8, 108:13,	designation [2] -	124:17, 125:7
2:3, 40:12, 41:7,	85:12, 86:15, 86:17,	108:25, 109:4,	59:19, 59:20	disagree [1] - 84:3
67:1, 111:20, 112:1,	87:9, 91:22, 98:24,	109:5, 110:9	designed [1] - 127:24	disagreement [7] -
119:23, 120:8	104:23, 107:10,	declares [1] - 28:21	desk [2] - 64:1, 78:5	4:15, 26:16, 79:5,
Courtney [9] - 3:3,	135:22	deductible [3] - 4:22,	despite [3] - 97:7,	80:17, 80:19, 80:20,
4:13, 5:13, 100:7,	damaged [5] - 85:24,	6:1, 32:18	97:9, 97:23	96:8
104:4, 111:13,	98:17, 98:20, 126:8,	deem [7] - 38:23, 77:2,	determination [13] -	disassembly [1] -
126:16, 137:10,	127:12	79:4, 107:14,	21:13, 21:18, 22:10,	29:19
139:1	damages [5] - 68:20,	107:22, 107:25,	47:2, 49:18, 67:15,	disconnect [1] - 86:9

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 6

INDEX NO. 606797/2017

discrepancy [1] - 68:2	104:24, 107:19,	15:20, 19:3, 22:5,	80:22, 80:24, 85:1,	88:12
discuss [1] - 80:19	114:7, 114:8,	38:4, 39:20, 45:3,	86:6, 86:25, 88:4,	exactly [1] - 138:24
discussed [8] - 12:14,	118:12, 120:18,	47:18, 71:2, 75:3,	88:5, 88:7, 88:8,	EXAMINATION [8] -
61:24, 79:8, 80:1,	121:22, 121:24,	75:14, 78:4, 84:3	88:22, 88:24, 89:14,	2:19, 27:25, 33:15,
88:21, 92:14, 92:15,	122:4, 122:8, 123:3,	elaborate [1] - 118:19	90:16, 92:4, 92:7,	35:4, 56:19, 60:16,
93:10	123:9, 138:6, 139:3,	electrical [5] - 117:15,	92:14, 94:7, 95:2,	63:5, 98:12
discussion [5] - 3:13,	140:3, 140:7, 140:8,	117:18, 118:10,	95:3, 97:9, 98:25,	examination [3] -
68:3, 89:1, 93:3,	140:13, 140:14,	118:11, 120:22	99:16, 99:21, 100:9,	21:25, 30:5, 129:7
133:10	141:1	electrically [1] - 81:12	100:11, 100:14,	example [10] - 69:19,
discussions [2] -	door [1] - 48:2	electronic [2] - 77:17,	100:17, 100:19,	71:16, 71:19, 72:1,
49:17, 50:14	double [3] - 18:11,	78:4	100:20, 101:3,	74:7, 76:13, 76:20,
dismantled [1] - 79:15	18:14, 106:23	electronically [1] -	101:4, 101:7,	76:22, 80:1, 91:9
dispatched [1] - 81:14	down [10] - 16:11,	68:18	101:11, 101:14,	exceeds [1] - 28:10
dispatching [1] -	39:7, 68:18, 68:22,	electronics [1] - 65:12	102:2, 102:18,	excess [1] - 135:22
77:16	80:14, 92:14, 95:24,	elements [1] - 69:9	102:20, 102:23,	exclude [1] - 95:20
dispute [9] - 20:11,	97:6, 125:21, 142:5	employed [1] - 35:9	103:3, 103:15,	excluding [1] - 97:11
20:17, 20:19, 20:24,	draft [1] - 75:6	employee [3] - 51:4,	103:21, 104:1,	exclusive [1] - 39:6
21:1, 21:4, 21:5,	drafting [1] - 69:23	66:8	104:10, 104:13,	Exclusive [1] - 39:7
21:7, 38:21	draw [2] - 133:13,	employees [1] - 53:10	104:21, 105:3,	excused [2] - 34:2,
disputing [2] - 20:4,	136:24	employer [2] - 27:9,	105:9, 105:14,	61:21
20:20	drive [4] - 31:10, 56:5,	27:10	105:17, 105:19,	exhibit [9] - 3:14,
dissatisfied [5] - 25:1,	59:10	end [4] - 39:25, 61:17,	106:15, 106:18,	7:24, 40:13, 41:7,
25:11, 25:17, 26:23,	Drive [2] - 35:1, 63:2	69:6, 134:16	106:24, 107:3,	41:8, 87:21, 120:10,
26:24	drive-in [3] - 56:5,	ended [2] - 9:23,	107:5, 113:12,	140:19, 141:6
divergence [1] -	59:10	10:16	113:15, 113:17,	Exhibit [26] - 8:1, 8:4,
129:20	driver [1] - 135:15	engineering [1] - 36:5	114:3, 115:5, 115:7,	12:7, 12:9, 17:24,
DMV [1] - 57:19	driver's [2] - 43:14,	enter [1] - 60:19	115:15, 116:20,	18:1, 40:12, 41:6,
doctor [1] - 55:9	43:15	entered [1] - 96:5	118:9, 124:1,	44:21, 44:22, 84:18,
document [22] - 2:25,	drop [1] - 61:4	entire [4] - 21:4, 47:4,	128:23, 129:11,	84:19, 111:20,
3:24, 4:1, 4:4, 4:8,	dropped [1] - 78:5	59:24, 87:21	129:12, 129:13,	112:13, 113:20,
4:23, 6:10, 6:11,	dry [1] - 50:2	entities [1] - 31:19	129:20, 130:18,	120:8, 124:16,
6:21, 7:4, 10:7, 10:9,	due [2] - 8:6, 8:18	entitled [1] - 133:4	130:22, 131:7	125:2, 125:4, 127:1,
11:3, 12:10, 24:8,	during [11] - 21:24,	entity [1] - 131:24	estimates [19] - 40:9,	127:2, 127:8,
24:18, 24:25, 40:18,	26:20, 43:23, 61:2,	entries [1] - 117:2	60:2, 64:2, 66:3,	127:19, 127:22,
128:21, 141:8,	64:13, 74:18, 86:21,	entry [2] - 41:1, 41:19	66:21, 66:24, 73:16,	130:14, 141:3
141:14, 141:20	89:10, 107:8,	EPSTEIN [1] - 1:18	76:7, 94:4, 94:5,	Exhibit-11 [2] - 2:24,
documents [5] - 14:5,	133:15, 134:25	equipment [7] - 39:12,	99:5, 113:21,	26:18
30:10, 83:12, 83:13,	duties [1] - 65:14	45:4, 45:6, 49:20,	113:22, 129:25,	Exhibit-3 [2] - 24:2,
141:16		52:8, 70:19, 119:13	130:1, 130:4,	24:4
dollar [6] - 50:22,	E	Equipment [1] -	131:11, 131:14	Exhibit-E [6] - 8:1,
69:4, 69:6, 69:10,	_	128:20	Estimatics [2] - 63:19,	8:4, 40:12, 44:22,
104:7	e-mail [1] - 78:4	error [2] - 14:18, 14:20	64:4	111:20, 112:13
dollars [2] - 23:22,	e-mailed [1] - 88:11	ESQ [4] - 1:16, 1:16,	estimating [4] - 24:15,	Exhibit-F [4] - 12:7,
29:14	earliest [2] - 10:11,	1:20, 1:20	64:7, 77:18, 99:1	12:9, 41:6, 44:21
done [67] - 12:15,	10:12	essentially [1] - 5:24	estimations [1] -	Exhibit-K [5] - 127:1,
12:18, 12:20, 13:11,	early [1] - 23:15	estimate [118] - 3:21,	98:17	127:2, 127:8,
16:15, 17:17, 17:20,	easier [4] - 14:5,	20:15, 24:21, 25:5,	estimator [9] - 63:21,	127:19, 127:22
20:10, 21:7, 26:25,	121:9, 125:14,	25:8, 25:11, 25:17,	63:23, 65:15, 68:10,	Exhibit-OO [1] - 120:8
28:12, 31:4, 34:8,	125:15	26:24, 40:3, 57:16,	70:7, 74:18, 80:7, 117:9, 132:16	Exhibit-P [2] - 17:24,
39:9, 40:3, 48:8,	economy [1] - 125:17	67:4, 67:7, 68:14,	et [1] - 4:16	18:1
57:1, 58:8, 60:2,	edited [1] - 10:17	68:20, 68:21, 68:23,		Exhibit-RR [1] -
64:17, 70:15, 77:13,	editorializing [1] -	69:3, 69:8, 69:23,	European [1] - 52:10 evaluate [1] - 98:24	124:16
77:20, 77:23, 79:18,	26:8	71:1, 71:12, 72:6,	event [1] - 110:11	Exhibit-TT [2] - 125:2,
80:1, 80:5, 80:6,	education [2] - 36:2,	72:21, 73:17, 74:15,	everyday [1] - 30:18	125:4
80:10, 81:11, 81:12,	60:5	75:6, 75:17, 76:1,		Exhibit-Y [4] - 84:18,
84:2, 84:3, 84:4,	effect [1] - 132:21	77:8, 77:15, 77:20,	evidence [8] - 2:4, 24:5, 24:7, 83:11,	84:19, 113:20,
84:5, 84:9, 87:1,	effective [4] - 39:23,	77:23, 78:1, 78:4,	119:25, 125:5,	130:14
87:2, 87:17, 88:10,	45:6, 85:16, 85:17	78:7, 78:9, 79:1,	127:3, 141:13	Exhibit-YY [1] - 141:3
96:24, 98:1, 102:3,	eight [1] - 59:23	79:5, 79:14, 80:2,	exact [3] - 10:8, 15:11,	Exhibits [5] - 2:3,
104:19, 104:20,	either [13] - 15:7,	80:4, 80:18, 80:21,		83:10, 116:22,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 7

119:23, 119:24	6:15, 6:25, 7:18, 8:6,	66:14	52:3, 52:14	furnished [3] - 9:5,
exhibits [1] - 140:24	8:10, 8:13, 8:18, 9:6,	fill-in [1] - 61:15	fix [10] - 42:18, 68:4,	9:12, 9:14
exist [2] - 4:14, 13:20	9:10, 9:13, 11:12,	final [72] - 4:20, 7:23,	75:3, 75:19, 91:10,	furthering [1] - 36:3
exists [1] - 97:20	11:21, 20:15, 21:13,	7:24, 8:6, 8:10, 8:17,	99:10, 99:15, 99:24,	0
expectation [1] -	21:14, 21:18, 21:19,	9:17, 10:5, 10:14,	113:11, 113:14	G
109:7	22:8, 22:18, 23:3,	10:22, 12:1, 12:24,	fixed [2] - 43:6, 138:5	
expedition [1] - 30:9	23:13, 24:22, 25:23,	12:25, 13:8, 13:9,	fixing [4] - 42:13,	game [1] - 64:4
expense [2] - 29:18,	27:1, 28:5, 28:18,	13:24, 15:18, 18:3,	99:19, 128:23,	Garden [1] - 1:19
136:4	28:25, 29:8, 29:23,	20:2, 20:6, 20:13,	135:15	gathering [1] - 48:17
experience [5] -	30:12, 30:17, 33:1,	20:14, 21:4, 21:5,	flat [3] - 53:11, 53:14,	gauge [1] - 44:2
64:16, 70:7, 121:5,	33:5, 36:22, 37:2,	21:13, 32:6, 32:22,	117:23	general [33] - 5:11,
131:20, 134:21	56:24, 57:1, 57:17,	32:23, 40:12, 40:15,	floor [1] - 48:3	6:17, 45:10, 64:12,
expert [4] - 2:11,	59:8, 60:2, 63:2, 63:14, 63:15, 63:18,	40:19, 40:21, 41:1,	flowing [1] - 54:3	65:21, 68:1, 69:22,
38:22, 38:24, 43:8		41:13, 44:16, 44:22,	focus [2] - 90:24,	70:25, 71:6, 71:11,
expertise [2] - 49:7,	63:23, 63:25, 66:9, 68:12, 69:25, 70:1,	46:11, 46:12, 46:13, 46:24, 68:22, 69:10,	93:22	75:9, 75:17, 77:14,
54:7	76:8, 81:8, 81:10,	46:24, 68:22, 69:10, 83:16, 83:21, 83:25,	following [1] - 44:19	77:24, 78:7, 79:11, 80:24, 81:13, 82:7,
explain [8] - 24:11,	90:3, 94:14, 100:2,	84:2, 84:9, 84:22,	football [1] - 38:3	83:23, 86:7, 86:25,
61:7, 65:5, 80:21,	101:16, 103:6,	85:1, 85:2, 90:16,	force [1] - 53:22	88:17, 91:18, 98:4,
84:25, 95:16, 96:23	107:19, 107:21,	97:8, 97:9, 97:11,	forces [1] - 42:9	98:7, 98:17, 102:8,
explained [1] - 42:6 exposed [1] - 79:15	107:25, 108:5,	105:11, 106:15,	forensic [1] - 36:5	115:24, 116:1,
exposed [1] - 79:15 external [1] - 80:9	109:4, 109:19,	111:12, 111:14,	forget [1] - 7:24 forgetting [3] - 16:24,	116:15, 135:10,
external [1] - 60.9	110:10, 110:13,	111:18, 111:20,	83:23, 84:1	138:4
F	110:16, 110:21,	112:13, 114:3,	form [3] - 8:12, 99:5,	generalized [1] -
Г	111:12, 111:17,	114:21, 114:22,	131:10 131:10	51:19
faces [1] - 30:23	114:8, 114:15,	114:25, 115:7,	formally [1] - 107:18	generally [5] - 44:18,
facilities [1] - 56:4	114:22, 114:23,	115:12, 115:14,	forth [3] - 62:16,	129:8, 129:12,
facility [5] - 45:21,	115:5, 115:7,	115:15, 129:21,	106:1, 107:9	129:16, 131:14
49:21, 49:23, 56:5	115:15, 116:24,	130:18	forward [1] - 42:11	geographic [2] -
fact [20] - 21:24, 49:8,	117:7, 118:8,	finally [2] - 90:13,	four [16] - 5:4, 59:8,	65:22, 70:8
49:10, 59:10, 67:24,	119:20, 121:1,	103:14	59:18, 59:22, 64:21,	German [2] - 39:12,
100:19, 102:17,	121:6, 128:23,	financed [2] - 137:11,	92:13, 92:16, 92:22,	39:18
105:1, 107:13,	129:11, 129:25,	137:13	93:13, 93:14, 94:16,	given [9] - 10:2, 11:20,
108:5, 114:3,	130:23, 130:25,	fine [3] - 63:22, 124:6,	94:19, 103:1,	11:21, 23:23, 26:13,
116:17, 121:5,	131:9, 132:20, 135:8, 135:14	130:23	116:17, 119:11,	66:6, 101:16,
129:7, 129:23,	135:8, 135:14, 135:23, 136:4,	finish [4] - 56:17,	120:21	101:23, 102:1
131:17, 132:20,	135.23, 136.4, 141:11, 142:1	118:23, 119:1, 119:3	four-hour [1] - 59:8	glad [1] - 14:20
134:1, 138:9, 140:6	FARM [1] - 1:4	finished [3] - 2:9,	frame [15] - 47:25,	glass [4] - 45:22,
factors [1] - 139:11	Farm's [15] - 23:25,	102:6, 112:16	48:7, 77:10, 77:19,	45:24, 65:6
fail [1] - 139:17	56:23, 59:5, 90:21,	FIORELLA [1] - 1:14	89:20, 90:8, 92:2,	glazier [1] - 45:22
fair [11] - 10:20, 10:24,	94:9, 100:20,	Fiorella [1] - 56:22 first [43] - 3:16, 18:13,	95:14, 96:25, 97:1,	GM [1] - 125:25
20:3, 20:9, 20:23,	104:12, 106:18,	34:23, 43:24, 61:5,	97:2, 97:5, 97:6,	goal [9] - 21:13, 21:18,
21:12, 21:17, 22:13,	109:24, 110:2,	61:6, 62:25, 79:19,	113:2	22:2, 22:6, 22:9, 22:14, 22:16, 75:17
83:20, 93:2, 94:10	114:3, 122:23,	83:15, 83:16, 87:6,	Franklin [1] - 35:2	22:14, 22:16, 75:17 God [2] - 34:20, 62:22
fairly [1] - 45:25	123:1, 123:3, 130:4	87:20, 87:22, 89:2,	fraud [1] - 36:6	God [2] - 34:20, 62:22 gold [1] - 59:19
fall [2] - 59:17, 91:12 familiar [4] - 48:11,	fault [2] - 23:5, 134:11	89:3, 89:14, 92:3,	free [3] - 15:14, 87:20,	goodness [1] - 59:19
51:6, 82:7, 137:10	February [1] - 120:4	92:8, 92:14, 92:23,	106:5	govern [1] - 136:16
far [26] - 9:13, 22:24,	fees [1] - 61:8	93:22, 93:23, 94:13,	fresh [1] - 43:3	graduated [1] - 37:21
23:2, 23:3, 25:16,	fender [3] - 74:24,	94:20, 97:5, 100:9,	FRIEDMAN [1] - 1:14	grand [1] - 128:1
42:2, 46:3, 52:18,	75:1, 75:2	100:14, 100:19,	Friedman [1] - 56:23	gross [1] - 28:5
55:23, 59:10, 66:20,	few [6] - 37:24, 38:2,	103:3, 103:6,	friend [1] - 126:7	grossly [1] - 107:12
68:6, 68:14, 72:9,	39:4, 41:17, 53:2,	104:12, 106:6,	friends [2] - 37:15, 37:17	ground [1] - 87:7
72:13, 80:16, 92:20,	56:16	107:22, 108:1,		group [3] - 39:24,
93:8, 101:20, 107:6,	field [5] - 38:5, 45:16,	109:5, 124:20,	front [5] - 68:25,	52:2, 55:19
111:8, 111:11,	45:17	127:7, 127:21,	101:10, 116:24, 120:10, 130:14	guarantee [3] - 12:16,
122:23, 123:2,	file [6] - 9:18, 9:19,	128:12, 133:13,	full [3] - 28:17, 47:25,	12:18, 12:21
125:17, 135:7	10:8, 11:5, 108:10	138:19	119:2	guess [15] - 2:5, 2:24,
Farm [103] - 3:5, 4:15,	filed [1] - 22:10	fit [1] - 127:24	function [1] - 127:24	9:2, 16:20, 25:10,
5:19, 6:5, 6:6, 6:8,	fill [3] - 61:15, 61:16,	five [4] - 34:10, 48:16,	fund [1] - 55:4	25:12, 26:1, 36:12,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 8

20:0 50:5 64:4	100-10	h aurra (au) - 50-00	404-04	04.4 04.5 02.4
39:2, 59:5, 64:4,	133:10	hours [22] - 59:22,	121:21	81:4, 81:5, 83:1,
75:21, 94:20,	help [5] - 34:20, 39:15,	59:23, 64:22, 67:6,	including [2] - 72:21,	86:18, 88:16, 89:13,
106:22, 116:20	40:9, 62:22, 117:12	112:21, 112:22,	80:18	92:8, 102:4, 102:7
guessing [1] - 139:18	helpful [1] - 55:14	112:24, 112:25,	inclusive [2] - 39:21,	inspections [4] - 40:4,
guys [1] - 5:7	helping [1] - 57:11	113:2, 113:4, 113:7,	47:4	52:16, 86:21, 89:10
	HEREIN [1] - 142:12	113:10, 113:14,	incorrect [1] - 31:1	inspector [2] - 67:3,
Н	Hertz [2] - 9:4, 9:5	113:25, 114:4,	increase [3] - 60:4,	67:5
half [4] - 113:7,	high [5] - 37:21,	114:10, 114:11,	134:15, 134:16	installed [1] - 44:14
	37:23, 37:24, 39:25,	114:12, 114:20,	indeed [1] - 107:5	installing [1] - 65:5
113:10, 113:25, 124:23	47:25	115:8, 115:17, 115:19	indemnify [1] - 55:3	instance [1] - 6:23
hand [6] - 12:11,	high-end [1] - 39:25		independent [1] - 64:1	instances [1] - 91:1
34:16, 42:7, 62:18,	higher [15] - 58:13,	house [2] - 48:3, 48:4	Index [1] - 1:5	instead [1] - 19:13
123:19, 141:5	90:17, 91:2, 91:3,	hub [1] - 38:16	indicate [2] - 12:10,	institutionally [1] -
handed [1] - 127:8	91:16, 91:19, 91:23,	huge [1] - 141:22	131:1	123:2
handle [2] - 123:18,	99:9, 99:13, 99:14,	hyphen [1] - 35:24	indicated [11] - 6:10,	instruction [1] - 26:13
124:5	99:18, 101:7, 104:9,		8:21, 19:22, 58:12,	instructor [2] - 37:9,
handler [3] - 76:2,	104:12, 106:18		71:22, 81:24, 83:5,	37:11
76:11, 141:18	himself [3] - 16:7,	I-CAR [8] - 35:23,	85:6, 93:23, 94:13,	instructors [2] - 37:6,
hands [2] - 61:12,	16:14, 17:4	36:7, 36:9, 37:5,	98:4	37:8
61:13	hired [1] - 51:19	58:25, 61:17, 64:8,	indirectly [1] - 6:6	insurance [31] - 3:20,
hands-on [2] - 61:12,	historically [2] -	64:18	individual [2] - 17:9,	6:15, 24:15, 28:8,
61:13	25:19, 25:20 hit [4] - 42:13, 43:17,	ID _[1] - 141:13	59:19	28:11, 28:21, 33:21,
happy [1] - 61:10	43:18, 43:19	idea [2] - 53:25,	induce [1] - 42:10	36:16, 42:23, 51:3,
hard [1] - 9:18	,	137:12	Industry [2] - 35:22,	54:13, 54:15, 54:18,
hardware [1] - 126:11	HMO [1] - 55:11	identification [2] -	58:25	54:22, 54:24, 55:3, 55:9, 55:10, 55:11,
hassle [4] - 89:12,	hold [1] - 28:17 holding [3] - 7:12,	68:19, 141:4	industry [16] - 35:16, 35:19, 37:4, 37:20,	56:1, 56:2, 64:11,
101:19, 101:24,	7:18, 87:13	ignore [1] - 25:14	45:19, 46:2, 54:7,	129:13, 129:19,
102:1	HOLSGROVE [2] -	II [3] - 2:3, 119:23,	45.19, 46.2, 54.7, 55:13, 64:10, 64:11,	132:15, 135:9,
Haus [33] - 12:3,	1:23, 142:15	119:24	100:4, 125:21,	135:13, 136:11,
12:25, 13:5, 13:23,	home [2] - 63:11	III [1] - 34:25	132:14, 132:15,	136:15, 137:6
14:3, 14:21, 14:25,	honestly [1] - 140:12	images [1] - 86:23	135:8	INSURANCE [1] - 1:4
15:5, 15:16, 15:19,	honor [1] - 27:1	imagine [2] - 22:9,	inferior [1] - 75:7	Insurance [5] - 36:22,
16:4, 16:9, 16:12,	Honor [19] - 2:18,	59:25	inflate [1] - 138:13	37:2, 54:25, 63:14
17:1, 17:13, 20:6,	4:10, 26:10, 27:24,	imitation [1] - 128:2	inform [2] - 28:25,	insured [3] - 6:17,
20:12, 31:19, 31:22,	29:11, 34:3, 38:20,	immediate [1] - 42:13	79:9	111:17, 135:15
41:2, 41:5, 41:9,	46:10, 53:1, 56:13,	immediately [2] -	information [3] -	integrity [1] - 127:25
41:19, 41:21, 44:10,	58:11, 63:4, 63:20,	80:1, 109:19	76:11, 87:19, 107:24	intellectual [1] -
44:11, 44:13, 44:15,	112:11, 115:3,	impact [4] - 42:9,	initial [9] - 24:21,	122:18
44:23, 84:6, 84:9,	132:23, 134:20,	43:15, 85:13, 87:8	77:20, 78:8, 80:4,	intend [2] - 133:4,
84:23	141:5, 141:19	impacted [3] - 42:3,	82:25, 88:16, 94:12,	133:5
hazardous [3] - 50:2,	HONORABLE [1] -	42:7, 42:10	101:4, 106:18	intensive [2] - 49:22,
50:3	1:11	importance [1] -	inner [3] - 48:3, 77:10,	51:5
headlamps [8] -	hostage [1] - 7:18	127:11	79:24	Inter [2] - 35:22, 58:25
117:16, 117:18,	hour [32] - 41:25,	impression [1] -	inquire [3] - 35:3,	Inter-Industry [2]
117:20, 117:22,	46:17, 46:18, 47:11,	133:19	56:18, 63:3	35:22, 58:25
118:2, 120:21,	47:15, 48:8, 49:4,	improve [1] - 60:1	inquiry [1] - 112:10	internal [3] - 79:18,
121:21, 122:2	49:17, 50:16, 53:6,	in-class [1] - 64:21	inside [1] - 80:13	79:21, 80:5
health [3] - 51:3, 55:8,	53:21, 54:5, 54:8,	inappropriate [1] -	inspect [4] - 43:22,	international [1] -
55:11	54:9, 59:8, 89:17,	95:13	67:9, 77:15, 81:16	64:10
hear [1] - 108:18	90:5, 115:20,	INC [1] - 1:7	inspected [5] - 67:4,	introduce [1] - 60:21
heard [3] - 137:13,	115:24, 116:5,	incentive [1] - 66:18	67:12, 89:6, 101:15,	investigation [1] -
137:15, 138:2	116:15, 116:18,	inch [1] - 41:22	108:10	50:9
hearing [1] - 73:25	120:4, 120:12,	incident [5] - 42:22,	inspecting [3] - 68:16,	investigations [1] -
heart [1] - 50:21	120:14, 120:24,	42:23, 43:1, 43:2,	101:20, 101:24	36:6
heavy [1] - 77:11	121:6, 124:8,	43:4	inspection [22] - 40:4,	investment [1] - 49:19
heed [1] - 107:21	124:18, 124:21,	include [3] - 4:20,	68:4, 79:18, 79:19,	invoice [2] - 74:25,
heeded [2] - 110:16,	124:24, 125:7	15:10, 51:2	80:5, 80:6, 80:9,	86:5
110:21	hourly [3] - 53:10,	included [1] - 97:10	80:10, 80:12, 80:25,	involve [1] - 69:3
held [3] - 3:13, 96:3,	53:20, 66:8	includes [2] - 18:18,	81:1, 81:2, 81:3,	involved [12] - 33:21,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 9

57:3, 57:15, 64:3,	items [3] - 41:12,	KEVIN [1] - 1:20	84:1, 88:21, 89:15,	legally [1] - 7:5
65:11, 76:6, 81:21,	41:17, 96:13	kind [9] - 66:11, 72:13,	89:18, 89:20, 89:22,	less [11] - 29:7, 29:20,
85:19, 117:22,	itself [5] - 49:11, 69:8,	76:20, 77:4, 80:14,	90:17, 91:2, 91:3,	53:9, 67:20, 104:7,
118:10, 119:6,	111:15, 126:11,	80:16, 120:20,	91:16, 91:19, 92:6,	114:15, 114:18,
119:12	129:19	124:14	92:11, 92:15, 93:4,	115:11, 115:14,
involving [2] - 82:13,	129:19		93:8, 93:10, 93:11,	
84:9		kit [1] - 77:18	94:9, 96:7, 97:11,	121:10, 121:16
	J	Klein [7] - 12:13, 15:8,	98:5, 98:8, 112:18,	letter [5] - 3:3, 3:20,
Island [98] - 3:4, 3:6,	JACK [1] - 1:11	19:8, 27:22, 60:14,	112:21, 113:2,	4:9, 4:12, 141:11
4:7, 4:13, 5:12, 5:16,		98:11, 111:22		letters [3] - 130:25,
5:24, 6:24, 7:13,	Jaguar [1] - 39:13	KLEIN [71] - 1:20,	113:4, 113:11,	131:3, 131:6
7:24, 8:9, 8:21, 9:3,	James [1] - 36:18	3:25, 4:4, 4:6, 7:20,	113:12, 113:25,	level [1] - 85:18
12:20, 13:8, 13:9,	Jeff [1] - 36:4	8:1, 8:12, 12:5,	114:4, 114:10,	Level [4] - 65:1, 65:2,
13:12, 13:24, 14:8,	Jersey [3] - 38:15,	16:17, 17:6, 19:16,	114:11, 114:12,	65:3, 65:8
18:7, 19:22, 28:25,	39:8	21:1, 21:21, 22:11,	115:17, 115:18,	liability [2] - 42:23,
29:9, 29:16, 30:22,	Jesberger [17] - 15:3,	25:13, 27:24, 28:1,	116:4, 117:5, 118:3,	45:12
31:8, 31:10, 31:19,	16:2, 16:5, 16:11,	32:13, 33:12, 33:23,	118:4, 120:23,	LIBERT [1] - 1:11
31:21, 32:1, 32:7,	16:21, 17:18, 40:6,	34:7, 34:13, 35:5,	124:2, 124:18,	Libert [1] - 2:1
32:8, 32:21, 33:1,	44:19, 50:10, 54:23,	38:20, 40:16, 41:10,	126:4, 126:9,	lien [4] - 7:13, 14:9,
33:5, 33:9, 37:11,	54:25, 55:1, 56:6,	43:14, 46:23, 49:8,	126:12, 132:17	28:14, 28:20
38:25, 39:9, 40:1,	82:8, 88:23, 89:4,	49:13, 53:1, 56:14,	lacking [1] - 25:5	liened [1] - 7:15
40:19, 44:8, 44:10,	92:10	60:15, 60:17, 61:19,	Lakeview [8] - 13:10,	lienholder [5] - 22:19,
44:12, 47:17, 48:11,	Jesberger's [2] -	73:24, 74:4, 78:12,	13:17, 14:13, 14:16,	23:24, 28:13, 28:14,
48:18, 48:19, 49:3,	45:12, 50:1	78:15, 95:17, 96:16,	14:17, 14:21, 14:23,	28:16
49:20, 50:15, 51:7,	Jim [2] - 83:4, 107:7	97:16, 98:13, 107:1,	14:24	light [2] - 42:25, 43:1
51:9, 51:14, 51:15,	JJ _[2] - 119:23, 119:24	108:23, 109:14,	Land [1] - 39:13	limit [3] - 55:13, 88:15,
51:16, 51:20, 51:25,	job [13] - 27:7, 36:1,	110:5, 111:9,	Lange [1] - 36:5	125:12
52:3, 53:4, 55:17,	38:1, 38:7, 38:15,	111:25, 112:11,	laptop [1] - 77:18	limitations [1] -
55:18, 56:7, 57:3,	59:5, 60:7, 60:9,	114:11, 115:2,	large [3] - 28:6, 54:13,	136:15
57:17, 58:5, 82:11,	61:10, 63:17,	115:6, 115:18,	111:7	
82:12, 82:16, 88:8,	125:15, 138:11,	116:21, 118:22,	larger [1] - 68:2	limited [1] - 120:1
88:13, 89:4, 92:10,	138:12	118:25, 123:13,	Larry [1] - 37:16	limiting [1] - 96:6
93:15, 101:16,		126:25, 130:9,	laser [1] - 119:15	limits [2] - 45:7, 135:8
107:9, 107:13,	jobs [2] - 59:6, 59:7	132:23, 132:25,	last [13] - 4:5, 4:19,	line [19] - 4:20, 35:21,
107:17, 107:22,	jockey [1] - 53:16	133:5, 134:20,		41:3, 68:23, 69:15,
108:1, 109:4, 109:5,	judge [1] - 2:1	136:25, 140:2,	34:23, 62:25, 90:24,	69:16, 69:18, 88:3,
109:15, 109:19,	Judge [4] - 74:4,		97:17, 102:8,	92:14, 116:24,
110:11, 110:17,	78:22, 96:16, 130:10	140:19, 140:25,	102:11, 102:14,	133:23, 134:7,
111:13, 111:16,	judgemental [1] - 47:7	141:5, 141:19,	103:19, 106:9,	134:12
114:15, 115:11,	judgment [1] - 41:13	141:25	120:2, 124:7	lines [2] - 135:2, 135:4
115:20, 121:11,	judicial [1] - 106:13	knowledge [12] - 5:22,	latest [1] - 10:9	lingo [1] - 128:18
	July [1] - 116:17	5:23, 6:2, 6:3, 36:3,	law [2] - 5:4, 57:19	list [1] - 71:18
124:8, 124:17, 124:21, 124:24	jump [1] - 76:14	58:5, 64:12, 64:15,	Lawrence [1] - 34:25	listed [2] - 44:22,
124:21, 124:24, 125:7	June [7] - 10:5, 10:10,	65:4, 65:7, 65:10,	lawsuit [2] - 5:16, 33:8	46:16
125:7	83:21, 105:11,	65:19	lawsuits [1] - 33:20	listen [2] - 27:6, 56:11
ISLAND [1] - 1:7	106:11, 108:6,	KYEKO [1] - 1:16	laying [2] - 45:2, 45:9	listing [1] - 41:23
Island's [11] - 28:22,	108:18		lead [1] - 44:20	literally [2] - 4:2, 8:14
30:21, 41:13, 78:18,	jury [2] - 26:10, 26:12	L	leads [1] - 54:6	litigation [1] - 5:12
107:21, 109:6,	Justice [1] - 1:12	Jahanna (140	learning [1] - 38:7	living [1] - 54:8
110:16, 110:20,		labor [89] - 4:16,	least [4] - 59:22, 73:6,	LLC [1] - 35:13
110:21, 111:12,	K	20:10, 30:19, 30:21,	90:25, 91:7	LLP [2] - 1:14, 1:18
115:14		41:24, 46:14, 46:15,	leave [2] - 77:25, 78:2	local [1] - 70:6
issue [8] - 6:1, 6:4,	K&M [1] - 39:6	46:17, 47:2, 47:5,	lecture [2] - 58:23,	
41:20, 54:4, 95:11,	KEARON [2] - 1:18,	47:8, 47:17, 48:12,	61:14	located [1] - 82:2
97:2, 97:21, 134:23	1:20	49:17, 50:11, 50:13,	led [1] - 49:17	location [2] - 70:8
issued [2] - 32:22,	keep [8] - 26:3, 30:9,	50:16, 53:10, 53:12,	left [11] - 42:3, 43:16,	locations [3] - 13:16,
111:12	45:9, 50:22, 59:6,	53:19, 54:5, 54:14,	48:2, 48:25, 49:2,	17:2, 39:10
issues [3] - 82:15,	59:18, 64:15, 65:12	54:16, 55:2, 57:3,	46.2, 46.23, 45.2, 56:6, 84:16, 85:12,	longitudinal [1] - 44:3
82:22, 98:5	keeping [3] - 69:22,	57:8, 57:16, 58:13,	87:18, 88:22, 112:12	look [24] - 9:1, 40:23,
item [3] - 41:20, 88:3,	70:25, 71:6	58:20, 60:20, 69:11,	legal [6] - 5:10, 7:21,	46:16, 67:3, 67:5,
119:10	keeps [2] - 65:12,	69:12, 69:13, 69:16,	14:25, 17:7, 19:16,	68:13, 74:16, 75:1,
itemized [1] - 68:23	65:18	69:20, 69:24, 70:1,	78:18	79:16, 84:5, 84:20,
	50.10	70:2, 70:8, 70:11,	10.10	86:18, 86:22, 87:21,

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 10

87:24, 88:13, 90:16,	94:10, 94:21, 94:24,	15:15, 23:2, 58:15,	MICHAEL [1] - 1:16	133:20, 134:2,
92:18, 95:9, 98:25,	95:12, 96:24, 98:5,	104:14, 104:16,	Michael [3] - 36:23,	134:14
102:23, 108:17,	110:25	104:19	56:22, 63:1	minor [1] - 29:20
109:3	M.V.B.'s [3] - 22:14,	mathematicians [1] -	Mid [100] - 3:4, 3:5,	minus [1] - 101:1
looked [5] - 12:25,	109:8, 110:24	15:9	4:7, 4:13, 5:12, 5:16,	minute [2] - 3:12,
41:15, 86:24, 107:7,	M.V.B./Mid [1] - 9:3	matter [7] - 8:22,	5:24, 6:24, 7:13,	95:25
137:15	machine [2] - 119:7,	21:24, 54:15, 56:23,	7:24, 8:9, 8:21,	MINUTES [1] - 142:11
looking [13] - 12:24, 13:23, 24:8, 24:10,	119:14	59:9, 122:12, 122:13 McDonald's [1] -	12:20, 13:8, 13:9, 13:11, 13:24, 14:8	minutes [3] - 34:10,
24:16, 68:16, 76:16,	magnesium [1] - 57:12	59:11	13:11, 13:24, 14:8, 18:7, 19:22, 28:22,	81:6, 112:2 mischaracterization
87:6, 87:15, 89:12,	mail [2] - 55:12, 78:4	McGauvran [6] - 28:2,	28:25, 29:9, 29:16,	[1] - 32:11
89:14, 113:15	mailed [1] - 88:11	32:20, 40:6, 44:19,	30:21, 31:8, 31:10,	mistake [1] - 14:22
looks [10] - 20:13,	major [1] - 23:2	89:5, 92:11	31:19, 31:21, 32:1,	mixture [2] - 71:3,
48:21, 84:11, 117:6,	mall [1] - 59:11	mean [18] - 30:11,	32:7, 32:21, 32:25,	71:4
117:15, 118:7,	man [1] - 37:23	52:6, 55:25, 61:4,	33:5, 33:9, 38:25,	moment [10] - 30:5,
118:13, 119:11,	managed [1] - 115:11	68:16, 68:17, 78:3,	40:1, 40:19, 41:13,	53:1, 61:9, 100:23,
119:17, 141:17	management [3] -	79:19, 87:10, 91:24,	44:8, 44:10, 44:12,	112:14, 123:8,
loss [55] - 21:13,	66:15, 79:10, 80:21	110:10, 111:14,	47:17, 48:11, 48:18,	126:6, 132:23,
21:15, 21:17, 21:20,	manager [6] - 5:11,	123:20, 125:25,	48:19, 49:3, 49:20,	133:1, 141:8
22:5, 22:7, 22:9,	37:10, 37:17, 68:3,	135:5, 136:6,	50:15, 51:20, 51:25,	Monday [1] - 142:6
22:14, 22:15, 22:16,	82:11, 88:25	140:12, 141:19	53:4, 55:17, 55:18,	money [34] - 5:25, 6:4,
22:20, 28:13, 28:19,	mangled [1] - 77:4	meaning [2] - 53:25,	56:7, 57:3, 57:17,	6:7, 6:21, 7:13, 7:18,
28:23, 29:1, 29:8,	manner [2] - 79:3,	54:20	58:5, 78:18, 82:11, 82:12, 82:16, 88:8,	7:19, 19:23, 22:4,
41:14, 46:19, 51:4, 70:22, 75:14, 75:21	84:4	means [5] - 66:24,	88:13, 89:4, 92:10,	28:5, 29:23, 32:8,
70:22, 75:14, 75:21, 75:23, 75:24, 76:3,	manufacturer [3] -	68:11, 121:25, 123:3, 137:13	93:15, 101:16,	32:21, 45:2, 45:9,
76:8, 76:14, 76:19,	70:19, 72:19, 72:22	meant [2] - 115:5,	107:9, 107:13,	47:16, 53:15, 53:17,
76:23, 77:3, 77:5,	Manufacturer [1] -	123:9	107:17, 107:21,	53:21, 54:1, 54:3, 54:4, 55:4, 58:14,
77:12, 92:21, 93:17,	128:20	mechanic/body [1] -	107:22, 108:1,	58:16, 58:20, 79:2,
93:21, 94:1, 94:11,	manufacturer's [1] - 131:21	37:23	109:4, 109:5, 109:6,	110:17, 111:13,
94:15, 99:2, 99:7,	manufacturers [3] -	mechanical [11] -	109:15, 109:19,	111:16, 135:13,
100:12, 104:4,	19:24, 39:12, 72:15	89:18, 91:22, 92:1,	110:10, 110:16,	135:14, 137:21
107:14, 107:17,	manufacturing [1] -	113:4, 116:6,	110:17, 110:20,	Montanez [13] - 34:25,
107:22, 107:25,	19:5	117:13, 117:14,	110:21, 111:11,	35:6, 38:25, 40:18,
108:6, 108:14,	March [4] - 24:16,	120:19, 120:20,	111:13, 111:16,	41:12, 44:5, 46:1,
108:25, 109:5,	92:21, 101:5, 101:6	123:16	114:15, 115:11,	48:11, 49:16, 53:2,
109:16, 110:1,	margins [2] - 16:24,	mechanical/electric	115:14, 115:20,	56:10, 56:21, 60:18
110:9, 114:23, 115:8	58:12	[1] - 90:4	121:11, 124:8,	month [4] - 33:17,
lost [1] - 4:5	marked [22] - 2:4,	meet [2] - 59:23, 59:24	124:17, 124:21,	38:17, 103:5, 124:7
LOTURCO [1] - 1:18	2:23, 15:6, 15:16,	meeting [5] - 48:18,	124:24, 125:7 MID [1] - 1:7	monthly [1] - 30:17
low [1] - 25:23 lower [6] - 53:19, 71:5,	17:14, 17:21, 18:21,	48:25, 49:1, 49:2,	mid [1] - 108:6	months [5] - 37:12,
71:18, 72:25, 99:23,	18:22, 18:25, 19:2,	49:18	middle [2] - 51:20,	37:14, 37:22, 38:2,
101:14	24:4, 40:11, 45:22,	meetings [3] - 51:17,	51:22	116:17
lunch [1] - 56:17	87:21, 111:19,	51:19, 53:25 members [1] - 35:19	might [19] - 3:21,	morning [7] - 2:16, 28:2, 28:3, 34:9,
	119:22, 119:25,	memory [2] - 124:10,	19:17, 26:23, 44:10,	26.2, 26.3, 34.9, 140:23, 142:6
Μ	120:7, 125:4, 127:2, 141:3, 141:13	124:13	44:11, 47:6, 47:7,	most [10] - 39:22,
	market [3] - 54:20,	memos [1] - 26:5	59:17, 67:5, 77:9,	41:12, 71:17, 72:15,
M-O-N-T-A-N-E-Z [1] -	128:2, 139:5	mentioned [9] - 6:14,	79:23, 87:5, 88:25,	79:21, 79:22, 82:4,
35:1	marks [2] - 16:7, 17:5	15:2, 19:5, 19:7,	93:21, 96:13, 98:1,	112:19, 120:9,
M.V.B [37] - 1:7, 4:15,	markup [18] - 12:15,	30:5, 57:2, 58:22,	137:23, 138:5, 139:8	140:17
5:7, 6:5, 15:18, 16:1,	12:21, 13:1, 13:4,	65:8, 80:16	Mike [1] - 29:4	mostly [1] - 65:23
16:9, 16:12, 16:22,	15:21, 15:23, 16:14,	Mercedes [1] - 125:10	mileage [1] - 68:19	motions [2] - 62:7,
16:25, 17:1, 17:13,	31:22, 44:24, 44:25,	Mercedes-Benz [1] -	mind [8] - 63:20,	62:16
18:11, 19:22, 21:14, 21:10, 22:23, 23:0	45:1, 45:2, 45:17,	125:10	109:9, 127:7,	motorist [8] - 135:20,
21:19, 22:23, 23:9, 33:20, 40:15, 82:12,	45:18, 45:21, 46:6,	met [1] - 36:4	127:21, 130:17, 133:3, 134:4, 135:3	135:25, 136:6,
83:17, 83:25, 84:2,	46:7, 84:24	metal [2] - 89:16,	133:3, 134:4, 135:3	137:5, 137:17,
85:1, 88:24, 89:11,	markups [3] - 12:14,	89:24	mine [1] - 39:4 Mineola [1] - 1:10	137:23, 138:17
92:5, 93:4, 93:6,	17:17, 45:14	Metropolitan [1] -	minimizing [3] -	move [6] - 7:23, 11:9,
,,	math [8] - 15:9, 15:14,	39:22		22:18, 53:16, 93:11,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 11

124:6	141:19, 141:25	72:10, 72:16, 73:17,	127:25	53:14, 53:19, 53:23,
moving [3] - 12:3,	multiple [6] - 10:7,	73:18, 75:5, 75:7,	noted [1] - 97:2	58:13, 58:15, 81:3,
54:1	36:11, 50:7, 83:5,	84:12, 85:10, 85:15,	notes [2] - 28:17, 47:5	94:3, 118:20, 133:14
MR [154] - 2:7, 2:10,	87:16, 95:5	122:14, 140:24	nothing [10] - 27:20,	occasion [3] - 30:12,
2:18, 2:20, 3:9, 3:25,	multiplied [1] - 69:13	NEW [1] - 1:1	32:12, 32:14, 33:25,	82:16, 124:24
4:2, 4:4, 4:6, 4:10,	multiply [3] - 15:10,	New [21] - 1:10, 1:15,	34:19, 60:13, 62:21,	occasions [1] - 95:6
7:20, 8:1, 8:12, 8:14,	15:17, 15:20	1:19, 13:10, 14:13,	90:1, 98:10, 122:11	October [2] - 33:17,
12:5, 12:6, 13:24,	must [3] - 77:20,	14:16, 24:13, 35:2,	notice [2] - 77:16,	33:22
14:4, 16:17, 16:19,	122:5, 123:17	38:4, 38:9, 38:11,	106:13	odd [1] - 23:22
17:6, 17:11, 17:23,	MUTUAL [1] - 1:4	38:14, 38:15, 39:8,	notified [3] - 76:7,	OEM [27] - 19:7,
19:16, 21:1, 21:21,		52:4, 57:19, 60:22,	77:14, 109:25	19:13, 50:6, 51:5,
22:11, 23:6, 23:16,	Ν	63:2, 75:22	November [3] - 124:7,	70:17, 71:18, 75:5,
24:2, 25:13, 26:10,	11	next [8] - 3:19, 9:2,	124:13, 124:16	84:7, 84:11, 84:12,
27:3, 27:20, 27:24,	nailed [1] - 103:19	11:9, 34:5, 68:4,	nowadays [1] - 53:24	96:7, 127:5, 128:19,
28:1, 29:11, 30:1,	name [10] - 34:24,	68:5, 81:17, 133:14	number [23] - 5:4, 8:5,	128:21, 129:4,
32:4, 32:10, 32:13,	35:10, 35:12, 36:18,	Nick [1] - 92:5	9:17, 10:14, 12:1,	129:8, 129:9,
33:2, 33:12, 33:14,	36:23, 37:9, 41:2,	night [1] - 81:15	12:3, 20:6, 20:12,	129:12, 129:14,
33:16, 33:23, 33:25,	56:22, 62:25, 124:14	nine [3] - 59:16, 84:18,	32:19, 41:20, 48:14,	130:1, 130:5, 130:7,
34:7, 34:8, 34:13,	NASSAU [1] - 1:2	108:15	48:15, 50:19, 68:19,	131:1, 131:10,
35:5, 38:20, 40:16,	Nassau [7] - 1:9,	Nissan [36] - 13:5,	68:22, 69:9, 92:13,	131:13, 131:18,
41:10, 42:15, 42:20,	65:23, 82:3, 82:23,	15:23, 18:12, 19:7,	92:16, 92:22,	131:22
43:7, 43:14, 46:20,	90:23, 91:25	19:25, 31:10, 31:12,	112:21, 112:24,	OF [4] - 1:1, 1:2,
46:23, 47:13, 48:9,	national [2] - 37:10,	42:1, 68:7, 74:7,	113:4, 133:11	142:11
48:23, 49:5, 49:8,	37:17	74:9, 74:10, 81:21,	numbers [2] - 22:22,	offer [6] - 36:1, 56:2,
49:13, 50:17, 51:22,	nature [1] - 43:25	82:13, 90:22, 91:12,	31:6	56:3, 90:9, 91:23,
52:5, 52:24, 53:1,	nearly [3] - 106:23,	100:6, 102:6,	01.0	131:3
53:7, 54:10, 56:14,	107:1, 107:2	102:12, 103:9,	0	offered [2] - 90:2,
56:16, 56:20, 58:4,	necessarily [3] -	104:4, 120:12,	U	124:21
60:13, 60:15, 60:17,	66:17, 123:6, 133:22	120:14, 120:18,	oath [3] - 2:15, 96:19,	offering [1] - 90:14
61:19, 61:20, 61:23,	necessary [16] -	121:15, 123:25,	112:8	offers [2] - 90:3,
62:1, 62:6, 62:14,	41:14, 46:13, 46:18,	124:2, 126:16,	object [7] - 27:3,	130:25
63:4, 63:6, 63:20,	46:25, 47:12, 54:19,	126:21, 127:9,	29:11, 30:1, 33:2,	offhand [1] - 72:14
73:24, 74:4, 78:12,	62:4, 99:2, 99:10,	127:14, 127:23,	42:15, 49:5, 53:7	office [5] - 9:13,
78:15, 83:8, 84:17,	99:15, 99:19, 99:24,	127:25, 137:11,	objection [44] - 3:25,	30:14, 63:8, 63:9,
95:17, 95:18, 95:21,	114:23, 115:8,	139:1	7:20, 8:12, 16:17,	83:19
96:15, 96:16, 97:16,	132:18, 140:20	Nissan's [3] - 127:4,	17:6, 19:16, 21:1,	OFFICER [9] - 2:14,
97:19, 97:22, 98:3,	necessity [1] - 47:3	129:4, 129:18	21:21, 22:11, 32:4,	8:3, 12:8, 17:25,
98:10, 98:13,	need [13] - 39:14,	non [12] - 79:9,	33:23, 42:20, 46:20,	24:6, 40:17, 41:11,
102:13, 104:14,	42:5, 50:11, 78:21,	128:11, 129:4,	47:13, 48:9, 48:23,	83:10, 84:19
106:20, 107:1,	87:6, 91:8, 96:17,	129:8, 129:12,	50:17, 51:22, 52:24,	OFFICIAL [2] - 1:23,
108:20, 108:23,	109:12, 111:3,	130:1, 130:5, 130:7,	54:10, 78:12, 78:14,	142:15
109:8, 109:14,	111:25, 124:10,	131:1, 131:10,	95:17, 96:23, 97:7,	often [4] - 30:17, 31:7,
110:2, 110:5,	126:10, 139:12	131:13, 131:18	97:9, 97:17, 109:8,	59:23, 139:12
110:18, 110:23,	needed [8] - 67:7,	non-agreed [1] - 79:9	109:10, 110:2,	oils [1] - 50:2
111:9, 111:25,	69:9, 75:3, 81:7,	non-OEM [10] - 129:4,	110:18, 110:23,	Old [1] - 1:19
112:11, 114:9,	81:16, 87:17, 94:25,	129:8, 129:12,	111:2, 114:9,	once [8] - 28:8, 28:9,
114:11, 115:2,	138:19	130:1, 130:5, 130:7,	123:11, 123:22,	32:14, 38:17, 65:11,
115:6, 115:17,	negatively [1] - 132:21	131:1, 131:10,	125:19, 126:2,	65:18, 78:7, 105:6
115:18, 116:21,	negligence [2] - 8:7,	131:13, 131:18	131:23, 135:17,	One [1] - 63:1
118:22, 118:25,	8:18	non-quality [1] -	136:17, 136:24,	one [43] - 5:3, 5:18,
123:11, 123:13,	negotiate [1] - 30:14	128:11	137:25, 140:9	15:8, 18:6, 18:17,
123:22, 125:19,	negotiated [1] - 96:25	none [2] - 4:25, 31:25	objections [1] - 96:6	20:4, 21:8, 26:20,
126:2, 126:25,	never [6] - 70:23, 86:4,	nonresponsive [2] -	obligated [1] - 29:24	26:22, 38:25, 39:21,
130:9, 131:23,	103:20, 105:21,	23:7, 118:22	obligation [1] - 28:22	39:22, 42:4, 42:19,
132:23, 132:25,	137:13, 137:15	normal [1] - 67:6	obligations [2] -	50:5, 53:1, 55:1,
133:5, 133:7,	new [26] - 20:5, 20:21,	normalization [1] -	78:18, 128:25	58:23, 61:16, 67:22,
134:20, 135:17,	21:8, 37:8, 64:16,	118:13	obvious [1] - 76:18	72:7, 75:24, 76:24,
136:17, 136:25,	65:13, 70:17, 71:2,	normally [1] - 7:2	obviously [16] - 6:23,	80:2, 81:8, 82:16,
137:25, 140:2,	71:7, 71:12, 71:24,	North [4] - 39:7,	11:14, 15:8, 22:4,	84:24, 85:2, 85:10,
140:9, 140:19,	72:2, 72:4, 72:7,	127:9, 127:14,	22:8, 39:8, 48:4,	85:25, 87:17, 91:8,
140:25, 141:5,	,, . ,	· · · ·		, - , -· , - - · , - , · -· · , · , · -· · , · , · -· · , · -·, · -· · , · -·, · -· · , · -· · , · -·, · -· · , · -·, · -· · , · -· · , · -·,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 12

99:5, 109:6, 112:1,	67:12, 67:19, 68:7,	69:16, 69:17, 69:19,	137:3, 139:24	96:8
123:20, 126:13,	99:21, 132:10,	70:17, 70:18, 70:20,	patient [1] - 123:20	permission [2] -
128:10, 130:18,	132:16	70:21, 70:23, 71:1,	PATRICIA [2] - 1:23,	111:9, 141:5
132:12, 132:13,	overwrites [6] - 67:14,	71:2, 71:5, 71:7,	142:15	permit [1] - 96:11
137:23, 139:11	132:21, 133:20,	71:12, 71:14, 71:17,	pattern [2] - 30:15,	permitted [1] - 110:12
ones [1] - 82:5	134:2, 134:14,	71:18, 72:4, 72:5,	30:16	person [5] - 17:14,
ongoing [3] - 59:7,	134:17	72:11, 72:21, 72:23,	pay [7] - 25:24, 29:24,	36:12, 57:15, 70:2,
64:24, 64:25	owe [1] - 137:21	73:3, 73:6, 73:7,	55:10, 120:14,	136:11
online [1] - 64:20	owed [10] - 5:8, 32:7,	73:8, 73:9, 73:12,	140:17	personally [4] -
OO [2] - 120:8, 120:10	32:12, 32:14, 32:21,	73:14, 73:19, 74:5,	paying [6] - 28:13,	115:23, 116:3,
open [3] - 50:20,	32:23, 111:11,	74:6, 74:12, 74:14,	28:19, 28:20, 53:20,	116:14, 121:3
50:22, 61:17	111:13, 111:16	74:16, 74:17, 74:19,	120:1, 124:24	personnel [4] - 35:16,
operate [2] - 49:21,	owes [1] - 6:7	75:1, 75:4, 75:5,	payment [3] - 97:8,	36:16, 40:10
49:22	own [8] - 31:16, 35:11,	75:6, 75:7, 84:15,	124:8, 124:17	pertain [1] - 98:17
operating [2] - 43:5,	39:21, 85:25, 104:9,	85:7, 85:19, 90:17,	payments [10] - 4:22,	pertaining [1] - 41:1
138:17	107:18, 114:3, 137:6	112:19, 126:13,	5:14, 6:12, 23:4,	pertains [1] - 64:7
operation [7] - 69:21,	owned [5] - 15:2, 16:2,	128:11, 129:8,	23:14, 115:23,	Pete [3] - 37:15, 37:16
117:13, 117:14,	16:4, 17:14, 17:18	129:12, 129:14,	116:4, 116:14,	Pete [3] - 37:15, 37:16 Peter [1] - 37:9
118:4, 118:21,	owner [5] - 12:22,	131:10, 134:6,	116:18	
122:1, 122:6	16:11, 16:12, 16:21,	134:18	payout [1] - 54:22	phase [1] - 94:22 photo [2] - 52:17, 81:1
operations [3] - 88:21,	45:21	PART [1] - 1:2	peer [1] - 37:6	•
123:16, 123:17	owners [1] - 35:17	part-time [1] - 36:1	pending [1] - 5:12	photographs [1] -
opinion [3] - 78:18,	owns [4] - 16:15, 17:1	parted [1] - 75:15	Penn [1] - 37:21	68:13
85:9, 86:1		particular [29] - 45:21,	people [6] - 37:8,	phrase [1] - 51:22 physical [6] - 13:12,
opinions [1] - 26:4	Р	48:7, 63:8, 63:10,	38:6, 39:24, 44:20,	
opposed [4] - 72:10,	Г	64:6, 64:13, 69:16,	49:1, 76:8	13:15, 14:14, 80:6,
80:10, 85:10, 85:14	P&L [3] - 35:13, 35:14,	69:24, 71:7, 71:14,	per [6] - 46:17, 49:25,	80:25, 81:2
opposite [2] - 43:19,	37:16	73:5, 77:19, 79:17,	54:5, 90:5, 115:19,	physically [3] - 81:17, 87:7, 88:3
48:6	pack [2] - 51:20, 51:23	79:25, 80:9, 87:15,	124:24	pick [2] - 61:5, 140:23
optimum [1] - 127:24	page [8] - 127:19,	88:17, 88:18, 89:2,	percent [26] - 15:6,	picture [2] - 86:23,
options [3] - 30:8,	128:12, 133:11,	90:17, 91:20, 94:7,	15:18, 15:19, 15:20,	86:24
68:19, 76:1	133:13, 133:14,	98:20, 99:1, 115:25,	16:8, 17:5, 17:14,	pieces [3] - 19:8,
order [9] - 2:2, 2:6,	134:9, 135:2	116:10, 116:11,	17:21, 19:1, 28:10,	75:16, 109:13
2:11, 2:13, 61:24,	paid [19] - 7:13, 22:18,	123:24, 124:9	45:18, 45:23, 46:7,	place [3] - 16:15, 56:7,
62:11, 62:13, 73:14,	22:21, 22:23, 23:3,	parties [3] - 41:20,	52:14, 67:20, 75:23,	73:14
74:15	28:5, 28:17, 32:1,	96:4, 96:10	94:3, 94:6, 100:21,	placed [2] - 41:20,
ordered [3] - 44:11,	53:10, 53:15, 53:17,	parts [25] - 15:11,	104:9, 104:12,	120:10
86:4	109:7, 118:3, 118:4,	56:9, 71:9, 72:10,	106:19, 134:21,	plaintiff [3] - 5:13,
ordinarily [1] - 135:23	118:8, 119:18,	72:16, 72:20, 75:9,	135:6	5:17, 33:9
ordinary [1] - 90:2	121:1, 125:6	79:24, 112:18,	percentages [2] -	Plaintiff [2] - 1:6, 1:14
original [9] - 19:5,	paint [3] - 49:25,	126:5, 126:9,	100:22, 104:17	Plaintiff's [3] - 2:24,
70:18, 88:5, 100:20,	112:24, 138:22	126:12, 126:14,	perform [2] - 60:4,	24:4, 24:7
104:10, 106:23,	panel [2] - 48:2, 48:3	126:18, 126:20,	136:7	platinum [1] - 59:19
107:2, 127:23,	paper [2] - 19:8, 50:8	126:21, 127:12,	performance [2] -	play [1] - 54:13
128:20	paperwork [4] - 31:4,	127:16, 127:23,	134:17, 134:18	played [1] - 38:3
outer [1] - 48:3	60:21, 61:1, 61:7	128:2, 131:1,	performed [17] -	pleaded [1] - 109:6
outside [1] - 49:6	paragraph [6] - 3:14,	131:13, 131:22,	29:15, 40:1, 44:8,	plugged [1] - 119:8
outstanding [1] -	3:16, 3:17, 4:12,	132:17	53:4, 53:5, 100:15,	plugging [3] - 118:14,
108:21	4:18, 4:19	party [4] - 54:21, 81:7,	102:2, 117:3,	118:15, 118:17
overage [2] - 8:6, 8:17	paragraphs [1] - 61:16	107:18, 141:20	117:11, 120:19,	plus [2] - 23:23, 84:24
overages [1] - 10:22	parents [1] - 37:24	passed [2] - 67:3,	121:7, 121:10,	pocket [1] - 45:9
overall [1] - 52:12	parking [2] - 42:25,	109:20	121:15, 121:17,	point [20] - 10:20,
overrule [1] - 111:1	80:13	passenger [2] - 43:12,	123:4, 125:17,	15:11, 22:3, 41:24,
overruled [8] - 19:18,	part [79] - 3:16, 4:5,	44:1 past [3] - 98:5, 101:15,	139:15	50:11, 59:25, 60:6,
21:2, 42:21, 47:14,	19:10, 19:13, 20:15,		performs [1] - 115:21	64:23, 77:12, 94:8,
50:18, 78:19, 110:4,	36:1, 42:22, 42:24,	138:5 Pat (41) 23:10 27:16	period [2] - 51:18,	94:10, 97:2, 97:17,
132:3	43:1, 43:2, 44:11,	Pat [11] - 23:19, 27:16,	107:8	104:19, 104:20,
overtime [2] - 66:11,	44:15, 47:2, 48:13,	46:2, 57:24, 86:10, 96:20, 111:5,	periodically [1] -	104:24, 109:20,
66:14	57:4, 59:4, 67:6,	96.20, 111.5, 131:25, 136:21,	131:6	109:23, 111:14,
overwrite [7] - 66:23,	67:17, 69:11, 69:12,	131.23, 130.21,	peripheral [2] - 83:24,	116:23

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 13

pointed [2] - 30:25,	pre-loss [16] - 21:15,	50:12, 50:23, 58:12,	27:6, 28:4, 31:18,	27:18, 46:3, 46:5,
88:20	21:20, 22:5, 22:7,	58:19	33:12, 53:2, 56:14,	57:24, 57:25, 84:8,
policy [8] - 11:11,	22:15, 22:16, 28:23,	program [5] - 54:17,	56:16, 61:19,	86:10, 86:11, 96:20,
11:13, 11:15, 11:17,	41:14, 46:19, 75:21,	54:19, 55:23, 66:18,	125:13, 126:6, 141:2	96:22, 111:3, 111:6,
24:13, 136:15,	99:2, 99:7, 100:12,	123:9	quick [3] - 24:10,	113:22, 115:2,
136:18, 136:19	104:4, 114:23, 115:8	programs [6] - 39:15,	140:25	116:12, 117:12,
poor [1] - 67:25	pre-marked [1] - 2:23	50:5, 52:9, 52:11,	quietly [1] - 113:22	128:9, 128:10,
Pope [30] - 3:4, 3:24,	predate [1] - 87:1	54:24, 122:15	quote [6] - 101:19,	130:9, 130:12,
• • • • • •	predates [1] - 87:3	Progressive [1] -	101:23, 107:14,	131:25, 132:2,
4:8, 5:7, 5:13, 5:25,		•		133:15, 136:20,
6:7, 6:9, 6:20, 7:2, 8:11, 8:22, 8:24,	predictable [3] -	37:18 Progressive's [1] -	127:5, 130:1, 130:5	136:22, 136:25,
	25:21, 30:6, 30:7	0	quoting [1] - 138:24	137:4, 139:23,
11:11, 22:19, 23:14,	predominantly [1] -	37:10	P	139:25, 141:8
23:23, 24:24, 31:8,	49:21	proof [1] - 9:16	R	reading [5] - 127:7,
32:1, 32:9, 32:12,	preferable [1] - 96:14	proper [3] - 52:7,	10100 (0) 04:45 60:47	
32:23, 57:15, 100:7,	prepare [4] - 26:19,	57:18, 60:19	raise [2] - 34:15, 62:17	127:21, 134:4,
103:8, 111:13,	30:8, 30:15, 92:25	properly [3] - 24:15,	raises [2] - 66:18,	134:19, 135:3
111:18, 137:10	present [3] - 49:9,	119:9, 140:8	127:13	ready [3] - 30:10,
Pope's [10] - 4:14,	74:25, 80:20	property [1] - 122:18	Ramsey [1] - 38:15	34:12, 62:12
18:7, 33:5, 68:6,	presentation [1] -	provide [6] - 59:15,	ran [1] - 40:7	realize [1] - 54:2
82:13, 102:11,	37:6	61:11, 68:21,	range [3] - 55:24,	really [6] - 38:15,
104:4, 123:24,	presented [4] - 86:4,	102:13, 127:24,	59:1, 64:21	38:19, 39:14, 45:10,
126:16, 139:1	86:15, 86:17, 87:19	135:9	rate [73] - 4:16, 20:10,	71:10, 80:12
Porsche [1] - 39:13	preserve [2] - 62:1,	provided [7] - 8:22,	30:19, 30:21, 46:14,	rear [8] - 42:3, 43:12,
portion [14] - 3:10,	62:2	8:25, 9:17, 19:8,	46:15, 47:2, 48:12,	48:2, 48:3, 69:2,
23:20, 27:18, 46:5,	presiding [1] - 2:2	52:13, 81:21, 129:25	49:11, 49:17, 50:11,	84:16, 85:12, 86:22
53:12, 57:25, 86:11,	pressures [1] - 117:24	Providence [3] - 39:6,	50:13, 53:10, 53:11,	reason [9] - 79:17,
96:22, 111:6,	pretty [4] - 32:18,	39:8	53:12, 53:14, 53:19,	79:25, 80:9, 90:14,
130:12, 132:2,	67:20, 80:15, 118:15	provides [1] - 70:4	53:20, 54:5, 54:14,	109:11, 122:7,
136:22, 137:4,	prevailing [3] - 90:21,	providing [1] - 8:10	54:16, 57:3, 57:8,	127:14, 127:25,
139:25	91:25, 92:1	public [1] - 135:10	57:16, 58:13, 58:20,	137:23
position [3] - 87:13,	previously [2] - 32:11,	pull [1] - 96:25	60:20, 69:13, 69:24,	reasonable [6] -
109:24, 110:3	96:4	purchased [3] - 20:17,	70:1, 70:2, 70:8,	47:11, 47:16, 109:7,
possession [1] -	price [18] - 6:16, 6:24,	44:13, 67:6	70:11, 84:1, 89:15,	132:6, 132:8, 137:7
28:12	69:12, 69:19, 71:18,	purpose [1] - 96:12	89:18, 89:20, 89:22,	reasonably [1] -
possibility [1] - 11:1	71:23, 73:22, 75:19,	pursued [1] - 7:6	89:25, 90:2, 90:5,	109:20
possible [12] - 3:4,	78:10, 79:9, 82:15,	push [1] - 43:18	90:8, 90:9, 90:13,	reasons [1] - 90:6
3:15, 3:20, 21:15,	82:22, 90:7, 92:1,	put [12] - 41:18, 41:24,	90:14, 90:15, 90:17,	rebuilt [1] - 65:20
22:5, 70:16, 125:1,	92:2, 99:6, 129:8,	45:24, 54:5, 55:4,	90:21, 90:22, 91:2,	receipts [1] - 18:2
132:22, 135:16,	138:25	85:1, 85:2, 92:6,	91:3, 91:16, 91:19,	receive [1] - 81:14
138:18, 139:7,	prices [1] - 125:21	97:6, 126:9, 128:11,	91:23, 92:6, 92:12,	received [2] - 17:13,
139:10	principal [1] - 17:8	128:19	92:15, 93:4, 93:8,	17:15
possibly [4] - 82:6,	print [2] - 130:22,		93:10, 93:11, 96:7,	recent [1] - 120:10
86:23, 88:11, 139:14	130:23	Q	97:11, 98:8, 116:4,	recess [4] - 34:11,
post [4] - 26:5, 40:3,	printed [2] - 11:3, 11:7		117:5, 118:3, 118:5,	61:22, 62:10, 112:3
52:16, 62:3	privileges [2] - 31:22,	qualification [1] -	119:16, 120:23,	recessing [1] - 142:2
postdate [1] - 87:1	31:24	16:17	124:2, 124:18	recognize [3] - 2:24,
posted [3] - 30:21,	privity [1] - 32:25	qualified [1] - 37:3	rates [10] - 30:19,	141:14, 141:16
57:8, 93:10	Pro [2] - 64:25, 65:1	qualifying [1] - 38:22	47:8, 47:17, 55:2,	recognizes [1] -
PP [2] - 120:8, 120:10	problem [3] - 68:4,	quality [17] - 52:12,	57:20, 61:8, 70:6,	127:11
practice [2] - 6:17,	101:16, 138:20	54:6, 60:1, 60:2,	94:9, 98:5, 126:4	recollection [4] -
121:5	procedures [3] - 47:5,	71:5, 73:2, 73:4,	rather [2] - 19:15,	20:23, 29:3, 92:5,
practices [1] - 65:19	55:2	73:6, 73:9, 74:17,	42:18	113:17
Pratti [3] - 37:9, 37:15	proceed [2] - 2:17,	85:18, 85:22, 85:24,	re [3] - 67:3, 67:4,	recommend [3] -
pre [18] - 2:23, 21:15,	44:4	127:13, 128:11,	138:10	72:10, 128:3, 128:15
21:20, 22:5, 22:7,	process [7] - 25:22,	138:6, 139:11	re-inspector [1] - 67:3	recommendation [12]
22:15, 22:16, 28:23,	26:20, 40:4, 43:23,	quantity [1] - 41:23	re-repairs [1] - 138:10	- 29:17, 72:16,
40:4, 41:14, 46:19,	64:25, 66:23, 67:12	quarter [1] - 48:2	reaching [2] - 82:15,	72:17, 72:18, 72:19,
75:21, 99:2, 99:7,	profit [2] - 16:24,	QUESTION [2] -	82:22	127:5, 127:17,
100:12, 104:4,	53:23	133:19, 134:13	read [35] - 3:9, 3:10,	128:6, 128:13,
114:23, 115:8	profitability [4] -	questions [12] - 26:6,	23:18, 23:20, 27:16,	129:5, 129:18,
	promaniny [4] -			, -,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 14

131:21	5:7	70:15, 71:8, 73:18,	46:12	58:22, 59:14, 60:9,
recommendations [3]	reinspection [4] -	74:20, 75:4, 75:18,	request [4] - 62:4,	61:11, 83:4, 100:24,
- 126:23, 126:24,	29:4, 67:22, 67:25,	76:12, 77:21, 78:5,	81:10, 107:22,	107:7
129:2	68:8	78:9, 78:10, 79:1,	109:19	Rice's [1] - 101:4
recommended [2] -	reinspections [1] -	79:3, 79:6, 80:13,	requested [15] - 3:10,	ridiculous [1] - 45:23
29:16, 72:22	29:6	81:8, 81:10, 81:25,	23:20, 27:18, 46:5,	right-hand [1] - 42:7
reconstruction [1] -	reiterate [1] - 97:16	82:2, 82:23, 90:7,	57:25, 86:11, 96:22,	rights [6] - 4:21, 6:11,
36:6	relate [1] - 54:5	90:23, 96:9, 96:14,	107:23, 108:1,	26:19, 26:21, 26:22,
record [4] - 3:13,	related [2] - 42:22,	99:16, 114:23,	111:6, 130:12,	62:15
97:18, 97:25, 133:10	43:4	115:8, 115:20,	132:2, 136:22,	rim [2] - 43:3, 44:13
recross [2] - 33:13,	relates [3] - 26:18,	115:24, 116:4,	137:4, 139:25	rims [2] - 41:24, 42:24
61:20	84:15, 85:2	116:7, 116:15,	requests [3] - 62:7,	rise [1] - 2:1
RECROSS [1] - 33:15	relationship [5] - 27:9,	116:18, 122:5,	79:12, 81:8	risk [2] - 139:16, 140:7
recycled [43] - 19:10,	39:19, 44:17, 55:20,	125:8, 127:12,	require [1] - 77:11	risks [1] - 42:12
19:13, 20:5, 20:15,	136:10	127:15, 138:4,	required [4] - 47:21,	Road [1] - 1:19
21:8, 70:20, 71:2,	relevance [2] - 48:23,	138:8, 138:12,	59:7, 60:5, 139:9	roads [1] - 75:15
71:7, 71:11, 71:17,	52:24	138:16, 138:19,	requirement [2] -	roadway [2] - 43:20
71:24, 72:2, 72:4,	relevant [2] - 27:1,	138:20, 138:25,	19:7, 72:18	Rockaway [5] - 13:5,
72:7, 72:10, 72:23,	139:22	139:3, 139:6, 139:9,	requirements [1] -	15:23, 17:18, 18:12,
73:3, 73:6, 73:12,	remain [4] - 34:15,	139:16, 140:3, 140:6	52:10	18:24
73:17, 73:19, 74:5,	62:11, 62:17, 112:4	repairable [3] - 28:9,	requires [1] - 57:19	Rockville [4] - 13:10,
74:6, 74:12, 74:19,	remedies [2] - 3:4, 5:3	77:25, 103:17 repaired [6] - 13:16,	reserved [1] - 62:15	14:13, 14:16, 14:24
75:1, 75:4, 75:6, 75:9, 84:16, 85:7,	remedy [1] - 7:17	42:5, 44:5, 52:22,	resets [3] - 117:15,	role [2] - 54:12, 102:6
85:10, 85:14, 85:19,	remember [10] -	97:3, 138:25	117:18, 120:22	room [3] - 48:20,
86:3, 86:5, 87:18,	57:11, 83:15, 89:7, 89:9, 124:15,	repairing [9] - 22:3,	residence [1] - 18:13 resold [1] - 75:16	48:21, 57:5
127:12, 130:7,	133:16, 134:24,	28:18, 46:13, 46:19,	respect [2] - 55:7,	Rover [1] - 39:13
131:1, 131:10,	134:25, 135:1	46:25, 100:11,	62:16	RPR [2] - 1:23, 142:15 RR [1] - 124:16
131:13	reminded [3] - 2:14,	125:14, 138:13	responsibility [3] -	Rubin [1] - 56:22
recycling [1] - 127:11	96:18, 112:7	repairs [34] - 6:18,	23:25, 24:1, 63:17	RUBIN [1] - 1:14
redirect [1] - 27:23	removal [3] - 95:14,	13:12, 13:17, 13:19,	responsible [10] -	rule [4] - 126:21,
REDIRECT [2] - 27:25,	96:12, 97:12	20:9, 20:25, 21:7,	4:21, 6:12, 7:3, 7:6,	128:7, 128:10, 129:4
60:16	rental [22] - 8:6, 8:10,	22:24, 23:3, 23:10,	23:13, 23:21, 28:11,	runs [1] - 61:18
redone [2] - 78:24,	8:17, 8:22, 9:2, 9:15,	23:11, 28:9, 28:11,	28:12, 28:19, 32:17	rush [1] - 53:13
138:6	9:16, 9:21, 9:23,	28:19, 57:21, 64:11,	responsive [2] -	
reduces [1] - 131:14	9:25, 10:3, 10:13,	77:11, 82:20, 91:4, 92:1, 92:2, 94:25,	23:16, 27:4	S
refer [1] - 14:4	10:21, 10:22, 11:2,	95:3, 95:12, 97:4,	restore [1] - 104:4	-
reference [2] - 128:19,	11:6, 11:12, 11:20,	99:17, 137:5, 138:2,	restoring [1] - 99:2	safe [3] - 10:13, 75:15,
139:1	11:25, 20:10, 32:2,	138:9, 138:10,	result [2] - 28:18,	79:4
referred [2] - 14:2,	83:24	139:12, 140:4,	30:13	safely [1] - 139:17
127:4 referring [2] - 41:3,	rented [1] - 8:24 Repair [2] - 35:23,	140:14, 140:15	retrieve [1] - 50:2	safety [4] - 42:19,
94:6	59:1	Repairs [1] - 14:25	returned [5] - 10:3, 10:13, 10:21, 11:23,	43:5, 127:14, 127:24
refers [1] - 66:24	repair [103] - 4:16, 5:1,	repeat [3] - 3:7, 21:16,	28:15	salaried [1] - 66:8
refinish [4] - 69:20,	12:25, 13:23, 14:3,	110:7	review [5] - 64:2,	salary [5] - 66:10, 67:15, 132:21,
89:22, 90:13, 92:2	15:6, 15:16, 20:4,	repeated [1] - 78:21	81:16, 112:14,	134:15, 132:21, 134:15, 134:16
refinished [1] - 69:17	20:13, 20:19, 22:6,	rephrase [7] - 8:15,	120:9, 133:12	salvage [6] - 70:22,
refinishing [1] -	22:7, 26:20, 28:10,	8:16, 16:19, 33:19,	reviewed [2] - 37:6,	70:23, 70:24, 75:11,
112:24	28:23, 35:15, 35:16,	42:14, 46:21, 140:2	40:21	75:13
reflected [1] - 135:3	38:5, 38:13, 38:16,	replace [3] - 126:11,	reviews [2] - 40:3,	salvaged [6] - 28:13,
reflects [1] - 46:24	39:14, 40:4, 40:20,	126:14, 126:21	52:17	28:14, 28:16,
refresh [1] - 113:17	41:14, 43:23, 44:6,	replaced [2] - 87:6, 126:18	revise [6] - 100:17,	127:12, 127:15,
refreshed [2] - 124:10,	45:4, 45:5, 45:7,	reported [1] - 108:6	100:20, 102:20,	128:8
124:13	45:17, 47:22, 49:21,	REPORTER [2] - 1:23,	103:21, 105:3,	sat [1] - 92:14
regard [1] - 102:6	49:23, 52:8, 52:15,	142:15	105:17	saw [4] - 89:3, 102:8,
regardless [1] - 121:9	52:16, 53:12, 54:14, 54:16, 54:19, 54:23,	represent [1] - 60:23	revised [4] - 104:1,	102:11, 102:15
regular [4] - 29:12,	54.16, 54.19, 54.23, 55:2, 55:6, 55:17,	representative [2] -	105:9, 105:14, 107:5	scenario [1] - 74:23
47:18, 121:5, 131:9		60:23, 78:5	revisit [1] - 29:22	school [5] - 37:21,
roimburcod w 6.7	<u>33,23, 30,4, 30,6</u> ,	00.20, 10.0	Dhodo (41 - 20:0	
reimbursed [1] - 6:7 reimbursement [1] -	55:23, 56:4, 56:8, 59:3, 69:4, 69:23,	represented [1] -	Rhode [1] - 39:9 Rice [8] - 36:19,	37:23, 37:24, 37:25, 38:1

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 15

scope [4] - 49:7,	142:4	38:17, 40:11, 41:6,	sometimes [12] - 31:5,	29:18, 47:8, 90:1,
68:14, 78:16, 80:15	setup [1] - 119:15	86:23, 111:19,	36:11, 56:3, 59:2,	90:2, 90:6, 138:6
score [1] - 67:18	seven [5] - 37:14,	113:16, 113:20,	59:4, 67:25, 70:11,	standing [2] - 34:15,
	81:23, 105:16	116:21, 119:22,	70:14, 76:16, 87:5,	62:17
scrape [2] - 44:2, 44:3	several [4] - 3:23, 4:3,	120:7, 125:2,	126:9, 126:10	start [6] - 34:5, 38:6,
scrapes [1] - 43:1 scratched [1] - 85:24		126:25, 133:1,	somewhat [4] - 43:9,	51:15, 57:21, 68:25,
	4:7, 4:13 severe [2] - 76:17,	133:3, 133:4, 133:5	43:18, 44:3, 97:14	76:15
scratches [1] - 42:25	77:10	showing [11] - 2:23,	somewhere [1] - 9:3	started [5] - 11:6,
screwed [2] - 139:6,		8:3, 12:8, 17:25,	soon [1] - 78:9	38:4, 38:5, 74:11,
139:8	severity [1] - 87:9 shall [1] - 34:19	24:6, 40:17, 41:11,	sooner [1] - 97:3	98:1
search [2] - 73:8	sheet [3] - 61:15,	83:10, 84:19, 96:12,	sorry [32] - 3:12, 4:5,	starting [4] - 3:14,
seat [2] - 34:22, 62:24		112:13	20:7, 21:16, 24:19,	4:18, 89:24, 140:23
seated [3] - 2:2, 62:11,	89:16, 89:24	shown [5] - 17:23,	26:10, 27:14, 39:7,	state [7] - 34:23,
112:4	shop [94] - 5:11, 6:15,	24:2, 83:8, 83:18,	44:7, 56:13, 58:11,	34:24, 55:5, 59:8,
second [13] - 3:2,	35:17, 35:24, 36:2,	84:18	59:6, 86:8, 91:18,	62:24, 62:25, 109:8
3:14, 3:16, 3:17,	36:16, 37:24, 38:1,	sick [1] - 51:3	106:11, 107:3,	State [122] - 3:5, 4:15,
18:13, 18:21, 29:4,	38:14, 39:21, 40:5,	side [11] - 42:1, 42:7,	108:16, 109:2,	5:18, 6:5, 6:6, 6:8,
54:2, 86:2, 86:12,	40:7, 45:20, 50:1, 50:25, 53:5, 53:19	43:12, 43:14, 43:15,	115:19, 116:9,	6:15, 6:25, 7:17, 8:6,
96:6, 102:4, 102:7	50:25, 53:5, 53:19, 53:20, 53:22, 54:1	43:12, 43:14, 43:13, 43:16, 43:19, 44:1,	118:22, 118:25,	8:10, 8:13, 8:18, 9:5,
secondary [1] - 48:6	53:20, 53:22, 54:1,	48:6, 95:20, 96:3	120:13, 122:13,	9:10, 9:13, 11:12, 9:10, 9:13, 11:12,
section [1] - 3:16	54:23, 55:16, 55:17, 57:9, 57:20, 58:19,	side-bar [2] - 95:20,	120:13, 122:13, 124:4, 126:19,	9.10, 9.13, 11.12, 11:20, 20:15, 21:13,
see [21] - 13:1, 30:17,		96:3	124.4, 120.19, 128:18, 130:3,	21:14, 21:18, 21:19,
52:17, 55:24, 68:15,	60:5, 60:19, 61:6, 73:14, 73:15, 73:18,	sides [1] - 21:19	133:14, 136:25,	22:8, 22:18, 23:3,
68:20, 74:16, 80:15,	73:14, 73:15, 73:18, 73:23, 74:15, 74:25,	sign [1] - 61:7	139:23, 142:6	23:13, 23:25, 24:22,
83:16, 83:20, 84:7,	75:18, 76:12, 77:9,	signature [1] - 60:23	sort [1] - 72:15	25:23, 27:1, 28:5,
85:4, 87:7, 103:16,	77:21, 78:1, 78:2,	signed [12] - 3:3, 4:8,	sought [1] - 6:4	28:18, 28:25, 29:8,
104:16, 110:8,	78:6, 78:9, 78:16,	6:9, 6:20, 24:18,	sound [1] - 106:21	29:23, 30:12, 30:17,
113:19, 117:1,	79:4, 79:6, 79:11,	24:20, 24:25, 26:15,	southern [1] - 65:23	33:1, 33:5, 36:22,
133:4, 142:3, 142:5	80:13, 80:17, 80:20,	26:16, 26:24, 31:3,	Spa [1] - 63:2	37:2, 37:22, 52:4,
seeing [3] - 53:23,	81:9, 81:10, 82:11,	37:13	spanned [1] - 106:1	56:23, 56:24, 57:1,
80:12, 124:1	88:20, 88:25, 90:7,	signing [1] - 7:4	speaking [4] - 53:24,	57:16, 57:19, 59:4,
seeking [4] - 5:3, 5:7,	90:23, 91:10, 91:22,	signs [2] - 3:24, 4:4	92:6, 107:18, 129:13	59:8, 60:2, 60:22,
5:25, 6:21	93:3, 98:21, 98:23,	similar [7] - 65:10,	special [3] - 31:21,	63:2, 63:14, 63:15,
select [7] - 39:4,	101:22, 109:25,	70:21, 73:1, 73:2,	31:24, 33:9	63:17, 63:23, 63:25,
39:24, 52:2, 52:5,	110:10, 110:11,	73:4, 90:11, 90:12	specialize [1] - 55:19	66:9, 68:12, 69:25,
52:6, 52:7, 55:19	115:25, 121:10,	simple [1] - 118:18	specialty [3] - 91:5,	70:1, 76:8, 81:8,
self [1] - 35:9	121:17, 122:5,	single [1] - 58:6	91:6, 91:8	81:10, 90:2, 90:21,
self-employed [1] - 35:9	123:5, 123:15,	sit [1] - 113:13	specific [8] - 51:19,	94:9, 94:14, 100:2,
	123:17, 123:18,	site [1] - 80:12	59:2, 65:22, 69:3,	100:20, 101:16,
semi [1] - 44:3	129:17, 131:19,	sits [1] - 30:23	87:4, 109:2, 119:13	103:5, 104:12,
send [7] - 67:2, 76:2,	131:21, 132:4,	sitting [5] - 9:20, 15:3,	specifically [2] -	106:18, 107:19,
76:10, 77:17, 81:10,	136:1, 136:7,	24:18, 82:8, 117:23	84:20, 104:16	107:21, 107:25,
123:16, 123:20	136:10, 136:16,	situation [5] - 4:14,	specificity [1] - 53:3	108:5, 109:4,
sends [1] - 17:4 sense [2] - 58:13,	137:7, 138:5, 138:8,	75:3, 79:9, 79:10,	specified [1] - 91:18	109:18, 109:24,
113:20	138:25, 139:3,	80:22	speculation [7] -	110:2, 110:10,
sent [5] - 32:6, 77:17,	139:6, 139:12,	six [5] - 37:12, 77:22,	21:21, 30:2, 42:16,	110:12, 110:16,
107:24, 141:11,	139:15, 140:3,	102:17, 103:23,	43:7, 48:9, 110:23,	110:21, 111:12,
107.24, 141.11, 141:17	140:14, 140:15	105:1	137:25	111:17, 114:3,
sentence [5] - 3:19,	shop's [2] - 69:24,	sizable [1] - 114:19	speculative [1] - 78:17	114:7, 114:15,
127:7, 127:9,	129:21	skill [1] - 45:5	spell [2] - 34:23, 62:25	114:22, 115:5,
127:21, 128:8	shops [24] - 38:13,	skipped [1] - 31:6	spend [2] - 98:2,	115:7, 115:15,
separate [3] - 31:19,	38:18, 39:21, 39:23,	slows [1] - 54:2	115:8	116:23, 117:7,
31:20, 44:23	39:24, 51:6, 51:12,	smaller [1] - 54:14	spent [2] - 19:23,	118:8, 119:20,
serious [1] - 127:13	51:18, 51:21, 52:1,	sole [1] - 16:21	114:15	121:1, 121:6,
services [4] - 36:1,	52:3, 52:5, 52:6,	solely [1] - 45:20	sponsor [1] - 39:20	122:23, 123:1,
100:6, 117:2, 136:7	52:7, 52:17, 52:18,	solemnly [2] - 34:17,	spray [1] - 49:24	123:2, 128:23,
sessions [4] - 59:9,	52:21, 55:22, 66:5,	62:19	Square [1] - 35:2	129:11, 129:25,
59:13, 59:14, 60:1	81:25, 82:2, 82:23,	someone [2] - 5:17,	square [1] - 97:1	130:4, 130:23,
set [1] - 57:11	90:9, 140:6	94:4	stand [1] - 97:24	130:25, 131:9,
settled [2] - 38:8,	show [18] - 8:2, 12:6,	someplace [1] - 53:18	standard [7] - 24:13,	132:20, 135:8,
Jettieu [2] - JU.U,			Standard [/] ⁻ 24.13,	

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 16

135:14, 135:23,	stuff [2] - 45:21, 53:16	87:13	terms [16] - 6:4, 17:17,	74:1, 74:2, 74:3,
136:4, 141:11, 142:1	subcontractor [2] -	suspensions [1] -	19:11, 20:9, 27:9,	78:13, 78:19, 86:8,
STATE [2] - 1:1, 1:4	45:11, 45:12	65:6	29:14, 42:19, 43:5,	86:12, 86:13, 95:19,
statements [1] - 49:1	subject [3] - 44:7,	sustain [2] - 17:10,	52:12, 68:11, 69:8,	95:22, 95:23, 95:24,
States [1] - 39:4	44:9, 126:6	136:24	70:25, 91:7, 96:9,	96:1, 96:2, 96:4,
states [2] - 4:9, 4:12	subjects [1] - 59:2	sustainable [1] -	115:17, 115:18	96:17, 96:20, 97:14,
stationed [1] - 37:11	sublet [6] - 44:21,	49:12	Tesla [3] - 39:13, 91:9,	97:21, 97:24, 98:11,
stay [1] - 52:10	45:8, 45:14, 45:15,	sustained [21] - 7:22,	91:10	104:18, 106:9,
steel [9] - 47:18,	117:13, 118:4	16:18, 22:12, 33:3,	test [1] - 61:17	106:11, 106:13,
47:19, 47:25, 49:20,	subletted [1] - 14:15	33:11, 33:24, 46:21,	testified [19] - 13:3,	106:23, 106:25,
49:21, 57:10, 59:3	subletting [1] - 45:11	47:23, 48:1, 48:10,	21:24, 29:12, 32:11,	107:2, 107:4,
steering [2] - 65:6,	submitted [1] - 103:16	48:24, 49:6, 51:24,	46:11, 46:12, 46:24,	108:22, 108:24,
65:11	subsection [2] -	52:25, 54:11,	100:1, 100:23,	109:1, 109:10,
STENOGRAPHIC [1] -	84:21, 85:3	110:19, 123:23,	101:18, 101:23,	110:4, 110:8,
142:11	suffered [1] - 135:22	125:20, 126:3,	106:5, 107:13,	110:14, 110:19,
step [3] - 5:4, 95:24,	Suffolk [1] - 82:6	135:18, 138:1	114:24, 129:7,	111:1, 111:4, 111:5,
142:5	suing [1] - 7:17	sustaining [1] -	132:9, 136:19,	111:10, 111:17,
steps [6] - 3:23, 4:3,	suitability [1] - 127:13	109:10	138:23, 140:3	111:22, 112:2,
4:7, 4:13, 4:25, 5:3	Suite [1] - 1:19	swear [2] - 34:17,	testify [2] - 11:17, 43:9	112:5, 112:9, 115:4,
Stewart [1] - 59:11	summarize [1] - 5:24	62:19	testimony [15] - 15:5,	118:23, 119:1,
STEWART [1] - 1:16	summer [1] - 59:17	switching [1] - 19:23	32:13, 32:14, 34:18,	119:3, 119:5,
still [17] - 2:7, 2:15,	superb [1] - 121:10	system [1] - 77:16	40:22, 46:2, 55:13,	123:14, 123:23, 125:20, 126:3
17:4, 23:9, 45:12,	superior [1] - 52:18		62:20, 96:11,	125:20, 126:3, 130:11, 131:25,
55:12, 96:18, 97:7,	supervisor [2] - 70:5,	Т	121:24, 122:7,	132:3, 132:24,
97:20, 102:4,	132:17	table 101 15.2 00.0	123:8, 133:6,	133:2, 133:9,
103:17, 112:8,	supplement [32] -	table [2] - 15:3, 82:8	133:12, 140:21	134:12, 135:18,
128:6, 130:14,	78:8, 79:12, 79:14,	TAKEN [1] - 142:12 Tango [2] - 125:3	testing [1] - 118:10 THE [176] - 1:1, 2:5,	136:20, 136:23,
135:25, 136:6,	81:7, 81:14, 81:21,	target [2] - 125.3	2:9, 2:16, 2:17, 3:12,	137:3, 138:1,
137:21	84:18, 86:18, 87:23,	43:11	4:5, 4:11, 7:21, 8:16,	139:23, 140:10,
stipulated [2] - 20:3,	87:25, 88:7, 89:2,	tasks [1] - 120:23	13:22, 14:2, 14:7,	140:22, 141:1,
95:17	89:15, 92:13, 92:16,	taught [2] - 58:22	16:18, 17:7, 19:18,	141:7, 141:12,
stipulating [1] - 104:14	92:22, 92:23, 92:24,	tax [2] - 47:9, 47:10	21:2, 21:23, 22:12,	141:22, 142:2,
stipulation [4] - 20:12,	92:25, 93:13, 93:14,	taxes [1] - 112:18	23:8, 23:18, 25:14,	142:11
21:6, 96:5, 97:20	94:16, 94:19, 94:22,	teach [2] - 35:16,	26:2, 26:7, 26:8,	theoretically [1] -
stop [1] - 110:14	95:2, 95:8, 101:1, 103:1, 107:24,	44:18	26:12, 27:5, 27:6,	137:21
storage [3] - 29:19,	108:15, 116:24,	teacher [1] - 37:4	27:11, 27:12, 27:14,	therefore [1] - 32:17
61:8, 110:15	124:5	teaches [1] - 59:1	27:16, 27:22, 29:13,	Thiele [20] - 36:24,
store [1] - 50:22	supplements [7] -	teaching [6] - 35:22,	29:17, 30:3, 32:5,	58:23, 59:14, 60:10,
straight [1] - 5:6	80:18, 83:6, 88:16,	35:25, 36:7, 53:24,	32:16, 33:3, 33:11,	61:11, 63:1, 78:15,
strength [1] - 47:25	93:20, 94:12,	60:7, 60:9	33:13, 33:24, 34:1,	98:14, 101:12,
stretch [1] - 141:23	107:14, 109:16	team [5] - 48:13,	34:3, 34:5, 34:10,	111:11, 112:14,
stricken [6] - 23:7,	supplied [1] - 70:18	50:10, 57:4, 59:24,	34:12, 34:14, 34:21,	116:23, 120:9,
23:8, 23:17, 27:4,	supplies [1] - 70:1	60:2	34:25, 35:3, 38:23,	125:6, 127:4, 127:10, 130:14
57:23, 97:17	suppose [4] - 116:12,	tech [1] - 51:1	40:14, 41:9, 42:17,	127:19, 130:14, 133:13, 135:7, 141:8
strictly [2] - 91:21,	130:18, 135:20,	technically [1] - 2:12	42:21, 43:8, 43:13,	133:13, 135:7, 141:8
91:22	135:22	technician [2] - 53:12,	43:15, 43:22, 43:23,	THIELE [1] - 63:1 thinking [1] - 25:23
strike [1] - 58:7	supposed [2] - 25:24,	119:8	43:25, 44:2, 44:4,	Third [1] - 1:15
stringent [1] - 52:10	87:1	technicians [4] -	46:1, 46:9, 46:10, 46:21, 47:14, 48:10,	third [6] - 4:12, 4:19,
structural [4] - 48:1,	SUPREME [1] - 1:1	35:17, 50:24, 53:20,	48:24, 49:6, 49:10, 48:24, 49:6, 49:10,	54:21, 93:2, 102:24,
48:7, 59:4, 127:25	Supreme [2] - 1:9,	59:6	48.24, 49.0, 49.10, 49:15, 50:18, 51:24,	119:10
structurally [1] - 76:18	1:12	technologies [1] -	52:25, 53:8, 54:11,	third-party [1] - 54:21
structure [3] - 47:24,	surely [1] - 128:24	65:13	56:10, 56:13, 56:18,	Thompson [1] - 29:5
59:3, 97:1	surface [1] - 117:23	tenths [1] - 41:25	57:22, 58:1, 58:3,	thousand [1] - 23:22
struggle [1] - 54:8	surgeon [1] - 123:19	TERM [1] - 1:2	58:7, 58:9, 58:10,	three [13] - 13:16,
student [3] - 36:10,	surprise [1] - 108:18	term [5] - 77:1,	58:11, 60:14, 61:21,	18:14, 37:22, 39:10,
36:18, 36:23	surprising [1] - 51:1	132:14, 137:14,	61:25, 62:4, 62:9,	41:24, 41:25, 52:15,
students [5] - 36:8,	survive [1] - 49:3	137:15, 138:2	62:12, 62:15, 62:23,	59:18, 64:21, 92:25,
36:13, 36:15, 37:4,	suspension [5] - 48:4,	terminology [1] -	63:1, 63:3, 63:22,	97:13, 102:23,
61:11	65:11, 87:5, 87:10,	132:9		. ,

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 17

120:23	total [42] - 21:17, 22:9,	trying [2] - 55:14,	131:24	68:18, 68:20, 68:25,
threshold [5] - 75:22,	22:14, 22:20, 23:15,	57:11	unsafe [1] - 138:17	69:5, 70:21, 70:23,
76:10, 94:1, 94:15,	28:12, 28:18, 28:22,	TT [2] - 125:2, 125:4	up [59] - 6:16, 7:12,	73:1, 73:13, 75:13,
134:6	29:1, 29:8, 44:22,	turn [2] - 126:5,	15:6, 15:11, 15:16,	75:14, 75:20, 76:14,
thresholds [1] - 94:2	51:14, 69:6, 69:14,	130:17	16:8, 17:5, 17:14,	77:15, 79:15, 80:7,
throughout [3] -	75:23, 75:24, 76:3,	TV [1] - 38:17	17:21, 18:21, 18:22,	80:12, 80:25, 81:5,
38:18, 50:7, 134:17	76:8, 76:14, 76:18,	twice [1] - 97:12	18:25, 19:2, 21:12,	81:16, 83:1, 86:19,
timecard [1] - 66:15	76:23, 77:3, 77:5,	two [34] - 15:10, 18:3,	21:17, 23:12, 36:4,	87:16, 87:22, 88:4,
timeline [1] - 106:4	77:12, 93:16, 93:21,	18:18, 18:24, 20:5,	36:11, 38:13, 45:23,	88:14, 88:21, 88:22,
timely [1] - 90:25	94:1, 94:11, 94:15,	20:14, 20:17, 20:21,	48:13, 48:15, 49:24,	90:1, 90:6, 90:7,
tire [1] - 117:24	107:14, 107:17,	21:8, 31:20, 39:21,	50:1, 50:5, 54:2,	90:22, 91:6, 91:8,
title [1] - 59:5	107:22, 107:25,	40:8, 41:23, 41:24,	54:4, 56:2, 56:5,	91:20, 91:21, 92:4,
TO [1] - 142:11	108:6, 108:14,	42:18, 51:5, 59:22,	57:4, 57:11, 59:23,	93:16, 93:21, 94:7,
today [7] - 2:21, 7:14,	108:25, 109:5,	61:16, 67:6, 84:7,	61:5, 64:15, 64:23,	94:21, 94:24, 95:9,
9:20, 24:18, 40:22,	109:16, 109:25,	84:9, 84:11, 84:12,	65:12, 65:18, 69:8,	100:12, 100:24,
83:13, 98:15	110:9, 113:7, 135:23	85:4, 85:10, 87:16,	69:10, 69:13, 71:1,	101:15, 101:20,
together [4] - 37:13,	totaled [2] - 28:18,	87:23, 87:25, 92:24,	74:1, 75:19, 76:2,	101:24, 102:2,
41:24, 65:20, 83:18	137:20	103:2, 109:12,	79:4, 96:2, 98:8,	103:6, 113:8, 117:12, 117:23,
tomorrow [2] -	totalling [1] - 29:16	131:2, 132:12	109:3, 112:6, 112:18, 119:14,	123:24, 125:1,
140:23, 142:6	totally [1] - 31:20 tow [7] - 18:2, 18:6,	type [16] - 40:1, 45:4,	125:23, 125:24,	125:11, 128:24,
Tomsky [8] - 28:4,	18:10, 18:13, 18:14,	45:5, 45:6, 53:3, 53:4, 55:9, 61:14,	125:25, 126:4,	135:15, 137:6,
29:10, 30:25, 31:18,	18:10, 18:13, 18:14,	70:12, 70:15, 74:8,	128:23, 139:6,	138:5, 138:14,
33:8, 56:22, 61:9, 126:7	toward [1] - 55:25	74:22, 79:18, 90:1,	139:8, 140:23	138:17
TOMSKY [85] - 1:16,	towards [3] - 42:11,	91:15, 116:10	upfront [1] - 59:21	vehicles [22] - 36:3,
2:7, 2:10, 2:18, 2:20,	55:23, 69:1	types [5] - 39:17,	upload [1] - 80:22	40:4, 40:5, 47:18,
3:9, 4:2, 4:10, 8:14,	towed [1] - 31:11	55:21, 72:9, 82:18,	upper [1] - 47:23	47:19, 47:20, 49:25,
12:6, 13:24, 14:4,	Towing [4] - 13:5,	82:20	upstairs [1] - 48:20	52:8, 55:19, 55:24,
16:19, 17:11, 17:23,	15:24, 17:18, 18:25		upward [10] - 100:17,	57:10, 65:19, 67:2,
	towing tot 19:2	U	100:21, 102:20,	67:3, 67:22, 72:9,
23:6, 23:16, 24:2,	towing [6] - 18:3,	U	100.21, 102.20,	
23:6, 23:16, 24:2, 26:10, 27:3, 27:20,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16,		103:21, 102:20,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18,
		ultimately [2] - 7:11,	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15
26:10, 27:3, 27:20,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18,	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacation [1] - 40:6	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacation [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] -	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacation [1] - 40:6	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacation [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] -	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacation [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 Vacation [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2	$\begin{tabular}{lllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	$75:12, 79:22, 82:18, \\91:5, 127:13, 127:15$ vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4	$\begin{tabular}{lllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	$75:12, 79:22, 82:18, \\91:5, 127:13, 127:15$ vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uninterested [1] - 54:21	$\begin{array}{c} 103:21, 104:1, \\ 105:3, 105:9, \\ 105:14, 105:17, \\ 107:6 \\ \textbf{upwards} [1] - 93:11 \\ \textbf{usable} [1] - 85:23 \\ \textbf{uses} [2] - 69:25, 131:6 \\ \hline \\ $	$75:12, 79:22, 82:18, \\91:5, 127:13, 127:15$ vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 80:5
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4 unitized [1] - 47:24 units [1] - 36:10	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4,	$75:12, 79:22, 82:18, \\91:5, 127:13, 127:15$ vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4 unitized [1] - 47:24 units [1] - 36:10 university [1] - 38:17	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 80:5
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19, 126:2, 131:23,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16, 125:6	ultimately $[2] - 7:11$, 110:21 unacceptable $[1] - 74:20$ under $[5] - 2:15$, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating $[1] - 107:10$ understating $[1] - 107:10$ understood $[3] - 27:14$, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten $[1] - 107:12$ uniform $[1] - 51:2$ uniform $[1] - 51:2$ uniterested $[1] - 54:21$ United $[1] - 39:4$ unitized $[1] - 47:24$ units $[1] - 36:10$ university $[1] - 38:17$ unless $[2] - 54:16$,	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15, 29:16, 31:16, 33:6,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 80:5
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19, 126:2, 131:23, 133:7, 135:17,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16, 125:6 TRUE [1] - 142:11	ultimately $[2] - 7:11$, 110:21 unacceptable $[1] - 74:20$ under $[5] - 2:15$, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating $[1] - 107:10$ understating $[1] - 107:10$ understood $[3] - 27:14$, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten $[1] - 107:12$ uniform $[1] - 51:2$ uniform $[1] - 51:2$ uniterested $[1] - 54:21$ United $[1] - 39:4$ unitized $[1] - 47:24$ units $[1] - 36:10$ university $[1] - 38:17$ unless $[2] - 54:16$, 76:9	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15, 29:16, 31:16, 33:6, 40:20, 42:10, 42:11,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 80:5 W walk [2] - 88:14, 88:15 walked [1] - 88:20
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19, 126:2, 131:23, 133:7, 135:17, 136:17, 137:25,	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16, 125:6 TRUE [1] - 142:11 truth [6] - 34:19,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4 unitized [1] - 47:24 units [1] - 36:10 university [1] - 38:17 unless [2] - 54:16, 76:9 unnecessary [2] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15, 29:16, 31:16, 33:6, 40:20, 42:10, 42:11, 42:19, 42:25, 43:16,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 80:5 W walk [2] - 88:14, 88:15 walked [1] - 88:20 walking [1] - 101:22
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19, 126:2, 131:23, 133:7, 135:17, 136:17, 137:25, 140:9	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16, 125:6 TRUE [1] - 142:11 truth [6] - 34:19, 34:20, 62:21, 62:22	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4 unitized [1] - 47:24 units [1] - 36:10 university [1] - 38:17 unless [2] - 54:16, 76:9 unnecessary [2] - 25:15, 41:16	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15, 29:16, 31:16, 33:6, 40:20, 42:10, 42:11, 42:19, 42:25, 43:16, 43:17, 43:18, 46:13,	$75:12, 79:22, 82:18, \\91:5, 127:13, 127:15$ vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 88:20 walk [2] - 88:14, 88:15 walked [1] - 88:20 walking [1] - 101:22 wants [5] - 45:21,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19, 126:2, 131:23, 133:7, 135:17, 136:17, 137:25, 140:9 took [2] - 44:20, 86:24	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16, 125:6 TRUE [1] - 142:11 truth [6] - 34:19, 34:20, 62:21, 62:22 try [11] - 22:4, 53:13,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4 unitized [1] - 47:24 units [1] - 36:10 university [1] - 38:17 unless [2] - 54:16, 76:9 unnecessary [2] - 25:15, 41:16 unplugging [1] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15, 29:16, 31:16, 33:6, 40:20, 42:10, 42:11, 42:19, 42:25, 43:16, 43:17, 43:18, 46:13, 46:25, 47:15, 47:22,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 88:20 walk [2] - 88:14, 88:15 walked [1] - 88:20 walking [1] - 101:22 wants [5] - 45:21, 54:21, 54:22,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19, 126:2, 131:23, 133:7, 135:17, 136:17, 137:25, 140:9 took [2] - 44:20, 86:24 tool [1] - 51:2	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16, 125:6 TRUE [1] - 142:11 truth [6] - 34:19, 34:20, 62:21, 62:22 try [11] - 22:4, 53:13, 53:22, 55:13, 65:12,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4 unitized [1] - 47:24 units [1] - 36:10 university [1] - 38:17 unless [2] - 54:16, 76:9 unnecessary [2] - 25:15, 41:16 unplugging [1] - 118:17	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15, 29:16, 31:16, 33:6, 40:20, 42:10, 42:11, 42:19, 42:25, 43:16, 43:17, 43:18, 46:13,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 88:23 Walk [2] - 88:14, 88:15 walked [1] - 88:20 walking [1] - 101:22 wants [5] - 45:21,
26:10, 27:3, 27:20, 29:11, 30:1, 32:4, 32:10, 33:2, 33:14, 33:16, 33:25, 34:8, 42:15, 42:20, 43:7, 46:20, 47:13, 48:9, 48:23, 49:5, 50:17, 51:22, 52:5, 52:24, 53:7, 54:10, 56:16, 56:20, 58:4, 60:13, 61:20, 61:23, 62:1, 62:6, 62:14, 63:4, 63:6, 63:20, 83:8, 84:17, 95:18, 95:21, 96:15, 97:19, 97:22, 98:3, 98:10, 102:13, 104:14, 106:20, 108:20, 109:8, 110:2, 110:18, 110:23, 114:9, 115:17, 123:11, 123:22, 125:19, 126:2, 131:23, 133:7, 135:17, 136:17, 137:25, 140:9 took [2] - 44:20, 86:24	20:11, 29:19, 45:16, 83:24, 96:9 tows [3] - 18:15, 18:19, 18:24 trained [1] - 44:20 training [12] - 37:5, 37:14, 38:17, 50:4, 50:6, 51:5, 52:7, 52:9, 59:7, 59:23, 61:12, 61:14 trainings [1] - 59:25 transcript [1] - 9:1 TRANSCRIPT [1] - 142:11 treatment [1] - 127:4 TRIAL [1] - 1:2 trial [3] - 26:5, 34:18, 62:20 triple [2] - 107:1, 107:2 trouble [1] - 73:24 true [2] - 124:16, 125:6 TRUE [1] - 142:11 truth [6] - 34:19, 34:20, 62:21, 62:22 try [11] - 22:4, 53:13,	ultimately [2] - 7:11, 110:21 unacceptable [1] - 74:20 under [5] - 2:15, 4:18, 57:19, 96:19, 112:8 underestimating [1] - 107:10 understating [1] - 107:10 understood [3] - 27:14, 60:11, 62:9 underwritten [1] - 107:12 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniform [1] - 51:2 uniterested [1] - 54:21 United [1] - 39:4 unitized [1] - 47:24 units [1] - 36:10 university [1] - 38:17 unless [2] - 54:16, 76:9 unnecessary [2] - 25:15, 41:16 unplugging [1] -	103:21, 104:1, 105:3, 105:9, 105:14, 105:17, 107:6 upwards [1] - 93:11 usable [1] - 85:23 uses [2] - 69:25, 131:6 V vacations [1] - 40:6 vacations [1] - 51:3 valuation [1] - 103:16 value [1] - 94:3 various [1] - 66:3 vehicle [106] - 5:1, 7:12, 7:18, 8:11, 9:2, 11:2, 11:12, 13:11, 18:6, 19:11, 19:24, 21:14, 21:19, 22:14, 22:19, 22:25, 23:4, 23:10, 28:13, 28:15, 29:16, 31:16, 33:6, 40:20, 42:10, 42:11, 42:19, 42:25, 43:16, 43:17, 43:18, 46:13, 46:25, 47:15, 47:22, 47:23, 48:1, 49:23,	75:12, 79:22, 82:18, 91:5, 127:13, 127:15 vendor [1] - 12:19 versa [1] - 69:1 versus [10] - 20:5, 31:22, 47:7, 53:4, 55:22, 58:16, 71:11, 72:7, 73:17, 114:7 vice [1] - 69:1 view [7] - 104:3, 122:23, 123:1, 123:3, 141:19 viewed [1] - 87:22 views [1] - 122:25 violate [1] - 129:4 visit [4] - 66:6, 98:23, 106:6, 106:10 visits [1] - 106:1 visual [1] - 88:20 walk [2] - 88:14, 88:15 walked [1] - 88:20 walking [1] - 101:22 wants [5] - 45:21, 54:21, 54:22, 135:15, 137:5

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 139

INDEX NO. 606797/2017 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 03/22/2019 18

<pre>warranty [4] - 12:16, 12:18, 45:10, 127:14 waste [3] - 50:2, 50:3 ways [1] - 32:19 week [4] - 37:6, 51:5, 66:2, 66:6 weeks [2] - 51:5, 103:2 welcome [3] - 2:21, 46:10, 133:7 welcomed [2] - 114:3, 115:15 wet [1] - 50:3 wheel [40] - 20:5, 21:8, 42:4, 42:13, 43:6, 43:11, 43:16, 43:21, 44:1, 44:5, 44:6, 44:7, 48:3, 48:4, 48:5, 84:16, 84:24, 85:6, 85:9, 85:13, 85:14, 85:15, 85:22, 85:23, 86:2, 86:5, 86:12, 86:16, 86:22, 87:8, 87:12, 87:18, 95:11, 96:6, 96:7, 117:15, 117:19, 119:11, 120:21 wheels [16] - 20:5, 20:14, 20:18, 20:21, 21:9, 41:22, 42:18, 84:7, 84:10, 84:11, 84:12, 84:21, 85:4, 85:5, 85:10, 87:17 whereas [2] - 20:14, 92:1 white [1] - 50:8 whole [3] - 25:22, 34:19, 62:21</pre>	120:7, 125:2, 126:25, 141:6 WITNESS [30] - 2:16, 26:7, 27:5, 27:11, 27:14, 29:17, 34:3, 34:21, 34:25, 43:13, 43:15, 43:23, 44:2, 46:10, 56:13, 58:9, 58:11, 62:23, 63:1, 74:2, 86:12, 95:23, 96:1, 106:11, 106:25, 107:4, 109:1, 110:14, 111:4, 119:3 witnesses [1] - 49:7 witnesses [1] - 49:7 witnesses [1] - 49:7 witnesses [1] - 2:12 word [2] - 132:12, 132:13 words [4] - 61:16, 101:25, 109:18, 134:24 worker [1] - 88:25 works [4] - 36:22, 66:13, 88:23, 118:16 worth [2] - 37:14, 137:18 wound [1] - 36:11 write [27] - 31:5, 40:9, 50:8, 66:3, 66:21, 68:18, 68:20, 72:21, 77:8, 79:6, 80:15, 84:21, 85:9, 85:14, 86:1, 86:25, 88:3, 88:22, 88:24, 95:2, 98:25, 99:6, 99:9, 99:14, 99:18, 99:23 writes [4] - 128:23, 129:11, 129:12, 132:17	63:24, 64:5, 64:14, 66:1, 90:25, 100:2, 100:3, 100:4, 134:8, 135:5 yesterday [1] - 6:14 YORK [1] - 1:1 York [18] - 1:10, 1:15, 1:19, 13:10, 14:13, 14:16, 24:13, 35:2, 38:4, 38:9, 38:11, 38:14, 52:4, 57:19, 60:22, 63:2, 75:22 yourself [2] - 26:4, 113:23 YY [1] - 141:3
44:6, 44:7, 48:3,	132:13	
48:4, 48:5, 84:16,	words [4] - 61:16,	
84:24, 85:6, 85:9,		
	worth [2] - 37:14,	
	writes [4] - 128:23,	
34:19, 62:21 wide [3] - 55:24, 59:1,	132:17 writing [1] - 99:16	
66:18	written [8] - 24:22,	
wise [1] - 51:17	25:1, 25:11, 25:17,	
wishes [1] - 137:8	67:4, 68:14, 84:16,	
withdrawn [13] - 9:13,	100:24	
16:25, 19:6, 25:4, 30:20, 30:24, 33:18	wrote [6] - 20:15, 31:6, 74:19, 85:6,	
30:20, 30:24, 33:18, 76:5, 76:21, 91:2,	89:3, 89:15	
97:8, 120:13, 131:19		
witness [36] - 2:5,	Y	
2:11, 8:2, 8:3, 12:6,	yard [2] - 70:22, 70:24	
12:8, 17:23, 17:25, 24:3, 24:6, 34:6,	yards [1] - 75:11	
38:24, 40:11, 40:17,	year [12] - 36:10, 38:8,	
41:6, 41:11, 49:9,	38:18, 50:7, 52:16,	
49:10, 62:13, 73:25,	59:21, 66:19, 88:1,	
83:8, 83:10, 84:17,	120:2, 120:4, 134:16, 134:17	
84:19, 95:20, 96:13,	134:16, 134:17 yearly [1] - 36:8	
104:18, 111:19, 112:13, 113:20,	years [16] - 48:16,	
116:21, 119:22,	51:11, 51:13, 63:16,	
. ,		